

## A FOREIGN INVESTMENT: INDIES MALAY TO 1901

John Hoffman

The promotion of Malay by the Netherlands Indies administration during the seventeenth to nineteenth centuries to a point where the language became a standardized instrument of quasi-national identity was a notable divergence from the imperial norm. By contrast, the Portuguese, Spanish, English, and French colonialists elsewhere imposed their own languages, which in many cases have persisted after the formal end of colonialism as virtual national languages, or at least as vehicles for communication with the outside world.

The fact that Dutch did not play this role in Indonesia is sometimes viewed as the result of a singular and intentional colonial policy to enhance Dutch "prestige" by withholding use of the Dutch language from the Indonesian peoples. Proponents of such a view can point to the attitudes of some nineteenth century Dutch officials on Java who insisted on addressing their indigenous bureaucratic associates in *dienstmaleisch* (service [officialese]-Malay) or *brabbelmaleisch* (gibberish-Malay), and, if occasionally they used Dutch, they made clear their expectation that replies should be in High Javanese or Malay.<sup>1</sup>

During the same period, however, certain eminent Dutch philologists, who were then concerned over the future of Dutch rule in the archipelago, regarded the fear of a loss of prestige through widespread use of the Dutch language as mere prejudice--in the words of one of them "a vampire, a night spook."<sup>2</sup> More importantly, the central administration itself at this time strongly condemned (and sought to prevent) an exclusive wall being built around the Dutch language, labeling such attempts as another manifestation of those encumbering "respect-customs" (*hormatgebruiken*) by which Dutch officials tried to maintain for themselves a special place in the Javanese social hierarchy.<sup>3</sup> Refusal by the Dutch to use their native language as the *diensttaal* (service language) in conversations with indigenous officials was, in

---

<sup>1</sup>Raden Adjeng Kartini, January 12, 1900, to Mejuffrouw E. H. Zeehandelaar, in *Door Duisternis tot Licht*, ed. J. H. Abendanon (The Hague: "Luctor et Emergo," 1912), pp. 33, 34, 36. See also C. Snouck Hurgronje to Governor-General, Batavia, May 20, 1902, in *Ambtelijke Adviezen van C. Snouck Hurgronje, 1889-1936*, ed. E. Gobée en C. Adriaanse (The Hague: Nijhoff, 1959), 2, pp. 1562-63.

<sup>2</sup>Jan ten Hove, "De taalquaestie in de Minahasse," *De Indische Gids* (hereafter *IG*), 15, 2 (1893), p. 1629. See also the comments on H. Kