A STUDY OF BURMESE HISTORY AND LANGUAGE WITHIN THE SOUTHWESTERN SILK ROAD REGIONAL SPHERE

A Thesis

Presented to the Faculty of the Graduate School

of Cornell University

In Partial Fulfillment of the Requirements for the Degree of

Master of Arts

by

Qiao Dai

May 2019

ABSTRACT

This thesis is about interstate cultural interactions along the Southwestern Silk Road regional sphere. My exploration incorporates two sections from the perspective of history and linguistics. Chapter 1 examines the historical sources regarding music performances sent from the Pyu kingdom in modern-day Myanmar to the Chinese Tang court around the end of the 8th century and the beginning of the 9th century. I argue that the religious interactions of this region along the Southwestern Silk Road are overshadowed by the political situation on the border between Tang China, Nanzhao and a kingdom in Burma. Chapter 2 investigates the selection between causative and non-causative verbs together with the suffixes within the context of *The Glass Palace Chronicle*. I consider the influence of Pali language so that we can see the selection of causative and non-causative verbs in Sino-Tibetan language interacts with an Indo-European language through the religious influence.

BIOGRAPHICAL SKETCH

Qiao Dai was born in Beijing, China in January of 1995. After graduating from Beijing National Day School, she attended Peking University from September 2013 to July 2017. She was first a student in the Burmese major and then she joined a combined major in World History and Foreign languages in her sophomore year. After receiving her bachelor's degree, she began her master's study at Cornell University in the Department of Asian Studies in August of 2017. After graduation, she will begin her Ph.D. study in August 2019 in the Department of South and Southeast Asian Studies at the University of California, Berkeley.

For tomorrow

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

First of all, I would like to express sincere gratitude to my advisor Professor Eric Tagliacozzo, who always encourages me during my study at Cornell. Thank you so much for your guidance through my master's research. Your two inspiring classes on Southeast Asian history were one of the motivations that drove me to finish this thesis. I am also very grateful to my second committee member Professor John Whitman. Thank you so much for all the helpful suggestions and for being patient with me as a beginner in linguistics. Without your advice, I wouldn't be able to encounter the thought-provoking knowledge in a new field. I would also like to thank my Burmese teacher Yu Yu Khaing who offered me great help in reading the sources.

I really appreciate all the professors whom I have taken classes with and who gave me advice at Cornell. The Department of Asian Studies and the Graduate School at Cornell provided me an active learning environment and an opportunity to do interdisciplinary study.

My deepest thanks to my parents and my boyfriend, your trust and love support me to keep challenging myself.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

LIST OF FIGURES

LIST OF TABLES

INTRODUCTION

This thesis is about interstate cultural interactions within the political, religious, and economic environment along the Southwestern Silk Road regional sphere. The reason that I focus on this region is that first, I plan to situate Burma in the Sino-Tibetan regional sphere by analyzing official historical sources in literary Chinese and Burmese. Discussing the history of Burma in a broader geographical connection within this region will extend our exploration beyond the boundaries of nation states. This extension is reflected in two layers, including both the pre-modern category of political entities and the modern concept of nations. Instead of relying on the territorial and political connections between modern nation states and pre-modern political entities, I plan to use the scope of entities as a parameter to facilitate the illustrations of the broad cross-cultural interactions. Furthermore, using the scope of pre-modern political entities as a parameter also helps us to distinguish what is local and foreign respectively with regard to religion and language. However, this differentiation does not aim to restrict the discussion by attributing each cultural element to each political entity. In contrast, this parameter will enable us to encompass all the cultural characteristics in this region through the process of the interchange of information. Therefore, the investigation in this chapter between local culture and foreign culture along the Southwestern Silk Road will form the discussion from the historical scope by bringing in those kingdoms that once existed, such as Nanzhao. Second, this thesis focuses on portraying a dynamic cultural map by considering this region as a whole. Even though the political connections reflect that in different

periods one may have had political superiority over others within this region, it is inappropriate to further infer that one also has had cultural superiority over other states as well. What I intend to scrutinize is how we should take advantage of the extant sources without prejudice based on the framework of nation states. One political entity might have had a significant influence on other places, but this doesn't mean that other entities didn't play a crucial role in their interactions and contribute to the heritage preserved in historical sources. The cultural heritage of smaller entities might be implicit and can only be seen in the process of interactions with the stronger states. Therefore, the dynamic cultural map I plan to depict in this thesis consists of the religious and language interactions underneath the political connections. Instead of relying on one side, my analysis of this regional sphere is always concerned with the interdependent environment within it.

My exploration incorporates two sections from the perspective of history and linguistics. My approach to combining history and linguistics in this thesis has advantages as follows. First, the examination of language within the historical sources will offer us a sensuous access to the past so that we can read between the lines and beyond the contents of historical records, just as Edward Schafer endeavored to recover medieval Chinese so that he could get closer to the world of the Tang dynasty in *The Vermilion Bird.*[1] Second, the historical change in a language reflects a vivid process of cultural assimilations and interactions, which will in return provide more

[1] Schafer, Edward H, *The Vermilion Bird: T'ang Images of the South*, Berkeley: University of California Press, 1967.

evidence to open up the discussion of historical linguistics.[2] Third, the study of language plays an important role in finding the influence of foreign words and thus offers us a lens to unearth the implicit historical connections in a region. For instance, G. H. Luce focuses on pre-Pagan Burma by combining a study of languages in the original inscriptions and a historical introduction regarding different ethnic groups in order to locate Burma in the map of world history using all kinds of sources.[3] Fourth, the above three advantages will further lead us to discover the link between sources in different languages and different fields.

In chapter 1, I will examine the historical sources regarding music performances sent from the Pyu kingdom in modern-day Myanmar to the Chinese Tang court around the end of the 8th century and the beginning of the 9th century. In order to fully reveal the limitations that the official historical sources might have, I will contextualize these performances in the intricate political connections of the three kingdoms within the Sino-Tibetan region. Chapter 1 of this thesis argues that the religious interactions of this region along the Southwestern Silk Road are overshadowed by the political situation on the border between Tang China (618-907), Nanzhao (738-937) (which was located in the current province of Yunnan in China) and a kingdom in Burma. Thus, the interpretations in the historical sources of the interactions within this region are questionable. At the end of chapter 1, I will consider the role of local religions and further propose the possibility of overcoming the

[2] Phan, John, "Lacquered Words: The Evolution of Vietnamese Under Sinitic Influences from the 1st Century BCE through the 17th Century CE," PhD Thesis, Cornell University, 2013.
[3] Luce, G. H, *Phases of Pre-Pagán Burma: Languages and History*, Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1985.

limitation of official sources with assistance from anthropological evidence of indigenous culture. In chapter 2, I will explore the causative and non-causative verb pairs in Burmese with the two suffixes that nominalize them and make them causative. The objective of this chapter is to investigate the selection between causative and non-causative verbs together with the suffixes within the context of *The Glass Palace Chronicle* (*Hmannan Yazawindawgyi,* compiled between 1829-1832). I will also consider the influence of Pali language and its social context that is represented in the Burmese causative suffix so that we can see the selection of causative and non-causative verbs in Sino-Tibetan language interacts with an Indo-European language through the religious influence.

The two chapters in this thesis connect to each other in two ways. First, both of them focus on the critical analysis of official historical sources. In chapter 1, I will use a number of literary Chinese sources, including selections in the *New Tang History* (新唐書 *Xin Tangshu*), *Old Tang History*(舊唐書 *Jiu Tangshu*), *The Book of Barbarians* (蠻書 *Manshu*), *The Unofficial History of Nanzhao* (南詔野史 *Nanzhao Yeshi*) and the *Complete Poems of the Tang* (全唐詩 *Quan Tangshi*). The official Chinese sources provide useful information in two aspects. First, a specific event in the sources presents us an intersection between Tang China (618-907), Nanzhao (738-937) (which was located in the current province of Yunnan in China) and a kingdom in Burma: Nanzhao's introduction of Buddhist music from Pyu to the Tang can reflect China's political influence on Nanzhao and Pyu the same way a straw shows which way the wind blows. Second, with the Chinese sources in chapter 1 and the language in official Burmese source *The Glass Palace Chronicle* in chapter 2, a combination of

them enables us to further examine the understanding of the religious influence on culture and language as an implicit process under the political paradigm in historical discourses. The exploration of the causative and non-causative pairs with two suffixes within the background of Buddhist literary tradition in chapter 2 will contribute to our understanding of historical discourses beyond what the narratives tried to convey. We can thus see how the selection of Burmese verbs forms the language in both a historical literature genre and a national history in the colonial period. The second connection between the two chapters is that they both introduce the cultural influence outside Burma. By locating Burma within the Sino-Tibetan regional sphere and proposing its further connection with India, the analysis in this chapter will be more dynamic and intricate since the issues can be viewed from the perspective of cross-border interaction and assimilation. Therefore, the acculturation of Buddhism not only is reflected in the spread of religion and the interaction between foreign religion and indigenous religion but also the legacy of Buddhist language elements in historical discourses.

This thesis covers historical sources that are compiled in different time periods, including the literary Chinese sources from the 9th century to the 11th century, the Burmese chronicle from the colonial period between 1829-1832, and contemporary secondary sources. It is crucial to elucidate the advantages and disadvantages of using *The Glass Palace Chronicle* as one of the main sources together with others that are much earlier than it. First, the *Chronicle* is representative as historical literature and as a heritage of the compilation of Burmese literati who were trained under the tradition of monastic education and with the commission of the court. According to Michael W.

Charney, these literati are important since they "established the state historical narrative that would remain the standard reference for the colonial history to the present."[4] Even though this chronicle was compiled in the colonial period, it inherited the mindset from the past that was built by the Konbaung dynasty (1752-1885) literati.[5] Second, it includes the content of both Buddhism and regional histories in the pre-Pagan period, which are helpful to the investigation of indigenous religion in this thesis. For the post-Pagan period, *The Glass Palace Chronicle* incorporates previous work like U Kala's *Great Chronicle*. However, it is special that when it comes to the pre-Pagan and Pagan period, the committee "made detailed references to the sources of some critical data, [and] disagreement between traditions."[6] Third, the language in the *Chronicle* represents the official standard and thus it provides a valuable reference when we explore from the perspective of linguistics on the verbs and relative suffixes the committee chose. In contrast, it is also noticeable that there are two main limitations of the *Chronicle*. First, in order to legitimate the succession of the Konbaung dynasty in Burmese history, the discourses in the *Chronicle* create the new ethnic emphasis that the Burmans have the right to rule over other groups because they were the descendants of Indians, interweaving traditional myth and a new one concerning the Indian racial origin of Burman people.[7] Second, the chronicle emphasizes the religious superiority of the court and the royal family, thus other local

[4] Charney, Michael W, *Powerful Learning: Buddhist Literati and the Throne in Burma's Last Dynasty, 1752-1885*, Ann Arbor: Centers for South and Southeast Asian Studies, University of Michigan, 2006, 267.
[5] Ibid, 268.
[6] Ibid, 116.
[7] Ibid, 109,143.

religious histories might have been hidden in the narrative.[8] Therefore, it is necessary to scrutinize the selection and compilation process of these historical sources so that we can find the information hidden behind the official narrative.

The two chapters work as a synthesis since both of them focus on the historical narratives. I intend to dig out the cultural history behind the official historical narratives in three ways. First, as is mentioned above, it is necessary for us to situate Burmese religions in a broader scope and reconsider them. This scope contains not only the spread of Buddhism and the acculturation of Buddhism with indigenous animism or shamanism, but also the religious assimilation and interaction across countries or regions under the network of trade or the tributary system. A broader scope requires us to enlarge the geographical vision of this issue, and that is why I extend the perspective from merely Burma to another two political entities, including the Nanzhao kingdom and the Tang Dynasty of China. Second, instead of relying merely on historical narratives of elites and literati, I will bring the political situations into careful consideration. After a critical analysis of the intricate interstate relationship between the three kingdoms, we will be able to figure out which part of the interpretations in historical sources might be overshadowed by political influence and thus scrutinize the cultural interactions behind politics. Third, I will apply several disciplinary parameters in my thesis. With the support of historical inscriptions, archeological discoveries, anthropological work, and linguistics approach, we will view the historical narratives in a more comprehensive standpoint. Based on these

[8] Ibid, 145.

three ways, I plan to extend the study of Burma into a broader geographical scope, an interdependent political environment, and an interdisciplinary research methodology.

CHAPTER 1

RELIGIOUS INTERACTIONS BETWEEN TANG CHINA, NANZHAO AND MEDIEVAL BURMA

This chapter focuses on the interpretation of religious interactions in official historical records between three kingdoms along the Southwestern Silk Road: the Tang Dynasty of China (618-907), the Nanzhao kingdom (南詔 738-937) (which was located in the current province of Yunnan in China), and the Pyu kingdom of Burma (驃國 *piaoguo*; around 200 BC-around 1050 AD). In the second section of this chapter, using three religious music performances by the Pyu kingdom at the Tang court, I will make two arguments regarding these interactions: first, the Tang literati's interpretations of the Pyu performances took advantage of the event in order to express their political ideals, as we can see from Tang poems analyzed below. Second, despite this, from the trade networks on the Southwestern Silk Road and the influence of the performances on local Chinese music, we can uncover the religious contacts along this route underneath the political contexts surrounding these events. By moving past the literati and officials' narratives, we can thus enrich our understandings of transnational religious interactions along the Southwestern Silk Road. Then in the third section, I will discuss the interstate relationship between Tang and Nanzhao in order to reveal how the political situation might had influenced the interpretation of Nanzhao religion in historical discourses and the further analyze the limitation of both the official literary Chinese and Burmese sources. I turn to propose a parallel between local

religion in Nanzhao and Burma so that this comparison can contribute a new perspective to understand cultural history together with official narratives.

The Southwestern Silk Road has been a subject of a number of studies in both English and Chinese. Yang Bin locates this route in the Eurasian context and discusses how Yunnan was served as a connection between ancient China, Southeast Asia, and India.[9] Fang Guoyu further emphasizes the trade and military transactions along this road from the Han Dynasty (206 B.C. - 220 A.D.) to the Yuan Dynasty (1279-1368 A.D.) using literary Chinese sources, arguing that the importance of the Southwestern frontier history has been underestimated. Other works, such as Janet Stargardt's study on religious transmission along the Southwestern Silk Road, focus on the connection between medieval Burma and India, revealing that Indian religion had a large influence on Pyu cities. George Coedès also reveals this influence by discussing how the "northern India cultural penetration" was based on the "geographical position" of Pyu.[10] Stargardt uses the Golden Pali Texts stored in Pyu relic chambers as well as how the location of Buddhist monuments combined with local burials to argue that Buddhist culture from India not only had an influence on Pyu's religion, but also witnessed a process of acculturation with local traditions.[11] These works facilitate an understanding of the connections between China, Southeast Asia, and India along the

[9] Yang, Bin, *Between Winds and Clouds: The Making of Yunnan (Second Century BCE to Twentieth Century CE)*, New York: Columbia University Press, 2009.
Fang, Guoyu(方國瑜) and Chaomin Lin (林超民), *Fang Guoyu Wen Ji* 方國瑜文集 [The Collected Works of Fang Guoyu], Kunming: Yunnan jiao yu chu ban she, 2001.
[10] Cœdès, George, *The Indianized States of Southeast Asia*, Honolulu: East-West Center Press, 1968, 63-64. He also mentions later on page 77 that "the Buddhist images found here are in the late Gupta style", which indicates that Buddhism in Srikshetra was a "Theravada sect which probably came originally from Magadha."
[11] Stargardt, Janice, *Tracing Thought through Things: The Oldest Pali Texts and the Early Buddhist Archaeology of India and Burma,* Amsterdam: Royal Netherlands Academy of Arts and Sciences, 2000.

Southwestern Silk Road. However, these works have left the religious interactions between China, Nanzhao, and Pyu during the medieval period relatively unexamined. The religious interactions between these three states can further provide us a new possibility to view religion in Tang history and understand its political connections. This chapter hopes to remedy this gap by analyzing three Pyu music performances at the Tang court from around 799 AD-801AD, the Tang-Nanzhao relationship, and local religion in both historical sources and nowadays in Yunnan and Burma, using these as lenses to view the acculturation of Buddhism in medieval China, Nanzhao and Burma.

This chapter primarily analyzes the role that religion played in the relationship between these three political entities in the late Tang. In doing so, this chapter will explore the relationship between politics and religion in the late Tang by excavating the religious interactions behind the Tang literati and officials' interpretations of the performance and religion in Nanzhao and Pyu. This chapter will take advantage of Burmese, Chinese, and other secondary sources to argue that the religious interactions present in the performances are overshadowed by political concerns, as well as the international relationships between the Tang, Nanzhao, and the Pyu kingdom. This chapter will use Literary Chinese sources, including historical records concerning Nanzhao and Tang that relate also to Burma. These will include selections of the New Tang History (新唐書 *Xin Tangshu*), *Old Book of Tang* (舊唐書 *Jiu Tangshu*), *The Book of Barbarians* (蠻書 *Manshu*), *The Unofficial History of Nanzhao* (南詔野史 *Nanzhao Yeshi*) and the *Complete Poems of the Tang* (全唐詩 *Quan Tangshi*). From these sources, we can locate how religion moved within Chinese trade networks between the Tang court, Nanzhao, and Burma. From Tang poetry about the Pyu

performance, we can see Chinese literati's attitudes toward religion during this time. Additionally, these sources will reveal the religious policy in Tang China, including the Tang court's attitude toward Buddhism, Daoism, and other local religions. Furthermore, these sources provide us a lens to understand how trade networks hosted cultural as well as economic exchange. Finally, I will also use Burmese sources such as the myths in *The Glass Palace Chronicle* (*Hmannan Yazawin*) to further illustrate how official interpretations regarding Pyu and Nanzhao can be explored comparatively.

The Pyu performances and their interpretations

In this section, I will unfold the religious interactions between Burma, Nanzhao and Tang China from the starting point of Pyu music performances during the reign of Emperor Dezong of Tang (唐德宗 r. 779-805). This section will focus on how the political decline of the late Tang had an influence on how literati, officials and emperors viewed religion, and how these attitudes were reflected in the historical records. These actors' attitudes, as well as the political contexts that they were responding to, will offer further information for us to examine how religion became subordinate to the historical narrative of politics.

"The dancers' shifts with the ornate pearl tassel are like the shining stars, the flourishing garlands on their necks move like dancing dragons and snakes."[12] This is one line of the poem written by Bai Juyi (白居易 772-846), titled "Music from Pyu" (

[12] Wang, Qixing (王启兴), *Jiao Bian Quan Tang Shi* 校編全唐詩 [The Edited Complete Poems of the Tang], Wuhan: Hubei ren min chu ban she, 2001, volume 426.

驃國樂 *Piaoguo Yue*). Some scholars point to the Pyu performance as demonstrating the transnational cultural and political exchange between Pyu and the Tang. They also note that the Pyu performance came to the Tang through the introduction of Nanzhao.[13] It is undeniable that Pyu, Nanzhao, and the Tang were all involved in this event, and it is likely that the Pyu musical group and the embassy from Nanzhao undertook this journey in order to develop a closer relationship with the Tang. However, other lines of Bai's poem reveal his real goal of writing: to offer his advice to Dezong. "There is an elderly farmer who is taking a rest from work; he guesses the emperor's intention and talks to himself. I heard that the emperor is an intelligent and wise decision maker, and he cares about the people and hopes to make the country a peaceful place. It would be better to focus on people nearby instead of caring about people far away from you. Peace and tranquility derive from practical actions but not from beautiful music."[14] Bai wrote this poem in a satirical tone in order to draw the emperor's attention away from foreign envoys and back to local people. He expresses his concern for lay people under the Tang reign instead of enjoying and praising the exotic performance. In Bai's eyes, Dezong was indifferent to the problems that the Empire was facing, indulging instead in songs and dances from distant places.

Bai's implicit argument was based on two aspects of the political context during Dezong's reign. First, Dezong witnessed the An Lushan Rebellion (755-763)

[13] He Xinhua (何新華), "*Tang Dai Miandian Xianyue Yanjiu* 唐代緬甸獻樂研究 [The Research on Burmese music performance in the Tang Dynasty]," 東南亞研究 (*Journal of Southeast Asian Studies*) no. 3 (2013): 103-106.
[14] Wang, *Jiao Bian Quan Tang Shi,* volume 426.

when he was very young.[15] After seeing the decline of the Tang Dynasty firsthand, he reduced entertainment in the court in order to support military expenditures to suppress the rebellion. However, when he got old, Dezong tried to maintain the political image of the Tang dynasty by accepting envoys from foreign countries again. We can thus see a contrast between the scene that Bai Juyi constructs in his poem and Dezong's early sumptuary policies. Shortly after he ascended the throne, Dezong dismissed three hundred actors from the royal operatic organization and ordered the Tang officials to return tributary items that were made of gold and silver. He also forced the royal circus to free thirty-two elephants.[16] However, during the later period of his reign, the Old Tang History (*Jiu Tangshu* 舊唐書) describes Dezong as an emperor who trusted treacherous and wicked officials, spending huge amounts of funds on weakening the power of military governors.[17] Bai's poem reflects the literati's dissatisfaction towards this contradiction during Dezong's early reign and his indulgence in his twilight years.

Second, Bai Juyi's interpretation of the Pyu music performance in his poem, in fact, represents the political ideal of the late Tang literati. Asking for the ruler to focus on current affairs throughout the country, Bai represents a group of Confucianists who supported a literary movement called New Yue-fu (新樂府 *Xin yuefu*) a movement to

[15] Ouyang, Xiu (歐陽修), and Yongnian Huang (黃永年), *Xin Tang Shu* 新唐書 [The New Tang History], Shanghai: Han yu da ci dian chu ban she, 2004, *liezhuan* [Biographical Sketches of Emperors] no. 7.
[16] Ibid.
[17] Liu, Xu (劉昫), *Jiu Tang Shu* 舊唐書 [The Old Tang History], Beijing: Zhonghua shu ju, 1975, *liezhuan* no 12.

go back to a more realistic style of poetry.[18] Advocates of this movement emphasized poets' responsibilities to investigate current political affairs. Bai's poetic interpretation of the Pyu performances focused on the interests of the regular people, using the image of the elderly farmer to argue for the improvement of the empire's political institutions.

However, what Bai Juyi ignored in his treatment of the performance was how it revealed the religious interactions between China, Pyu and Nanzhao. Bai used the Burmese instruments and costumes as symbols of the emperor's frivolity, arguing for a Confucian ideal for the Tang Empire. Bai's political ideal overshadowed the religious elements of the performance, interpreting religion within a paradigm of politics. This is puzzling: Bai, who was a Buddhist devotee who supported the Confucian ideals, considered Buddhism and Daoism as supplements for Confucianism. However, in his poem he did not even mention the Theravada Buddhist elements of the Pyu performance, focusing instead on its political implications in the late Tang. Bai's poem represents only one of the voices regarding the event of Pyu music performance. Another poem regarding this performance can be found in the work of Yuan Zhen (元稹 779-831), which complained of the Pyu performance as boring and meaningless.[19] It is possible that the literati were more sensitive to the shift of the political situation in the late Tang after the An Lushan Rebellion, inspiring them to write literary works that addressed social problems. However, if we reconsider this Pyu performance within a broader geographical scope, the reason behind the literati's

[18] Mark Edward Lewis, *China's Cosmopolitan Empire: The Tang Dynasty*, Cambridge, Mass.: Belknap Press of Harvard University Press, 2009, 241-271.
[19] Wang, *Jiao Bian Quan Tang Shi*, volume 426.

political interpretation of this religious interaction becomes clearer. The literati were in fact considering the internal social problems in the Tang that existed under the potential for conflict between the Tang and its neighbor Tibet.

This Pyu music performance was only one of the three missions from Pyu to the Tang court. The first, in 799, was under the auspices of Nanzhao Kingdom, when the king of Nanzhao contacted the Tang governor of Xichuan (nowadays western Sichuan province) and requested to send music performances from the Pyu kingdom to the Tang court. The second was in 801 when the king of Pyu sent his younger brother and his son to lead their music to the Tang court. *The New Tang History* comments that the Pyu musical instruments from this second visit were too different from Chinese instruments used in Tang rites, and thus were not worth recording. The last mention of Pyu in the Tang sources is the visit by the king of Pyu in person in 802. There is a recording of the performance that he presented during that time, which interestingly includes Buddhist lyrics.[20]

The three performances above represent the three stages of the relationship between Pyu and the Tang Dynasty. This process not only reveals that Pyu attempted to become free from Nanzhao with the help of the Tang, but also shows that Pyu was gradually considered by the Tang court as a separate political and religious entity during this time. In the beginning, Tang officials recorded the Pyu performance together as a part of Nanzhao's tributary embassy. The name of this performance was “Nanzhao’s honor to dedicate music to the Tang Sage" (南詔奉聖樂 *Nanzhao*

[20] The Pyu performance is mentioned 3 times in total in *The New Tang History*, and *Taiping Yu Lan* 太平御覽 [Taiping Imperial Encyclopaedia] respectively.

Fengsheng Yue)."[21] This first embassy aimed to show the royalty of the Nanzhao kingdom to the Tang Dynasty; thus during the first visit, the Pyu musicians did not have the chance to present their own religion and culture. In this first visit as well, the political factor of Tibet was considered as prior to the religious and cultural interactions embodied in the musical performance. Dezong's faction in the court was trying to build an alliance with Nanzhao in order to resist the Tibetan regime (吐蕃 *Tufan*; 629-877), which had been a considerable threat on the Southwestern frontiers of China.[22] Since Pyu was within Nanzhao's sphere of influence, the Pyu musicians were enlisted to make the journey to China in order to strengthen the connection between Nanzhao and its surrounding region and the Tang court in order to discourage the Tibetans from territorial conquest. As a result, the historical record showed that Nanzhao played the most important role in the first embassy to the Tang court and that Pyu was included only as part of the performance.

However, after the second and third performances, Tang historical records included all the names and the topics of the twelve songs from Pyu.[23] This shows that by the time of the second and third performances, Nanzhao's political control over Pyu had likely subsided. The Tang court began to reconsider Pyu's culture and religion only after it had politically separated itself from the control of Nanzhao, and when Pyu had sent an independent diplomatic mission to China. Tang literati's interpretations and understandings of Pyu religion were thus based on the order of

[21] "Conviviality (宴樂)" in Li, Fang (李昉), *Tai Ping Yu Lan* 太平御覽 [Taiping Imperial Encyclopaedia], Shanghai: Shang wu yin shu guan, 1935.
[22] Ouyang, *The New Tang History*, *liezhuan* 147.
[23] Wang, Pu (王溥), *Tang Hui Yao* 唐会要 [Tang Compendium of Government and Social Institutions], Shanghai: Shang wu yin shu guan, 1936, volume 33.

Tang political institutions and those of their neighbors. This reveals that for Tang literati, religion was subordinate to the political context in which it appeared.

Further evidence of this trend can be found in the *Readings of the Taiping Era* (太平御覽 *Taiping Yulan*). It comments that the Pyu music must have been Buddhist because Pyu was geographically close to India (天竺 *Tianzhu*).[24] These comments and explanations tried to relocate Pyu within Chinese conceptions of the world. When the Pyu musical group came to the Tang court together with Nanzhao, Pyu was simply understood as one of the neighbors of Nanzhao. However, after Pyu separated itself from the sphere of influence of Nanzhao, Chinese historians began to view Pyu religion as a product of transmission from India. The Tang court's explanation of Pyu's geographical location finally became an interaction between two cultural circles: India and China. This dichotomy shows that official attitudes toward Pyu religion in the late Tang were driven by geopolitics. In reality, the process of religious assimilation remained intricate, and Nanzhao, India and local religion all had an influence on Pyu religious institutions.[25] This intricacy was lost in the eyes of Tang court officials however, who could only see Pyu through a political lens.

Although Tang literati and officials considered Pyu religion as subordinate to its geopolitical location, the Pyu performances still had an influence on Chinese society. Evidence shows that the Pyu song was recorded and spread broadly as one of the names of the tunes to which poems in the late Tang and Song Dynasty were

[24] "Foreign music (四夷樂)" in Li, Fang (李昉), *Tai Ping Yu Lan* 太平御覽 [Taiping Imperial Encyclopaedia], Shanghai: Shang wu yin shu guan, 1935.
[25] Nalanda-Sriwijaya Centre, and Early Myanmar and its Global Connections, eds. John N. Miksic, Geok Yian Goh, and Michael Aung-Thwin, *Bagan and the World: Early Myanmar and Its Global Connections*, Singapore: ISEAS, 2018, 198-219.

composed. The name of that tune is "*Pusa Man*" (菩薩蠻), which means "music about the Bodhisattva that was played by one of the southern ethnic groups."[26] According to research on Tang poetry in the Republic of China by Yang Xianyi, the costumes of the music performance for *Pusa Man* were the same as the ones in Pyu's music performance.[27] The melody from Pyu was preserved in the Tang court and then spread by courtesans at feasts. The preservation of this melody offers a glimpse into the abundant religious interactions of the Tang dynasty, and it reveals processes of cultural assimilation during this period. Because of the political bias of the sources outlined above, this type of assimilation cannot ordinarily be seen in the official records. This should motivate us to further scrutinize the interpretation of the cultural interactions between Pyu, Tang and Nanzhao as they appear in the sources, and to rethink the way we ourselves interpret historical discourse on foreign religion.

Furthermore, these three performances allow us to compare the transmission of religion through the Northern Silk Road, the Maritime Silk Road, and the Southwestern Silk Road.[28] The Southwestern Silk Road was established during the

---

[26] Liu Zhenqian (刘振乾), "*Pusaman Dui Wu Kao* 菩萨蛮队舞考 [An Investigation of *Pusaman* Dance Groups]," *Journal of Nanhua University* (南华大学学报)*: Page of Social science*(社会科学版) 13, no. 2 (2012): 107-110;
Xiao Zhengwei (肖正伟), "*Piao Guo Yue Yu Pu Sa Man*《骠国乐》与《菩萨蛮》考释 [An Interpretation of "The Music from Pyu" and "Pusaman"]," *Min Zu Yin Yue* (民族音乐) no. 1 (2009): 15-16.

[27] Yang, Xianyi (楊憲益), *Ling Mo Xin Jian* 零墨新箋 [Meaningless Ink on New Bamboo], Beijing: Beijing zhong xian tuo fang ke ji fa zhan you xian gong si, 2012.

[28] The Northern Silk Road in northern China originated in Xi'an (西安) and extended north to reach Persia and Rome. It was the pathway of trade and cultural interactions between China and the West. [For more on the Northern Silk Road, see Valerie Hansen, *The Silk Road: A New History with Documents*, (New York: Oxford University Press, 2017). The Maritime Silk Road connects China to Southeast Asia, the Indonesian archipelago, the Indian subcontinent, the Arabian Peninsula, and then all the way to Egypt and Europe. As noted in the introduction, the southwestern route connects Sichuan, Yunnan, Burma and Bangladesh.

Han Dynasty (206 BC. - 220 AD.) as both a political and trade pathway to northern India.[29] Although it is less famous than the other two routes, as Stargardt and Yang illustrate, the importance of the Southwestern Silk Road cannot be underestimated. Traditionally, the northern route has been considered as the most crucial for the movement of Buddhism into China. However, scholars have found evidence to prove that the southwestern route in fact contributed to the earliest transmission of Buddhism as well.[30] New archaeological evidence shows that some of the styles of Buddhist statues in Sichuan province are similar to early-stage Buddhist statues in Northern India.[31] This supports the argument that the Southwestern Silk Road was crucial for the movement of religion from India to Southern China, and that the Buddhism that spread through this route did not come later than that which came through the northern route. Scholars may have underestimated the Southwestern Silk Road because of the limited number of sources and northern and the maritime route linked more countries and had significant political influence on international relationships. However, as I have shown in this essay, the transmission of religion does not always correspond with political trends.

More evidence of this can be seen in sources regarding the Nanzhao kingdom. Nanzhao had a close trade relationship with Pyu and other kingdoms in modern-day Burma. As a trade center, Nanzhao collected all products from the entire local region and maintained a tributary relationship with Tang China. For instance, Dezong

[29] Yang, *The Making of Yunnan*.
[30] Wu, Jialun (伍加伦), and Yuxiang Jiang (江玉祥), *Gu Dai Xi Nan Si Chou Zhi Lu Yan Jiu* (古代西南絲綢之路研究) [Research on the Ancient Southwestern Silk Road], Chengdu: Sichuan da xue chu ban she, 1990.
[31] Lu, Zhongmin, *China's Southwestern Silk* Road, Beijing: Foreign Languages Press, 2002.

received goods including raw gold, turquoise, amber, and ivory from the king of Nanzhao in 793.[32] The network of trade between Nanzhao and other states also reveals that there was cultural and religious exchange in local people's lives as well. People in Nanzhao would pay money to another country called Yeban (夜半國 *Yebanguo*) for divination and witchcraft.[33] This evidence shows that Nanzhao had its own trade system with the states surrounding it, and that this system also included religious commerce. This evidence regarding trade further provides us with a new approach to interpret the movement of religion. Similar to trade, the transmission of religion would have been influenced in part by political trends. However, political trends alone cannot completely reflect the interactions and exchange of information and ideas, and official political historical records often obscure unofficial interactions among local people. Through trade, we can see a picture of how a more intricate and dynamic system of religious exchange unfolded gradually along the Southwestern Silk Road.

Evidence from the perspective of the Pyu Kingdom also reflects this intricate system of interaction and exchange. The *Glass Palace Chronicle* (*Hmannan Yazawin*), which was compiled during the colonial period in Burma, narrates that the Pyu city Sri Ksestra was established because the Buddha foresaw that his teachings would last for a long time in Burma. When the Buddha reached the summit of a mountain there, he saw omens that indicated that Buddhism would flourish in Burma: he witnessed dried cow dung floating on the river and foresaw that a mole would eventually become the

[32] Robert Sigfrid Wicks, *Money, Markets, and Trade in Early Southeast Asia: The Development of Indigenous Monetary Systems to AD 1400,* Ithaca, N.Y.: Southeast Asia Program, Cornell University, 1992, 33-49.
[33] Xiang, Da (向達), *Man Shu Jiao Zhu* 蠻書校注 [The Annotation of the Book of *Man*], Beijing: Zhonghua shu ju, 1962, *juan* 10; Wicks, *Money, Markets, and Trade,* 33-49.

king.[34] The official historical sources in Burma assume that the assimilation of religion could be accomplished by a single king in a short time. Instead of portraying the transmission of religion as a gradual process, the *Glass Palace Chronicle* emphasizes Buddhism as orthodoxy that had power over other religions. Religious interaction was portrayed almost as a series of political revolutions, similar to the series of usurpations of the throne in Burmese history.

However, the archeological evidence from Pyu vividly reflects more details, showing that the adoption of Buddhism in Pyu was a long process. One of the first crucial influences that can be seen from the perspective of archaeology was the change of building material from timber to brick in architecture, which came from the religious architectural tradition in North India. The process of assimilation between Buddhism and Pyu indigenous religion can be further proved by the continuity of burial rituals until the end of the Buddhist period in Pyu, which indicates that the local traditions were not simply replaced by the process of Buddhist acculturation, contrary to the colonial historical narrative in *The Glass Palace Chronicle*. Some evidence regarding the style of the architecture in Sri Ksetra also reveals that it selectively

[34] Burma Sa taṅ‘″ nhaṅ‘′ Cā nay‘ jaṅ‘″ lup‘ ṅan‘″(The Royal Historical Commission), *Mhan‘ Nan‘″ Mahā Rājavaṅ‘ To‘ Krī″* [The Glass Palace Chronicle], Ran‘ kun‘ Mrui′: Pran‘ krā″ re″ Van‘ krī″ Ṭhāna, Sa taṅ‘″ nhaṅ‘′ Cā nay‘ jaṅ‘ lup‘ ṅan‘″, 1992.
There are several reasons why we need more additional sources instead of relying merely on the *Chronicle*. The first is because it was written in the colonial period (written in 1829-1832) when Burma was under the control of British. With the inspiration of rationalism and the goal of decolonization, this book traced back the history of Burma on a hypothesis that orthodox Theravada Buddhism is a more advanced religion compared to other religions and thus Buddhism becomes an essential criterion for the progress made by historical figures and events. The narrative thus construes Burmese history in a track that was set up in advance by the writer (The Royal Historical Commission, including scholars and monks) in colonial Burma. For instance, the scholars and monks who participated in the compilation of the book attribute the beginning of the early kingdoms to the development of Buddhism. The second reason why we need other sources is that the mythological elements in *The Glass Palace Chronicle* do not seem credible enough as a historical record.

adopted styles from India.[35] In cultural interactions, Pyu received knowledge of religion from other places, and then cultivated these religions with their own features.

From this section, we can see the religious picture of the late Tang period between the Pyu kingdom, Nanzhao and Tang slowly opening. Based on the Literary Chinese poems regarding the Pyu performance to the Tang, I have scrutinized the relevant sources behind the poems, including sources regarding Tang political contexts, trade networks on the Southwestern Silk Road, and archeological findings in Burma. The analysis in this section thus allows us to understand religious interactions together with the political connections between China, Nanzhao, and Burma.

Tang-Nanzhao relations and religion in Nanzhao kingdom

Traditionally, scholars tend to believe that there was a triangular relationship between the Tang, Nanzhao and Tibet and that Nanzhao was in fact partial to the Tang.[36] The reason why the Tang tried to seek a strong ally in the southwest was their fear of Tibetan encroachment. However, Charles Backus clearly describes Tang China's southwestern frontier and discussed the alliance of Tang and Nanzhao, arguing that it probably was not as stable as it was illustrated in the historical record and may have contained political fraudulence from Nanzhao in order to mediate between the two strong kingdoms.[37] For instance, Nanzhao might have concealed

[35] Janice Stargardt, *The Ancient Pyu of Burma*, Cambridge, England: PACSEA in association with the Institute of Southeast Asian Studies, 1990, 191-228; 346-347.
[36] Li, Kunsheng (李昆声), and Qingfu Qi (祁庆富), *Nanzhao Shi Hua* 南詔史話 [History of Nanzhao], Beijing: Wen wu chu ban she, 1984, 48-64.
[37] Backus, Charles, *The Nan-Chao Kingdom and T'ang China's Southwestern Frontier*, Cambridge [Cambridgeshire]: Cambridge University Press, 1981, 42.

some of its contacts with Tibet in order to win the trust of the Tang emperor. The Tang sources only depicted Dezong's intention to obtain support from Nanzhao and thus some of the sources that expressed Nanzhao's real standpoint between Tang and Tibet might have been hidden in the historical narrative.

Nanzhao chose strategic ways to maintain good relationships with both the Tang and Tibet, thus the standpoint of Nanzhao was unstable and depended on the political conditions surrounding it. Similarly, the analysis of the religious situation in Nanzhao was overshadowed by its political background, so the interpretation of religion in Nanzhao contains some misinterpretations. It is undeniable that Nanzhao's religion developed along its own track with the geographical influence from both Tang China and other states surrounding it. However, some scholars have tried to reconstruct Nanzhao's religion according to the Tang dynasty's religious framework. One of the opinions is that Nanzhao was geographically close to the origin of Daoism (Sichuan province) and thus Daoism became a prevalent religion in this region at least before the 9th century.[38] It is believed that the evidence can be found from one of the inscriptions in Nanzhao (南詔德化碑 *Nanzhao Dehua Bei*), which shows that during Ge-Luo-Feng's reign (閣邏鳳 r. 748-779), the three main religions in Nanzhao were clarified. However, these three main religions remain uncertain and we cannot simply interpret them as Buddhism, Daoism and Confucianism. Therefore, through the analysis below, I will explain why this cannot be used as evidence for the prevalence of Daoism in Nanzhao.

[38] Gu, Yuejuan (谷跃娟), *Nanzhao Shi Gai Yao* 南诏史概要 [A Summary of the History of Nanzhao], Kunming Shi: Yunnan da xue chu ban she, 2007, 200-208.

The author of this *Nanzhao Dehua inscription* might have had an intention to follow the example of the religion in Tang since he himself was an educated Tang official before. The author Zheng Hui (鄭回), who was serving as a magistrate of a district attached to Xizhou (嶲州) (which is in modern-day Sichuan province), became a captive of Nanzhao after 756-757. There he was appointed as the tutor to the royal princes and then became the advisor of the Nanzhao ruler Yi-Mou-Xun (異牟尋 *Yimouxun, r.779-808*). Even though Nanzhao kept allying with Tibet, Zheng Hui gained respect from the ruling family and brought Tang cultural influence into Nanzhao.[39] Zheng Hui probably added his own understandings of the religions in Nanzhao, writing in a literary Chinese context since he was a well-trained governor in Tang dynasty before he was captured. It was also possible that one of the three religions in Nanzhao was not Daoism but similar to Daoism in its form, or was assimilated by Daoism from Sichuan. The inscription in Nanzhao was written by Zheng Hui, but the work of handwriting was done by a Tang historian who traveled to Nanzhao. The content of the inscription includes the Nanzhao king's contribution and describes the process of the wars between Nanzhao and the Tang. It also indicates that Nanzhao was forced to fight battles with the Tang under the pressure of Tibet.

Another evidence that shows the intricacy of Tang and Nanzhao relation can be seen in *The New Tang History* (新唐書 *Xin Tangshu*) from when Nanzhao and Tang became allies. In 794 A.D., by the suggestions of Zheng Hui, the ruler Yi-Mou-Xun sent his son and Zheng Hui to take an oath of alliance with a Tang regional

[39] Backus, Charles, *The Nan-Chao Kingdom and T'ang China's Southwestern Frontier*, Cambridge [Cambridgeshire]: Cambridge University Press, 1981, 69-100.

governor. During the ceremony, they invited the Gods of Heaven, Earth and Water and then preserved the four copies of the texts of their oath in a stone room, under the river, in the temple of their ancestors, and sent a copy to the Tang emperor. This form of ceremony was similar to the Daoist ritual.[40] However, the analysis of this evidence cannot be separated from its context. Although the ruler of Nanzhao sent his son to make an alliance with Tang, he was afraid of the envoy from Tibet and thus met the regional governor of the Tang at night in order to prevent the Tibetans from seeing them. He even asked the regional governor of the Tang to wear an envoy costume of another country, but the regional governor rejected.[41] According to this context, it is not precise enough to conclude that Nanzhao engaged in the same Daoist ceremonies as the Tang did. If we simply put the religion in Nanzhao into the categories that were popular in Tang dynasty, our conclusions might be too rough. From the historical context, Yi-Mou-Xun maintained a good relationship both with Tibet and Tang. The form in which they chose to hold the ceremony probably was under the supervision of Zheng Hui and the Tang regional governor. That he could ask the Tang representative to wear another country's costume indicates that perhaps he could transform the religious form of the ceremony according to the Tang official's requirements, no matter which religion was the real belief in Nanzhao.

We can see that the understanding of the political relationship between Nanzhao and Tang had an influence on scholars' interpretation of the religions in Nanzhao. In this section, I intend to reveal that our understandings of Nanzhao

[40] Gu, *Nanzhao Shi Gai Yao,* 200-208.
[41] Ouyang, *Xin Tang Shu,* 2004, Collected Biographies (列傳) No.147-149.

religions are also based on its historical political situation. Therefore, holding the traditional opinion that Nanzhao was partial to Tang will lead us to misinterpret Nanzhao's real political attitudes toward both Tang and Tibet. Then the analysis of Nanzhao's religious situation will further be partial to Tang and the discussion of religion in Nanzhao will be based on Tang's political and religious paradigm and categories.

Since the historical records regarding Nanzhao that we have access to were mostly written by Tang officials, it is necessary to examine the layers in the sources. They all require specific analysis on the background information, including the identity of the author, the political intention in the writing and the contexts of the historical events. Another noticeable point about the historical records is their quality. According to the Chinese sources, Pyu was a Buddhist country with a huge white statue in front of the king's palace. People there were taciturn but kind. Nanzhao captured 3000 people from Pyu to help them find gold, which ruined the religious atmosphere in Pyu.[42] However, it is noticeable that the Tang sources regarding Pyu were not first-hand sources. Most of the information in the *Manshu* (蠻書) references preceding historical sources, and some of them are the author Fan Chuo's (樊綽) experiences and stories he heard. He had only been to Nanzhao once before he started his work on *Manshu.* One of the origin of his sources is the *Yunnanji* (雲南紀), which was written by Yuan Zi (袁滋), who was the only envoy that was officially sent to Nanzhao to establish a friendly relationship with the kingdom and had only stayed in

[42] Xiang, *Man Shu Jiao Zhu*, 1962, Volume 10.

Nanzhao for two months. Therefore, the content in his work regarding other countries close to Nanzhao was from the sources in Nanzhao. The Nanzhao sources probably came from the local chronicles that were written by the Nanzhao officials. Thus, the only Chinese sources we have about Pyu and Nanzhao are from the kingdom of Nanzhao itself. Moreover, the content in the *Manshu* has two main problems. First, the timelines of the foreign countries around Nanzhao were not clear enough. The introduction of Pyu might have condensed the history of a long period into a shorter timeline.[43] Second, some of the records are fragmented since the Tang officials and the Nanzhao officials had different criteria for the selection of records. Considering the background of the historical writing related to Nanzhao and then further related to Pyu, it is clear that the historical records mainly referred to previous records instead of conducting fieldwork. Because the authors of these historical records selected and combined different sources from previous times and from their personal experience, they finally present a picture of Nanzhao and its neighbor countries in a vague narrative without a same theme.

Religion in Nanzhao offers us a closer viewpoint of Burma in the Tang Dynasty. Even though the misinterpretation of Daoism reveals the tangible religious contacts internally and externally between Nanzhao and other countries, it is not reliable enough for us to gain a full view of the religions in Nanzhao and Burma. The limitation of the sources requires us to look for the information from local religions in these two places.

[43] Fang and Lin, *Fang Guoyu Wen Ji*, Volume 2, 104-252.

The religion in Nanzhao as it related to Burma

We can find parallels between Nanzhao and Burma with a comparative approach. In both Nanzhao and Burmese history, the two states witnessed the competition between Buddhism and indigenous religions. Recently, scholars have proposed that the esoteric Buddhism tradition in Nanzhao has origins in both medieval Chinese and Tibetan traditions.[44] Similar to Chinese Buddhism, Nanzhao Buddhism was also supported by the imperial rulers. The union of Nanzhao as a kingdom was supported by Tang dynasty; thus, Nanzhao was politically influenced by Tang. Yi-Mou-Xun's respect for Zheng Hui also shows that Nanzhao absorbed many of the Tang's cultural elements. Furthermore, what is certain is that Buddhism prevailed in Nanzhao, which can be seen from the archaeological evidence of Buddhist statues and grottoes found in the former kingdom. The rulers of Nanzhao in the middle and the later periods (around the ninth century) began to support Buddhism. The main Buddhist branch in Nanzhao was the Ācāryas branch, which allowed monks to live a secular life instead of being abstinent from marriage. The monks who were appointed as advisors by the rulers of Nanzhao were said to have been endowed with supernatural powers to protect the kingdom from calamities.[45] As a result, one of the problems that late Nanzhao rulers faced resembled a similar problem in the Tang: since most of the wealth was used for monasteries, the kingdom was short of money for other construction projects.[46]

---

[44] Bentor, Yael, and Shahar, Meir, *Chinese and Tibetan Esoteric Buddhism*, Studies on East Asian Religions: Volume 1, Leiden ; Boston : Brill, 2017, 389-428.
[45] Gu, *Nanzhao Shi Gai Yao*, 200-208.
[46] Yang, Shen(楊愼), and Wei Hu (胡蔚), *Nanzhao Ye Shi* 南詔野史 [The Unofficial History of Nanzhao], Taibei Shi: Cheng wen chu ban she, 1967, Volume 2.

Figure 1: The third scrolls of the second year of Nanzhao Zhongxing(南詔中興二年圖卷三)[47]

However, the development of Buddhism in Nanzhao was not a smooth process. From the picture above (which dates from the seventh century), we can see that the local people were violently attacking a Brahmin monk. This reveals the conflict between indigenous beliefs and foreign religion. Furthermore, a Yunnanese Buddhist story regarding a violent dragon surrendering to the Buddhist god Avalokitesvara also reflects how Buddhism integrated with indigenous religion in the region.[48]

The reason that the Ācarya brach could finally fit in with Nanzhao society is also because of the influence of local religion in the kingdom: it was the spirit worship

[47] He, Yaohua (何耀华), *The History of Yunnan* 雲南通史, Beijing: China Social Science Publishing House, 2011, Volume 3.
[48] Gu, *Nanzhao Shi Gai Yao,* 204.

and the local god worship indigenous to Nanzhao that provided Ācarya Buddhism the possibilities to grow in the kingdom. Before Nanzhao was united as a kingdom, there were 6 different tribes in this region that all worshipped their own ghost leaders. These leaders were similar to headmen that could administer hundreds of families. It is important to note that even after the status of Buddhism was raised in Nanzhao, this local god worship did not disappear. Instead, the figures in indigenous religion were preserved as local spirit leaders for villages. In modern Yunnan, many ethnic groups still worship these spiritual leaders. The Bai ethnic group (白族 *Baizu*), worships the historical figures in Nanzhao as their gods, including some of the Nanzhao heroes and even Zheng Hui from Tang. Another ethnic group, the Yi (彝族 *Yizu*) only considered the kings of Nanzhao as their gods.[49] Before Nanzhao became a united kingdom, there were 6 tribes (詔 *Zhao*) in the Erhai lake area in Yunnan at the beginning of Tang Dynasty, including Mengshe (蒙舍), Mengsui (蒙嶲), Shilang (施浪), Langqiong (浪穹), Dengtan (邆賧), and Yuexi (越析). With the support of the Tang, Mengshe united the six tribes and established the Nanzhao kingdom.[50] Among these six tribes, some of them were called *Wuman* (烏蠻) and some were called *Baiman* (白蠻) in the Chinese historical sources. Many scholars believe that the ones that were geographically closer to the Tang China were *Baiman* (白蠻) and they are the ancestors of nowadays Bai ethnic group (白族); the ones further to the Tang were *Wuman* (烏蠻) and they are the

[49] Fang, Guoyu (方国瑜), *Dian Shi Lun Cong* 滇史論叢 [The Anthology on the History of Yunnan], Shanghai: Shanghai ren min chu ban she, 1982.
[50] Gu, *Nanzhao Shi Gai Yao,* 1-27.

ancestors of Yi ethnic group(彝族).[51] However, Guoyu Fang doubted that the criteria for dividing *Baiman* (白蠻) and *Wuman* (烏蠻) varied in different parts of Yunnan. For instance, these two categories were sometimes used to distinguish people of the same ethnic group based on the regions they were from; in other cases, the two categories were used to distinguish people of the same region based on their ethnicities.[52] Therefore, these two unstable categories' usages depend on the geographical context in the sources.

Similarly, Buddhism in Burma also experienced conflict with the indigenous Burmese Nat Worship. When the first king of Pagan Empire (849-1297) Anawrahta (r.1044-1077) tried to extend the influence of Buddhism throughout all of Burma, he was constrained to giving royal recognition to the existing local cults and made a list of the 37 Nats. During the process of making the list of the Nats, both sides compromised. King Anawrahta had to acknowledge the local cult and people who worshipped the Nats had to accept the slight change of the list since Anawrahta added the guardian-god of Buddhism into the list.[53] Even though the number of Nats on the list is stable, there have been more than a hundred Nats in Burmese history. Because local people kept adding new historical figures into their own lists, and old figures in the list sometimes shared personality traits with new ones, the older figures gradually became replaced. At the same time, the number 37 in the official list became a symbol of King Anawrahta's authority over the integration of religions in the country. Most of

[51] Fang, Guoyu, *Dian Shi Lun Cong*, 147-151.
[52] Ibid, 148.
[53] Htin Aung, *Folk Elements in Burmese Buddhism*, London, 1962, 83-107.

the Nats were local heroes or members of the royal family and they met with tragic deaths by fighting for the throne and power.

There are in total 7 Nats from the Pyu period that have been preserved. Even though in Chinese historical records Pyu was well known only for its Buddhist culture, the legacy of the Pyu period was in fact much richer in the local religion in Burma. Except for the guardian-god of Buddhism that King Anawarhta added into the list, the Lord of the Great Mountain was the leader of the other local Nats. The Lord of the Great Mountain and his younger sister were both killed by one of the Pyu kings since the king was afraid that he would take over the throne. He then worked as a blacksmith and was popular among the people at that time because he was brave and competent. In the Nats' stories, he and his sister became Nats as soon as they died. Since they were treated unjustly by the king and died violently in a fire, their spirits resided in a tree, and they would catch and kill whoever approached the tree. Local people worship the Nats, but at the same time, they are afraid of them. Whenever they have difficulties in their family, especially problems regarding health or travel, they would worship the Nats and ask for protection from them. For Burmese people, Nat worship constitutes part of their belief in Buddhism. The Nats are easier to reach and ask for help from. The Lord of the Great Mountain still serves as the house guardian of Burmese people nowadays and they hang a coconut in their house for him to stay in. We can see that Burmese Nat worship reflects the long tradition of indigenous religion and involves some of the historical figures from the early kingdoms. However, Nat worship not only shows the conflict between local cults and Buddhism in the history of religions in Burma, but also reflects that the assimilation and acculturation of

religion is an intricate process. Some of the Nats have many hands, sharing characteristics with gods from Hinduism.[54] This evidence shows that the local cults in Burma were probably affected by many other religions before Buddhism came to Burma, or at least at the same time as the transmission of Buddhism.

The fierce competition between local religion and Buddhism happened both in Nanzhao and Burma. In this section, I intend to show the parallel between Nanzhao and Burma in order to reveal the importance of extant local religions. The local spirit leaders for villages in Yunnan probably inherited spirit and local god worship from the Nanzhao kingdom since they worshipped several historical figures in Nanzhao history. The Burmese Nat worship tradition reflects the historical interactions between Buddhism and local religion, and also shows the history of local religion itself. The historical figures in Nat worship in Burma kept updating in different periods. Then we may wonder: did the local god worship in Nanzhao share the same feature as the Nats worship? Are the historical figures in Nanzhao's list from different periods? These all encourage us to reconsider the historical interactions between local religion and foreign religion in laypeople's life as well as what we can learn from the extant local traditions.

[54] Temple, Richard Carnac, and Thve̍Han‘, *Mran‘ Mā' Mi Rui̍pha Lā Dha Le̍nat‘ Samuiṅ‘ ̓ 37 Maṅ‘ M̓ran‘ Mā Nuiṅ‘ N̓aṃ n* Kyaṅ‘ ́suṃ ̋so Nat‘ Pūjo‘ so Dha Le̍myā ̋*[The Burmese Tradition and the History of the 37 Nats], Ran‘ kun‘: Cā pe Mit‘ chve Cā pe 1981.

Conclusion

In this chapter, I have first explored the religious interactions between the Tang Dynasty, the kingdom of Nanzhao, and Burma using poetry about Pyu music performances at the Tang court. The satirical tone and the political ideals that the literati express in the poem encourages us to examine this event in a broader geographical scope. Using first-hand sources written in Literary Chinese, the official Burmese historical sources, and other archeological findings, I have illustrated the religious connection between these three kingdoms within an international relationship of trade networks. I have further explored these interactions by examining religion in Nanzhao and the Pyu kingdom.

In this chapter, I made two arguments. First, Tang political concerns concealed the religious interactions between states along the Southwestern Silk Road in the late Tang. This has allowed us to analyze the interactions between religion and politics within both Chinese and Burmese historical narratives. Second, I showed that we can still uncover traces of the interactions between Buddhism and indigenous religion on the Southwestern Silk Road through material culture, through analyses of Chinese folk songs and through ethnographical sources regarding local religion. The main question I have intended to pose in this chapter is that of how we should contextualize religious interactions along the Southwestern Silk Road within the political sphere. In this chapter, I have first focused on the sources regarding the intersection of the Pyu kingdom, Nanzhao, and the Tang, and then discussed the political contexts of this intersection by enlarging the geographical scope to the Southwestern Silk Road. This process of analysis also brings up other questions, which are how should we locate

religion in history and how would local religion remedy our understanding of history not only from official discourses. These require further analysis of historical records regarding religion, as well as investigations as to how people in the past understood religion together within other social spheres such as geopolitics.

The religion of East and Southeast Asia are rarely discussed together, while there is a great deal of work to separate them. However, this entire region was connected by commercial, political and demographic.[55] After the analysis of sources in multiple-layers, it is clear that there are still many spaces left for us in exploring the history of religions along the Southwestern Silk Road across China, Southeast Asia and India.

[55] DuBois, Thomas David, ed, *Casting Faiths: Imperialism and the Transformation of Religion in East and Southeast Asia*, Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan, 2009, 1-22.

CHAPTER 2

AN ANALYSIS OF CAUSATIVE ALTERNATIONS IN THE GLASS PALACE CHRONICLE

In this chapter, I will focus on causative alternations in *The Glass Palace Chronicle* (*Hmannan Maha Yazawindawgyi*). *The Glass Palace Chronicle* (1829-1832) is one of the most important second-hand historical sources in Burmese. I plan to explore causative alternations in examples in the *Chronicle*. It is necessary to discuss Burmese causative alternations in general first. Previous work by Tsu-Lin Mei, John Okell, Thein-Tun, and Xiangyang Cai reveals that Burmese non-causative verbs alternate with causative verbs.[56] Based on Okell's work, Thein-Tun illustrates that another difference between two types of verb is that the non-causative verb is the agentive and the causative verb is non-agentive. Thus, the subject of the causative verb in a sentence plays an active role.[57] When such verbs in Burmese appear as pairs, the causative ones are characterized by aspirated initial consonants.[58] For example, the causative verb /*phyet*/ (to destroy) and the non-causative verb /*pyet*/ (be destroyed), and the causative verb /*hnyein:*/ (extinguish) and the non-causative verb /*nyein:*/ (be

[56] Previous work refers to Okell, John, *A Reference Grammar of Colloquial Burmese*, London: Oxford University Press, 1969.
Thein-Tun, "Meaning Base for Structure: A Re-Examination of Verbs in Burmese," *Pacific Linguistics. Series A. Occasional Papers* 83 (1995): 173-192.
Cai, Xiangyang (蔡向陽), "Lun MianYu Dong Ci De Shi Dong Fan Chou 論緬語動詞的使動範疇 [The Theory of Burmese Causative Verb]," *Jie Fang Jun Wai Guo Yu Xue Yuan Xue Bao* (解放軍外國語學院學報) 28, no. 6 (2005): 43-48.
[57] Thein-Tun, "Meaning Base for Structure," 177.
[58] Cai, Lun MianYu Dong Ci De Shi Dong Fan Chou, 43-48.

extinguished).[59] Tsu-Lin Mei's work focuses on the potential cognate relationship of the non-causative and causative pair /*phyet*/ (to destroy) and /*pyet*/ (be destroyed) in the Sino-Tibetan language family by comparing the verbs in literary Chinese, Burmese, Rgyalrong (Jiarong) and so on.[60] This further reveals the importance of non-causative and causative verb pairs from the perspective of historical linguistics. In the *Chronicle*, I find that there are suffixes that follow these two types of verb to nominalize them. I plan to explore the nominalization of the causative and non-causative verbs by one suffix -*gyin:*-.[61]

First, I will discuss what role the verb + suffix -*gyin:*- plays in the context in the *Chronicle* and when it goes with a non-causative or causative verb. For this part, I will both consider the non-causative or causative verbs in the noun, the main verb and the relationship between the two verbs in the sentence in each example. Second, I will discuss a phenomenon regarding the recursion of causative (or agentive) functioned words (e.g. the nominalized causative verb and the causative suffix appear at the same time) in examples. Then, I will analyze the reason behind this phenomenon and what it shows about the language. Third, I will further examine this phenomenon and discuss whether there is a rule for choosing non-causative or causative verbs in the *Chronicle.* After these three issues, I will then draw a conclusion on the findings regarding the relationship between the syntactic roles of the noun phrase with the suffix -*gyin:*-, the

[59] The corresponding Burmese words in this example are as follows: /*phyet*/ (ဖျက်, to destroy), /*pyet*/ (ပျက်, be destroyed), /*hnyein:*/ (ငြှိမ်း, extinguish), and /*nyein:*/ (ငြိမ်း, be extinguished).
[60] Zhongguo she hui ke xue yuan Yu yan yan jiu suo (中國社會科學院語言研究所), *Li Shi Yu Yan Xue Yan Jiu Di Shi Er Ji* 歷史語言學研究第十二輯 [Historical Linguistics Volume 12], 北京:商務印書館 (Beijing: Shang wu yin shu guan), 2018.
[61] The corresponding Burmese word is ခြင်း (-*gyin:*-).

occurrence of the causative suffix -*zei*-, and the selection of non-causative and causative verbs in the sentence.[62]

Nominalization of verbs plays an important role in the narrative in the *Chronicle,* especially in the early part, which covers from the beginning of the world to the Pagan Dynasty (849-1297). Based on previous work, my analysis of this nominalization in connection with non-causative and causative verbs in the *Chronicle* will not only offer us a new perspective to view the nominalized non-causative and causative verbs in their syntactical roles, but also open up a discussion about the probable reasons of the ungrammatical recursion regarding the non-causative and causative verbs. Therefore, we can see the selection between non-causative and causative verbs in a broader scope and further explore what questions this selection generates in researching the causative function in Burmese language.

The usages of the suffix with non-causative and causative verbs in The Glass Palace Chronicle

In this part of the chapter, I will focus on the nominalization of the non-causative and causative verbs by the suffix -*gyin:*- in written Burmese with the examples from *The Glass Palace Chronicle*. The main goal of this part is to explore what syntactic role the verb+suffix -*gyin:* plays in the context of the *Chronicle* and when it appears with a non-causative or causative verb.

[62] The corresponding Burmese word is ပေ (-*zei*-).

In written Burmese, the nominalization of non-causative and causative verbs requires morphological change. Suffixes can be added to a verb in order to form a noun, for example, *-kyaun:*, *-hmu'*- and *-phwe*-.[63] The suffix I plan to focus on in this chapter is *-gyin:*-. This suffix shares the same form in both colloquial and written Burmese. I will discuss the example of this suffix in the following paragraphs with regard to the verb nominalized by *-gyin:*- and the main verb in the sentence.

The definition of *-gyin:*- in the Burmese-English dictionary is a suffix that nominalizes the verb to form a noun.[64] In *A Reference Grammar of Colloquial Burmese*, Okell describes the suffixes as "nouns which occur with live verb attributes" and the verb+suffix *-gyin:*- unit is a special compound including a verb and a special head.[65] The suffix comes from a noun [*a-gyin:*] (affair or matter) and it can be used without [a] and voiced after the verb to express the meaning "act of (doing), (do)ing" or simply to form nouns from verbs.[66] We can see both non-causative and causative verbs followed by *-gyin:*- in the *Chronicle*. There are several different usages of the suffix *-gyin:*- after non-causative and causative verbs. The difference of usages can be first categorized in the syntactic roles of the verb with the suffix as a unit. When the verb+*-gyin:*- unit plays a role in the subject in the sentence, there is a main verb or predicative adjective after it:

---

[63] The corresponding Burmese words are ငြင်း (*-kyaun:*-), မူ (*-hmu'*-), and ဖွယ် (*-phwe*-).

[64] Judson, Adoniram, Robert C Stevenson, and F. H Eveleth, *Judson's Burmese English Dictionary*, 3, ʾa krim‘. Ran‘ kun‘: Nhac‘ khraṅ‘ ʹSāsanā Puṃ nhip‘ Thut‘ ve reʹṬhāna, 1986, 302.

[65] Okell, *A Reference Grammar of Colloquial Burmese*, 65.

[66] Ibid, 267. The corresponding Burmese word is အခြင်း (*a-gyin:*).

Example 1: ထို့ကြောင့်လုလင်မေးသောပြဿနာတို့ကိုဖြေခြင်းၦ်ခဲယဉ်းသည်မရှိ။

(Therefore solving the problem that the young man asked is not difficult. *Hto:gyaun' lu'linmei:thaw:pyat th-nako phyeigyin:hnait khe:yin: dhi m-shi'*).[67]

The suffix -*gyin:*- follows the causative verb "to solve (*phyei*)" to express the act of solving a problem as a noun phrase here, since the "problem (*pyat th-na*)" works as the object of the verb "to solve (*phyei*)." This relationship between the "problem" and "to solve" can be seen in the objective case marker "*ko*".[68] In this situation, "solving the problem (*pyat th-nako phyeigyin:*)," affixed by -*gyin:*- as a whole is described by the adjective as "difficult (*khe:yin:*)." This adjective is followed by a nominative case suffix -*dhi*-. Therefore, another verb "doesn't have (m-shi') further negates the adjective.[69] The selection of causative verb in this case depends firstly on the objective case of the noun "problem (*pyat th-na*)" before "to solve (*phyei*)," and secondly on the subjective case of the whole unit "solving the problem (*pyat th-nako phyeigyin:*)." Since the causative verb denotes an agentive frame and the non-causative verb denotes an non-agentive frame in a sentence, the objective case of "problem (*pyat th-na*)" implies the application of the action, while the subjective case of the whole unit "solving the problem (*pyat th-nako phyeigyin:*)" implies that there should be a non-causative main verb (or an adjective) later in the sentence. Different from example 1, there is another situation when the verb+suffix unit works as the

[67] The Royal Historical Commission, *Mhan' Nan'" Mahā Rājavaṅ' To' Krī"*. Mantale" mrui': Mra Jo' Puṃ nhip' tuik' [The Glass Palace Chronicle], 1963, 112.

[68] The corresponding Burmese words in this example are "to solve" (*phyei*, ဖြေ), "problem" (*pyat th-na*, ပြဿနာ)", and the objective case marker ကို (*ko*).

[69] The corresponding Burmese word is မရှိ (m-shi').

subject and it is followed by a main verb to emphasize the happening of the verb before the suffix.

Example 2: ရန်စစ်ကြီးဖြစ်ကြလျှင်ပြည်သူသတ္တဝါအပေါင်းသေကြေပျက်စီးခြင်းဖြစ်လတ္တံ့သည်၊

(If there were a big war, the death of people and other living beings would happen. *Yansitgyi: phyitkya'hlyin pyidhu dh-d-wa a-pauun:theikyei pyet si:gyin:phyit l-tan'dhi*).[70]

In example 2, we can see that the non-causative verb "die or be destroyed (*pyet si:*)" forms a compound verb with another verb "die (*theikyei*)." [71] The compound non-causative verb is followed by the suffix -*gyin:*- to form the noun phrase "the death of people and other living beings." The noun "people and other living beings (*pyidhu dh-d-wa a-pauun:*)" works as the subject of the compound non-causative verb "perish (*theikyei pyet si:*)."[72] Since the subjective case indicates the non-agentive frame before the suffix -*gyin:*-, we can the verb before the suffix appears as a non-causative one. In this situation, since the noun phrase "the death of people and other living beings" plays the role of the subject, it implies the non-agentive frame in the whole sentence and further requires that there should be a non-causative main verb (or an adjective) later in the sentence. The main verb "happen (*phyit*)" after the noun phrase is thus non-causative and emphasizes the happening of the non-causative verb "perish (*theikyei pyet si:*)" inside the verb+suffix unit.[73]

---

[70] The Royal Historical Commission, *Mhan' Nan'",* 154.

[71] The corresponding Burmese words in this example are ပျက်စီး (*pyet si:*) and သေကြေ (*theikyei*).

[72] The corresponding Burmese words are "people and other living beings" (*pyidhu dh-d-wa a-pauun:*, ပြည်သူသတ္တဝါအပေါင်း) and "perish" (*theikyei pyet si:,* သေကြေပျက်စီး).

[73] The corresponding Burmese word is ဖြစ် (*phyit*).

From example 1 and 2, we can learn that the selection between non-causative verb and causative verb before the suffix -*gyin:*- is based on the relationship between the syntactic role of the noun before the verb before the suffix. The verb+suffix unit works as a separate part before the main verb in the sentence, thus the selection before the suffix is not directly related to the selection between non-causative or causative for the main verb. Instead, the selection of the main verb depends on the syntactic role of the verb+suffix unit. When the verb+suffix unit works as the subject, it implies the non-agentive frame of the whole sentence and the unit is followed by a main verb that is non-causative (or adjective).

Second, in some cases the verb+ -*gyin:*- unit works as an object in the sentence. There are two kinds of verbs that can follow the verb+ -*gyin:*- in objective case. The first kind is a pattern that appears in the dictionary of grammatical forms.[74] The main verb "do, commit (*pyu'*)" or the verb "make sth. happen (*phyitzei*)" can be added to the verb+ -*gyin:*- unit, and the unit works as the object of these two main verbs.[75] We can further explore this syntactic role of the unit in the following examples:

[74] Okell, John, and Anna Allott, *Burmese/Myanmar Dictionary of Grammatical Forms*, Richmond: Curzon, 2001, 42.

[75] The corresponding Burmese words are ပြု (*pyu'*) and ဖြစ်စေ (*phyitzei*).

Example 3: ဆရာခြောက်ပါးတို့နှင့်ပေါင်းဖော်၍သက္ကရာဇ်လေးရာ့သုံးခုကိုဖြိုခြင်းကိုပြု၏

(The king associated with 6 teachers and caused damage to the Burmese calendar of the 403rd year. *Hs-ya khyautpa:do'hnin'paun:phawywei'thet g-yit lei:ya'thon:khu'ko phyo gyin:ko pyu'i'*).[76]

Here in the example, the structure before the suffix *-gyin:-* is similar to the one in example 1. Before the suffix, the object of the causative verb "demolish, destroy (*phyo*)" is "Burmese calendar of the 403rd year (*thet g-yit lei:ya'thon:khu'*)."[77] The objective case marker "(*ko*)" indicates the agentive frame of the noun phrase before the suffix. After the noun phrase, there is another objective case marker "(*ko*)" that marks the whole noun phrase as an object of the whole sentence. Therefore, the full sentence is in an agentive frame and it indicates that the main verb "do, commit (*pyu'*)" is causative (functive). In example 3, we can see the recursion of causative verb appears in a sentence. This recursion of causative verb further shows that there is an emphasis on the agentive frame in the sentence. I will further discuss the reason for using this structure instead of simply using a causative verb once in the following section. Another example is the second main verb that appears in the dictionary of grammatical form as is mentioned before:

Example 4: သစ်ပင်ကျိုးပြတ်ခြင်းတောင်ထွတ်ပြုကျခြင်းကိုဖြစ်စေလျက်

[76] The Royal Historical Commission, *Mhan' Nan'"* 68, 179.

[77] The corresponding Burmese words are ဖြို (*phyo*) and သက္ကရာဇ်လေးရာ့သုံးခု (*thet g-yit lei:ya'thon:khu'*).

((The Naga King) made the break of the tree and the collapse of the top of the mountain happen. *Thit pin kyo:pyat gyin:taun htwut pyogya'gyin:ko phyit zei hlyet*).[78]

In this example, the main verb that follows the verb+ -*gyin:*- structure is "make something happen (*phyit zei*)." Before talking about the sentence structure, it is noticeable that this main verb consists of verb+suffix. The first part is the verb "happen (*phyit)*" is as is explained in example 2, and the second part is the suffix -*zei-,* which makes the verb before it causative. In this part of the chapter, we will consider this verb+suffix "make something happen (*phyit zei*)" as a causative verb. In the next part of the chapter, I will further explain the origin of this form and the usage of the suffix -*zei-*. Now, let's turn to the sentence structure. Before the suffix, the nouns "tree (*thit pin*)" and "the top of the mountain (*taun htwut*)" are both in subjective cases, thus the verbs "break (*kyo:pyat*)" and "collapse (*pyogya*)" are both non-causative.[79] The objective case marker "*ko*" after the noun phrase "the break of the tree and the collapse of the top of the mountain" indicates that it is the object of the whole sentence. Therefore, we can see the main verb "make something happen (*phyit zei*)" appears to be causative. The causative verb "*phyit zei*" emphasizes the agent of the action (The Naga King) who causes the action of the verb to occur before -*gyin:*-. Different from example 3, we can see that there is no recursion of causative verb and thus only one agentive frame in the sentence as a whole. Apart from the two main

[78] The Royal Historical Commission, *Mhan' Nan'",* 144.

[79] The corresponding Burmese words in this example are သစ်ပင် (*thit pin*), တောင်ထွတ် (*taun htwut*) ကျိုးပြတ် (*kyo:pyat*), and ပြုကျ (*pyogya*).

verbs “do, commit (*phyit*)” and “make something happen (*phyit zei*)”, we can also find other verbs following the objective case verb+suffix -*gyin:*- unit:

Example 5:

ကမ္ဘာဦးသူတို့သည်ကြောက်ခြင်းကင်း၍ရဲရင့်ခြင်းဖြစ်ကုန်သောကြောင့်သူရိယဟုခေါ်ဝေါ်ကုန်၏

(At the beginning of the world, since they kept away from [their] fear and became full of bravery, they gave it the name called “the sun”. *G-ba u: thu do’dhi kyaut gyin:kin:ywei’ye:yin’gyin:phyitkon thaw:kyaun’thu ri’ya’hu’khaw waw kon i’*).[80]

In this case, the verb before the suffix is the non-causative verb “afraid” (*kyaut*). It is nominalized as “fear” (*kyaut gyin*:) by the suffix “-*gyin:*-.”[81] Even though there is no objective case marker “*ko*” after the suffix to indicate that the verb+suffix unit works as the object of the whole sentence, we can see the syntactic role of them from the meanings of the nominalized verb “fear” (*kyaut gyin*:) and the main causative verb “keep away from (*kin:*).”[82] Thus, in this example, there is also no recursion of the agentive frame. The structure of the noun phrase appears as non-causative, while the whole structure of the sentence expresses a causative frame.

From examples 3-5, we can learn that when the verb+suffix -*gyin:*- unit plays the role of an object in a sentence, it indicates that the main verb is in an agentive frame and should be causative. Similar to the situation in examples 1-2, the verb+suffix unit works separately and the main verb in the sentence is based on the

[80] The Royal Historical Commission, *Mhan‘ Nan‘",* 13.
[81] The corresponding Burmese word in this example is ကြောက် (*kyaut*).
[82] The corresponding Burmese word is ကင်း (*kin:*).

syntactic role of the verb+suffix -*gyin:*- before it. Therefore, we can see a recursion of the agentive frame in one sentence. We can summarize this pattern of recursion in a written Burmese sentence. The Burmese sentence structure is subject-object (objective case marker)-verb. Since the object in our discussion is the verb+suffix -*gyin:*- unit, I illustrate it as follows:

subject-object (objective case marker)-verb

subject-verb+ -*gyin:*- (objective case marker)-main verb

Therefore, the pattern we see in example 4 and 5 is: subject-non-causative verb+ -*gyin:*- (objective case marker)-causative main verb. However, the recursion of the agentive frame in example 3 appears as: subject-causative verb+ -*gyin:*- (objective case marker)-causative main verb. What is the meaning of this recursion? Is there a reason behind it? I will further analyze this later together with other forms of recursion in the next part of this chapter.

Third, there is another fixed structure of the verb+ "*gyin:hnga*" or verb+ "*-zei- gyin:hnga*" to express the meaning of "in order to."[83] In the dictionary, "*hnga*" follows the nominalized verb after the suffix -*gyin:*- to express the meaning "in order to, being able to do sth", and the verb+ "*-zei- gyin:hnga*" means "in order to cause V, so as to enable V, so as to bring about V." [84] We can find examples regarding this structure:

Example 6: အာဏာရှိသောနိုပ်နှင်းချီးမြှောက်ခြင်းငှါ…….

[83] The corresponding Burmese words are ခြင်းငှာ (*gyin:hnga*) and ဇစခြင်းငှာ (*-zei- gyin:hnga*).
[84] Okell and Allott, *Burmese/Myanmar Dictionary of Grammatical Forms*, 45-46.

(in order to lower and honor power. *Ana shi'thaw:hneit hnin:khyi:hmyaut gyin:hnga*).[85]

Here, the causative verbs "to lower (*hneit hnin:*)" and "to honor, to exalt (*khyi:hmyaut*)" are followed by the suffix -*gyin:*- and then they form the verb+ "*gyin:hnga*" structure together.[86] In this example, we can see the agentive frame appears once by using the causative verb before the suffix -*gyin:*-. Most of the examples in the *Chronicle* appear with the form verb+ "*-zei- gyin:hnga*":

Example 7: ထောပတ်အိုးတစ်ရာဖြစ်သော်လည်းငြိမ်းစေခြင်းငှါမတတ်နိုင်ရာသတည်း

(Even though there were 100 butter pots, he is unable to cause them to be destroyed. *Htaw:bat o:titya phyitthawle:nyein:zei gyin:hnga m-tat nain ya dh-di:*).[87]

Here, the non-causative verb "be extinguished (*nyein:*)" is followed by the structure "*zei gyin:hnga*" to form the non-causative verb to be causative.[88] Since the verb+ "*zei gyin:hnga*" structure has the agentive (causative) frame, it works syntactically with a non-causative verb before it. However, in another example, we see exceptions to this structure:

Example 8: ရန်သူအပေါင်းတို့ကိုနှိပ်နင်းစေခြင်းငှါ

(in order to pacify all the enemies. *Yandhu a-paun:to'ko hneit nin: zei gyin:hnga*).[89]

---

[85] The Royal Historical Commission, *Mhan' Nan'"*, 15.
[86] The corresponding Burmese words are နှိပ်နှင်း (*hneit hnin:*) and ချီးမြှောက် (*khyi:hmyaut*).
[87] The Royal Historical Commission, *Mhan' Nan'"*, 127.
[88] The corresponding Burmese word is ငြိမ်း (*nyein:*).
[89] Ibid, 171.

In this situation, the causative verb "to pacify (*hneit nin:*)" works as the verb of the object "the enemies (*yandhu*)."[90] We see the objective case marker "*ko*" after the noun and the causative verb "to pacify (*hneit nin:*)" emphasizes the agentive frame before the structure "*zei gyin:hnga*." However, if we consider this example carefully, we will see that the causative verb+ "*zei gyin:hnga*" here implies a recursion of agentive frame. Because the structure itself indicates the causative frame once, and the causative verb before it expresses the same frame again.

From example 6-8, we can see that the verb+ "*gyin:hnga*" structure contains an implied agentive frame because the meaning "in order to, being able to do something" emphasizes the ability of the subject or an implied subject. Therefore, even when there is no causative suffix *-zei-* in the structure in example 6, the verb before the suffix -gyin:- is in an causative form to conform with the meaning of the sentence. However, when the verb+ *-zei- gyin:hnga*" indicates the causative structure directly with the suffix *-zei-*, we see selection of both non-causative and causative verb before it in examples 7 and 8. It seems that the verb+suffix unit still works separately in these two structures and the verb+ "*gyin:hnga*" or verb+ "*zei gyin:hnga*" structures in these examples are fixed. Therefore, we can see a recursion of the agentive frame that is similar to the phenomenon in the second type of usage of the suffix *-gyin:* in this part of the chapter. The pattern we see in example 3 appears as: subject-causative verb+ *-gyin:-* (objective case marker)-causative main verb, and the pattern we see here is the

[90] The corresponding Burmese words are နှိပ်နင်း (*hneit nin:*) and ရန်သူ (*yandhu*).

causative verb + "*zei gyin:hnga*." In both of the patterns, we find this grammatical recursion of agentive (causative) frame within the same sentence.

In this section of the chapter, I analyze the three types of usages of the suffix -*gyin:*- in examples in the *Glass Palace Chronicle.* My discussion not only focuses on the syntactic roles that the verb+suffix unit plays, but also further relate this unit to the selection between non-causative and causative verbs both of the verb in the unit and of the main verb in the sentence. It is necessary to consider how the syntactic rules form the non-causative or causative frames in the sentences in written Burmese. In this way, I find the recursion of agentive (causative) frames in one sentence. In example 3, it appears as the coexistence of two causative verbs with one before the suffix and one causative main verb; in example 8, the causative verb appears in a fixed grammatical structure that contains the agentive frame. These findings provide us a lens to further examine this phenomenon of recursion in the next section with the suffix -*zei*-.

The syntactic environments of non-causative and causative verbs in The Glass Palace Chronicle

After talking about the three different types of usages of the suffix -*gyin:*-, I intend to further explore the rule of this non-causative and causative verb selection before the suffix. First, in most of the examples, it seems clear that the suffix -*gyin:*- goes with the non-causative or causative verbs without the recursion of an agentive frame in this sentence. Just like in example 4, the verb before the suffix -*gyin:*- is non-

causative when there is the causative suffix *-zei-* after the main verb in the sentence (e.g. in example 4).[91]

However, in other situations when the causative suffix *-zei-* appears directly before the suffix *-gyin:-* as part of the same noun phrase, we can see that both non-causative and causative verbs occur before it with *-zei-* (e.g. in example 8 we see the causative verb + "*zei gyin:hnga*" structure). It seems that the occurrence of the same suffix *-zei-* brings about the different choices of non-causative or causative verbs in examples 4 and 8. Here, it is necessary to bring this suffix *-zei-* into the discussion. Okell said that this causative suffix likely has its origin in calquing Pali grammar. It appears in different tenses including past, future, imperative and so on.[92] And it is obvious that there is a violation of the convention of only one causative frame when the causative (aspirated) form is used before this causative suffix.[93] What is the reason of this recursion? It seems necessary now to turn to more examples in the *Chronicle*. Similar to the causative verb + *zei gyin:hnga* structure in example 8, we can also see another example in the *Chronicle*:

မဖျက်ဆီးစေခြင်းငှါ

(in order to not cause the destruction [of religion]. *M-phyet his: zei gyin:hnga*).[94]

Even though the phrase as a whole works grammatically in the English translation, it is necessary to notice that the causative verb "destroy (*phyet his:*)"

[91] The Royal Historical Commission, *Mhan' Nan'"*, 144.
[92] Okell, John, "Nissaya Burmese," Lingua 15, (1965): 186-227.
[93] Ibid.
[94] The Royal Historical Commission, *Mhan' Nan'"*, 144.

appears at the same time with the causative suffix *-zei-*. The recursion in this phrase creates a double causative meaning like "cause to destroy". It is, in fact, unnecessary here for the causative verb and the causative suffix to appear at the same time. We can also find several examples without the suffix *-gyin:-* where this recursion happens. In these examples, causative verbs "to destroy" (*phyet*), "reduce" (*hlyau*) "open up, construct" (*phauk*), "to solve, reconcile" (*phre*), "frighten" (*khraukhlan*), and "to break" (*khyui*) appear before the causative suffix *-zei-*.[95] My exploration will focus on what this phenomenon in *The Glass Palace Chronicle* further shows in the selection of non-causative and causative verbs. Even with the causative *-zei-*, it is inevitable that sometimes causative verbs may be used. Instead of simply considering it as mistakes in written Burmese, it is necessary to consider whether this challenges our understanding and translation of Burmese grammar. In this section of my chapter, I will analyze the reason behind this recursion and further explain why it happens only in some cases.

This phenomenon reflects that the inflections and syntax in Pali grammar may clash with the Burmese language. This historical intersection between an Indo-European language and a Sino-Tibetan language was preserved by the coexistence of two causative elements in Burmese.[96] This interaction of linguistics originated in a certain social context. In Dietrich Lammerts' discussion of *Dhammasattha* manuscripts and texts in premodern Burma, he mentions that there are different forms

[95] The Royal Historical Commission, *Mhan' Nan'"*, 84, 86, 119, 122, 124, 222.
[96] Okell, "Nissaya Burmese", 186-227. The corresponding Burmese words are "to destroy" (*phyet*, ဖျက်), "reduce" (*hlyau*, လျှော့), "open up, construct" (*phauk*, ဖောက်), "to solve, reconcile" (*phre*, ဖြေ), "frighten" (*khraukhlan*, ခြောက်လှန့်), and "to break" (*khyui*, ချိုး).

of *nissayas* and different ways of categorizing them, including generally "word-by-word glosses in Burmese (verbatim)", "free translation", "Pali word followed by Burmese gloss in rhyme (ornate)", and "translation with short notes."[97] *Nissayas* worked as a textual tool to "support for aural/oral pedagogy" in "monastic education or Buddhist homiletics" with respect to grammatical teaching.[98] *Nissayas* in Burma provided a smooth transition between Pali and vernaculars, and thus its grammatical influence on the Burmese language accumulated within the certain educational context.

In Pali, adding the suffix -e-, -p- and -e-, -āpe- to the verbs according to different stems can form causative verbs.[99] In Okell's research on Nissaya Burmese, he found that Burmese took this form of inflection and added the suffix *-zei-* after a Burmese verb to form a causative verb mechanically. However, since some of the Burmese verbs originally contain the causative meaning by using the aspirated initial consonant, this application of the Pali suffix sometimes leads to the recursion of causative frames in one sentence. Therefore, we can see that even though both in example 4 and 8 the same suffix *-zei-* appears, the ungrammatical coexistence of the causative verb + *-zei-* structure only happens in example 8. The reason is that the suffix *-zei-* is a calque from Pali grammar to form the verbs in Burmese. Thus, it is possible that a combination of Burmese causative verb and Pali causative suffix

[97] According to Lammerts, nissaya is a bilingual exegetical text that provide an interverbal, interphrasal, or interlinear vernacular translation, gloss or commentary on a Sanskrit or Pali source text or section of text. Lammerts, Dietrich, "Buddhism and Written Law: Dhammasattha Manuscripts and Texts in Premodern Burma," PhD Thesis, Cornell University, 2010, 228-230.
[98] Ibid, 230-231.
[99] Gair, James W, and Ḍabliv, Es Karuṇātilaka, *A New Course in Reading Pāli: Entering the Word of the Buddha*, Delhi: Motilal Banarsidass Publishers, 1998, 139.

appears in one word when they are next to each other as is shown in example 8. However, in example 3, when the Pali causative suffix appears after the main verb in a sentence, which is far from the verb before the suffix *-gyin:-*, it marks the agentive frame of the whole sentence and thus the combination of cannot be reflected. Apart from the suffix *-zei-*, there are other Nissaya features in *The Glass Palace Chronicle.* The first one is the postpositional marker *i* that marks the tense at the end of most of the sentences in the *Chronicle*.[100] This tense is called aorist in Pali, which expresses a past action without indicating whether it is the completion or the continuation of it. Even though in Pali it is an inflection within the verb, the Burmese calque from this Pali grammar forms it as a marker at the end of an affirmative sentence. In order to retell the past in the narrative of the *Chronicle*, most of the verbs are ended with this postpositional marker *i*. The second feature is a common conjunction *ywei* that indicates the gerund in the subordinate clause of a sentence.[101] Similar to the postpositional marker *i*, the conjunction *ywei* also comes from the Pali inflection within the verb. By using this conjunction, the style of written Burmese in the *Chronicle* is characterized by long and complex sentences. These two features show that the grammatical influence of Nissaya Burmese is obvious not only in the translation and commentary of Buddhist texts, but also in the language of the historical narrative in the *Chronicle*.

[100] The corresponding Burmese is ၏ (*i*).

[101] The corresponding Burmese is ၍ (*ywei*).

Conclusion

In this chapter, I try to open up the discussion of these non-causative and causative pairs by relating them to the examples in the typical usage in a historical source, the *Glass Palace Chronicle*. This chapter shows that there are multiple layers in the exploration of language in a historical source from the perspective of linguistics. The historical narrative reveals the high-frequency non-causative and causative verbs, the types of usage of a certain structure and the influence of other languages.
By considering the non-causative and causative verbs in the context, I find a new perspective to view the verbs by combining it with the nominalized suffix -*gyin:*-.

This chapter not only discusses what are the Burmese non-causative and causative pairs but also try to summarize a rule for them and figure out how they are selected. From the three types of usage, we can see that the noun's syntactic role before the suffix -*gyin:*- is a determining factor for the choice between non-causative and causative verbs of the verb+-*gyin:*- noun phrase. Then, the verb+-*gyin:*- noun phrase's syntactic role is the determining factor of whether the main verb of the whole sentence is non-causative or causative; then in order to fully explore the switch between non-causative and causative verbs, I further mention the introduction of the causative suffix -*zei*- into the Burmese language from Pali. This introduction of the suffix -*zei*- sometimes leads to ungrammaticality when it goes with a causative verb, but it does so only in situations when the suffix -*zei*- is next to the verb in the noun phrase. The pattern is (subject)-object(objective case marker)-the causative verb+ *zei gyin:hnga*. Therefore, this is also related to my first finding regarding the syntactic role of the noun phrase with the suffix -*gyin:*- in the whole sentence. It seems that the

relationship between the main verb and the noun phrase is more stable and is always grammatical. The pattern is subject-non-causative verb+-*gyin:*- (objective case marker)-main verb+-*zei*-. This phenomenon further generates questions: is it possible that the suffix -*gyin:*- also was influenced by Pali grammar? When the suffix -*zei*- is attached to the causative verb, does this suggests that the differentiation between the non-causative and causative Burmese verbs was weakening at some point because of the Pali influence? Is this recursion of the causative forms predictable based on the role of the verb phrase before the suffix -*gyin:*- in a sentence? These questions provide us more space for prospective exploration.

CONCLUSION

This thesis brings up a number of questions. Most notably: is it possible to study the history of religion in pre-modern Asia from a perspective other than that of the political elites? Can we give voices to the common people and lay practitioners, as well as to indigenous religions like spirit worship and animism? Also, how can we re-situate these voices within analyses of the official sources outside of the perspective of the state? Therefore, here are two issues concerning these questions. The first is that the subject in the sources is always noteworthy. For instance, when we try to look for historical sources relating to religion in Nanzhao, it is natural for us to pay more attention to the ones that are emphasized by the elites in the narrative they created. Thus, what I am trying to convey here is that this thesis not only explores the cultural interactions within a region beyond the boundaries of nation-states, but also points out the potential internal cultural gap within an entity or a state. This cultural gap is reflected obviously in the sources when the elites had superiority over other narratives. This is the reason why the cultural comparison across borders will bring the marginalized cultural elements into the discussion. Because of the intention of this comparison, the second noteworthy issue is the combination of historical discussion and ethnographic evidence. The limits of combining them are that the authenticity and accuracy of the sources require more historically locatable sources to support each other. In this way, the ethnographic sources I use in this thesis regarding local religion are aimed at opening up a non-exclusive discussion.

What I have revealed in this chapter is not that the historical sources themselves are problematic, but the conclusions we draw by taking advantage of the

sources might be problematic. If we consider the poem that portrays the religious interaction between Pyu and Tang simply as an evidence of an interstate communication from the perspective of modern nation-states, we would not be able to find the political purpose and the religious interactions behind it. For the literary Chinese sources, there are two layers of interpretations in the sources. First, the sources regarding both Nanzhao and Pyu represent the interpretation of political elites and literati. However, it is noticeable that in the secondary work, scholars continue the political paradigm in pre-modern sources and further maintain this historical paradigm by connecting the religious interactions to the contemporary nation-state. Therefore, the main concern is how should we deal with the multiple layers of historical interpretations in research. For the official Burmese sources, it is necessary to read them critically with more additional sources instead of completely denying their historical value. There are several reasons why we need to read these sources critically. The first is because they were written in the colonial period (written in 1829-1832) when Burma was under the control of the British. With the inspiration of rationalism and the goal of decolonization, *The Glass Palace Chronicle* traced back the history of Burma on a hypothesis that orthodox Theravada Buddhism is a more advanced religion compared to other religions, and thus Buddhism becomes an essential criterion for the progress made by historical figures and events. The narrative thus construes Burmese history in a track that was set up in advance by the writer (The Royal Historical Commission, including scholars and monks) in colonial Burma. For instance, the scholars and monks who participated in the compilation of the book attribute the beginning of the early kingdoms to the development of Buddhism.

However, it is undeniable that *The Glass Palace Chronicle* covers some important content regarding Nat worship in Burmese myths before the Pagan period. Therefore, the concern here is whether it would be possible to disintegrate the narrative line from the perspective of the colonial period and focus on the movements of the historical figures with regard to Nat worship.

For these reasons, instead of discussing Burmese religion and language alone, I locate the cultural interaction within Southwestern Chinese and Southeast Asian overland trade routes. From this approach, we find a new way and new religious legacies in history in chapter 1. First, the acculturation of Buddhism not only reflects the spread of religion and the interaction between foreign religion and indigenous religion, but also the political interdependence between the places that accepted Buddhism. Simultaneously, the political interdependence consequently has an influence on the religious form taken by different political entities. Second, the legacy of indigenous religion in Nanzhao is similar in a way to the legacy of indigenous religion in Burma: shamanism and animism are left in Yunnan and the 37 Nats worship in contemporary Burma. This parallel requires further investigation since both of the indigenous religion have the tradition of worshipping historical figures in the court of the kingdom. What can we further interpret from this coincidence? From this approach within the Southwestern Silk Road, we also see the causative and non-causative verb pairs cognates in Burmese and literary Chinese and find the religious influence from causative suffix in Pali language to Burmese suffix. First, apart from the cognates of the causative and non-causative verb pairs in Burmese and other languages in previous work, there are some verbs that are not regarded as pairs in

modern Burmese even though they share the similar meanings like the causative and non-causative verbs do. Would it be possible to further prove that they are pairs by comparing them with pairs in other languages within the Sino-Tibetan language family from the perspective of phonology and semantics? Second, the introduction of the suffix *-zei-* sometimes leads to ungrammaticality when it goes with a causative verb. Do we see the similar religious influence on other languages along the Southwestern silk road?

I unfold the multiple layers of historical narratives in order to challenge the understanding of historical interactions under the framework of nation-state. Therefore, this thesis offers one possibility to reinterpret the cultural interactions in a broader regional sphere along the overland trade routes. I hope this work that synthesizes the historical sources and linguistics phenomenon will not only open up a new approach to situate the study of Burma within the sphere of Asian history and Sino-Tibetan languages, but also emphasize the importance of Southeast Asian history, culture and languages in interdisciplinary research.

APPENDIX

Table 1 Non-causative and Causative Verb Pairs in The Glass Palace Chronicle

Non-causative	Causative	Meaning	Occurs with the suffix -gyin-ခြင်း	Page number	Number
ကပ်	ခပ်	be near; come close/ reach; attain		43/	1
ကန်း	ခန်း(ခြောက်)	be dry; cease to be productive/dry up; evaporate; cease; be used up	/Yes	/68	2
ကျ	ချ	to fall/ to put down	Yes/	20/11	3*
ကျက်	ချက်(ပြုတ်)	to be cooked/ to cook		14/179	4*
ကျန်	ချန်	remain; be left behind/ leave out; leave behind		33,106/139	5*
ကျေ	ချေ	Be settled; be fully paid; be cancelled out/ pay; settle (debts, accounts); destroy or wipe out completely		48/82	6*
ကျုံ့	ချုံ့	become reduced in size/reduce in size; shrink		/30(2)	7
ကျုံး	ချုံး	Gather up/ summarize		66(2)/45	8
ကြိုး(ပြတ်)	ချိုး	To be broken/ to break	Yes/	144/222	9*

ကျဉ်း	ချဉ်း	Cancel out; narrow/ narrow; abridge		45/94	10*
ကျွတ်	ချွတ်	Be free; drop off/ take off; remove		50/54	11*
ကြေကွဲ	ခြေခွဲ	Be crumbled; be digested/ crush into small pieces or powder	Yes/	253	12
ကြောက်(ကြိမ်း)	(ခြိမ်း)ခြောက်	Be afraid of; be frightened/ frighten; scare	Yes/	12/114	13*
ကြွင်း	ခြွင်း	Remain/ leave out; omit		187,470/	14*
ကြွေ(ကျ)	ခြွေ	Fall; drop; die; pass away/ pluck; strip		231	15*
ကွာ	ခွာ	Become detached; be peeling off/ peel; leave; pull away		47(2)/185,479	16*
ကွေး	ခွေ	Bend; curl; curve/ curl up; go limp; droop	Yes/	103	17
ကွဲ(ပြား)	ခွဲ	To be broken (shatter); be distinct from/ to break; differentiate		154/138	18
ငြိမ်း	ငြှိမ်း	(of fire) die out, be extinguished/ put out; extinguish	Yes/	94	19
စင်း	ဆင်း(သက်)	Be straight, true; stretch out horizontally/		/41	20

		descend from; derive from			
စုတ်	ဆုတ်(ခွါ)	Torn; tattered/ tear; rend; rip		/36,483	21*
စွဲ	ဆွဲ	Attach firmly; be constantly on one's mind; stick to sth./ drag; draw; pull; hold one's attention or interest		134/112	22
စွတ်	ဆွတ်	Soak; wet/ wet		/141	23*
ညိ	ညှိ(ထွန်း)	Catch (fire); become alight/ ignite; light		/119,35(2)	24*
ညပ်	ညှပ်	Be hemmed in; be wedged in between/ sandwich; clamp; put sth. between two things		148	25
ညွှန့်	ညွှန်/ညွှန်း	Be the choicest; be the best/ point out; direct; make a reference to	/Yes	466/64,92	26
ညွတ်	ညွှတ်	fall for somebody; droop/ bend (a stick, a branch)		292/	27*
နစ်(မွန်း)	နှစ်(သက်)	Be drowned; be completely absorbed/ immerse; dip	Yes/	131/43	28*
နံ့	နှံ့	Give off an offensive smell/ spread out		/108	29

နိပ်	နှိပ်(နှင်း)	Be suppressed/ press	/Yes	/15	30
နိမ့်ကျ	နှိမ့်ချ	Be lower; be shorter/ belittle	/Yes	77/43	31*
နိုး	နှိုး	Wake up/ awaken someone		91	32*
ဝိ	ဖိ(စီး)	Be pressed down/ press; flatten		144	33*
ပယ်	ဖယ်	Reject; debar; turn down/ push aside; set aside		2/235	34*
ပေါ်	ဖော်	Appear/expose ; reveal	Yes/Yes	12/	35*
ဟော	ဖော	be afloat; emerge; be prominent/be swollen; be bloated; be plentiful		/13(2)	36
ပေါက်	ဖောက်	Be breached; be broken; be pierced/ bore a hole; perforate; open up	/Yes	284/119, 15(2)	37*
ပုန်း	ဖုံး	Hide/ cover; conceal or hide	/Yes	88/122	38
ပွား	ဖွား	Grow or increase in number; proliferate/ give birth to	Yes/	9/23	39
ပွင့်	ဖွင့်	Blossom; bloom; be open/ open		2/34	40*
ပျော့	ဖျော့	Soft; weak/ relax		78	41

ပျော်	ဖျော်	Be happy, glad, amused; melt/ amuse; dissolve	Yes/	/287	42*
ပုံ့	ဖျန်း	Spread; diffuse/ sprinkle; blow		/149	43
ပျက်	ဖျက်	To be broken/ to break		10/11	44*
ပျက်စီး	ဖျက်ဆီး	Be destroyed; be wrecked/ destroy; ruin	Yes/Yes	85/1	45
ပျောက်	ဖျောက်	Be cured; be healed; disappear/ make sth. disappear; make sth. go away	/Yes	201/94	46*
ပြည့်	ဖြည့်	To be full/ to fill	Yes/	119/89	47*
ပြေ	ဖြေ	Be appeased; be satisfied/answer, solve; ease, reconcile	/Yes	/25(2)	48*
ပြေပျောက်	ဖြေဖျောက်	Be appeased; be settled, paid up/ solve; lessen; alleviate		/74	49
ပြတ်	ဖြတ်	To be cut off/ to cut	Yes/	6/329	50*
ပြို(ကွဲ/ပျက်)	ဖြို	To be collapsed/ to demolish	/Yes	179,76(2)/31, 75(2)	51*
ပြန့်(ပွား)/ပုံ့(လွင့်)	ဖြန့်	Spread/ spread; spread out; distribute		33/109,40(2)	52*
ပြုတ်	ဖြုတ်	To be detached/ to take off		12(2)/37(2)	53*

မိ	မို့	Be within/ lean against; base on some fact or evidence	/Yes	278/47	54
မည်	မှည့်	Be called; be named/ name		4/28	55
မျော	မျှော	Float; drift/ set adrift		144/166	56*
မြောက်	မြှောက်	Be high; be tossed up/ raise; elevate	Yes/Yes	16/66	57*
မြင့်	မြှင့်	Be high/ raise; elevate	Yes/Yes	236,18(2)/124	58*
မြုပ်	မြှုပ်	Sink; be submerged/ embed; submerge		/86	59*
ရွေ့	ရှေ့	Move; be displaced/ move or shift sth.		193/	60*
လန့်	လှန့်	Be startled; be afraid of/ scare; frighten	Yes/	144	61*
လန်း	လှန်း	fresh; be refreshed/ dry (sth) in the sun		/3(2)	62
လဲ	လှဲ	Exchange; fall down/ fell; lie down		169/	63*
လည်	လှည့်	Go around/ to turn		60/13	64*
လုပ်	လှုပ်	Do; work; make/ move; shake; quake	Yes/Yes	/132	65
လွဲ	လွှဲ	Miss; be wrong/ turn away; make mistake		314/190	66
လွတ်	လွှတ်	Be free from/ set free; release	/Yes	141/15	67*

လျော့(ပါး/ကျ)	လျှော့	Be reduced/ to reduce		48,485,73(2)/ 86	68*
လွင့်	လှွင့်	Be blown away/ spread; disseminate; fly		/262	69
ဝဲ့	ဝ့ဲ့	float; hang/ whirl		/8(2)	70*

Note: The pairs with * appear in John Okell's list in *A Reference Grammar of Colloquial Burmese*.

REFERENCES

Backus, Charles. *The Nan-Chao Kingdom and T'ang China's Southwestern Frontier*. Cambridge [Cambridgeshire]: Cambridge University Press, 1981.

Bentor, Yael, and Meir, Shahar. *Chinese and Tibetan Esoteric Buddhism*. Studies on East Asian Religions: Volume 1. Leiden; Boston: Brill, 2017.

Burma Sa taṅ‘″ nhaṅ‘′ Cā nay‘ jaṅ‘″ lup‘ ṅan‘″ (The Royal Historical Commission). *Mhan‘ Nan‘″ Mahā Rājavaṅ‘ To‘ Krī″* [*The Glass Palace Chronicle*]. [Ran‘ kun‘ Mrui′]: Pran‘ krā″ re″ Van‘ krī″ Ṭhāna, Sa taṅ‘″ nhaṅ‘′ Cā nay‘ jaṅ‘ lup‘ ṅan‘″, 1992.

Cai, Xiangyang (蔡向陽). “Lun MianYu Dong Ci De Shi Dong Fan Chou 論緬語動詞的使動範疇 [The Theory of Burmese Causative Verb].” *Jie Fang Jun Wai Guo Yu Xue Yuan Xue Bao* (解放軍外國語學院學報) 28, no. 6 (2005): 43-48.

Charney, Michael W. *Powerful Learning: Buddhist Literati and the Throne in Burma's Last Dynasty, 1752-1885.* Ann Arbor: Centers for South and Southeast Asian Studies, University of Michigan, 2006.

Cœdès, George. *The Indianized States of Southeast Asia*. Honolulu: East-West Center Press, 1968.

DuBois, Thomas David, ed. *Casting Faiths: Imperialism and the Transformation of Religion in East and Southeast Asia.* Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan, 2009.

Fang, Guoyu (方国瑜). *Dian Shi Lun Cong* 滇史論叢 [The Anthology on the History of Yunnan]. Shanghai: Shanghai ren min chu ban she, 1982.

Fang, Guoyu(方國瑜) and Chaomin Lin (林超民). *Fang Guoyu Wen Ji* 方國瑜文集 [The Collected Works of Fang Guoyu]. Kunming: Yunnan jiao yu chu ban she, 2001.

Gair, James W, and Ḍabliv. Es Karuṇātilaka. *A New Course in Reading Pāli: Entering the Word of the Buddha.* Delhi: Motilal Banarsidass Publishers, 1998.

Gu, Yuejuan (谷跃娟). *Nanzhao Shi Gai Yao* 南诏史概要 [A Summary of the History of Nanzhao]. Kunming Shi: Yunnan da xue chu ban she, 2007.

Hansen, Valerie. *The Silk Road: A New History with Documents*. New York: Oxford University Press, 2017.

He, Xinhua (何新華). "*Tang Dai Miandian Xianyue Yanjiu* 唐代緬甸獻樂研究 [The Research on Burmese music performance in the Tang Dynasty]." 東南亞研究 (*Journal of Southeast Asian Studies*) no. 3 (2013): 103-106.

He, Yaohua (何耀华), *Yunnan Tongshi* 雲南通史 [The History of Yunnan]. Beijing: China Social Science Publishing House, 2011.

Htin Aung. *Folk Elements in Burmese Buddhism.* London, 1962.

Judson, Adoniram, Robert C Stevenson, and F. H Eveleth. *Judson's Burmese English Dictionary*. 3. ʾa krim‘. Ran‘ kun‘: Nhac‘ khraṅ‘ʹSāsanā Puṃ nhip‘ Thut‘ ve reʺṬhāna, 1986.

Lammerts, Dietrich. "Buddhism and Written Law: Dhammasattha Manuscripts and Texts in Premodern Burma." PhD Thesis, Cornell University, 2010.

Latter, Thomas. A Grammar of the Language of Burmah. New Delhi: Asian Educational Services, 1991.

Lewis, Mark Edward. *China's Cosmopolitan Empire: The Tang Dynasty*. Cambridge, Mass.: Belknap Press of Harvard University Press, 2009.

Li, Fang (李昉). *Tai Ping Yu Lan* 太平御覽 [Taiping Imperial Encyclopaedia]. Shanghai: Shang wu yin shu guan, 1935.

Li, Kunsheng (李昆声), and Qingfu Qi (祁庆富). *Nanzhao Shi Hua* 南詔史話 [History of Nanzhao]. Beijing: Wen wu chu ban she, 1984.

Liu, Xu (劉昫). *Jiu Tang Shu* 舊唐書 [The Old Tang History]. Beijing: Zhonghua shu ju, 1975.

Liu, Zhenqian (刘振乾). "*Pusaman Dui Wu Kao* 菩萨蛮队舞考 [An Investigation of *Pusaman* Dance Groups]." *Journal of Nanhua University* (南华大学学报): *Page of Social science*(社会科学版) 13, no. 2 (2012): 107-110.

Lu, Zhongmin. *China's Southwestern Silk Road.* Beijing: Foreign Languages Press, 2002.

Luce, G. H. *Phases of Pre-Pagán Burma: Languages and History.* Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1985.

Nalanda-Sriwijaya Centre, and Early Myanmar and its Global Connections, eds. John N. Miksic, Geok Yian Goh, and Michael Aung-Thwin. *Bagan and the World: Early Myanmar and Its Global Connections.* Singapore: ISEAS, 2018.

Okell, John. *A Reference Grammar of Colloquial Burmese*. London: Oxford University Press, 1969.

Okell, John, and Anna Allott. *Burmese/Myanmar Dictionary of Grammatical Forms*. Richmond: Curzon, 2001.

Okell, John. "Nissaya Burmese." *Lingua* 15, (1965): 186-227.

Ouyang, Xiu (歐陽修), and Yongnian Huang (黃永年). *Xin Tang Shu* 新唐書 [The New Tang History]. Shanghai: Han yu da ci dian chu ban she, 2004.

Phan, John. "Lacquered Words: The Evolution of Vietnamese Under Sinitic Influences from the 1st Century BCE through the 17th Century CE." PhD Thesis, Cornell University, 2013.

Thein-Tun. "Meaning Base for Structure: A Re-Examination of Verbs in Burmese." *Pacific Linguistics. Series A. Occasional Papers* 83, (1995): 173-192.

Schafer, Edward H. *The Vermilion Bird: T'Ang Images of the South.* Berkeley: University of California Press, 1967.

Stargardt, Janice. *Tracing Thought through Things: The Oldest Pali Texts and the Early Buddhist Archaeology of India and Burma*. Amsterdam: Royal Netherlands Academy of Arts and Sciences, 2000.

Temple, Richard Carnac, and Thve˝Han‘. *Mran‘ Mā' Mi Rui˝pha Lā Dha Le˝nat‘ Saṃuiṅ‘˝: 37Maṅ‘˝Mran‘ Mā Nuiṅ‘ Ṅaṃ n* Kyaṅ‘˝suṃ˝so Nat‘ Pūjo‘ so Dha Le˝myā˝* [The Burmese Tradition and the History of the 37 Nats]. Ran‘ kun‘: Cā pe Mit‘ chve Cā pe, 1981.

Wang, Jilin (王吉林). *Tang Dai Nanzhao Yu Li Tang Guan Xi Zhi Yan Jiu* 唐代南詔與李唐關係之研究 [Studies of the Li Tang Courts relations with Nanzhao during the Tang Dynasty]. Taibei: Dong wu da xue, 1976.

Wang, Pu (王溥). *Tang Hui Yao* 唐會要 [Tang Compendium of Government and Social Institutions]. Shanghai: Shang wu yin shu guan, 1936.

Wang, Qixing (王启兴). *Jiao Bian Quan Tang Shi* 校編全唐詩 [The Edited Complete Poems of the Tang]. Wuhan: Hubei ren min chu ban she, 2001.

Wicks, Robert Sigfrid. *Money, Markets, and Trade in Early Southeast Asia: the Development of Indigenous Monetary Systems to AD 1400*. Ithaca, N.Y.: Southeast Asia Program, Cornell University, 1992.

Wu, Jialun (伍加伦), and Yuxiang Jiang (江玉祥). *Gu Dai Xi Nan Si Chou Zhi Lu Yan Jiu* 古代西南絲綢之路研究 [Research on the Ancient Southwestern Silk Road]. Chengdu: Sichuan da xue chu ban she, 1990.

Xiang, Da. *Man Shu Jiao Zhu* 蠻書校注 [The Annotation of the Book of *Man*]. Beijing: Zhonghua shu ju, 1962.

Xiao Zhengwei (肖正伟). "*Piao Guo Yue Yu Pu Sa Man Kao Shi*《骠国乐》与《菩萨蛮》考释 [An Interpretation of "The Music from Pyu" and "Pusaman"]." *Min Zu Yin Yue* (民族音乐) no. 1 (2009): 15-16.

Yang, Bin. *Between Winds and Clouds: The Making of Yunnan (Second Century BCE to Twentieth Century CE).* New York: Columbia University Press, 2009.

Yang, Shen (楊愼), and Wei Hu (胡蔚). *Nanzhao Ye Shi* 南詔野史 [The Unofficial History of Nanzhao]. Taibei Shi: Cheng wen chu ban she, 1967.

Yang, Xianyi (楊憲益). *Ling Mo Xin Jian* 零墨新箋 [Meaningless Ink on New Bamboo]. Beijing: Beijing zhong xian tuo fang ke ji fa zhan you xian gong si, 2012

Zhongguo she hui ke xue yuan Yu yan yan jiu suo (中國社會科學院語言研究所). *Li Shi Yu Yan Xue Yan Jiu Di Shi Er Ji* 歷史語言學研究第十二輯 [Historical Linguistics Volume 12]. 北京:商務印書館 (Beijing: Shang wu yin shu guan), 2018.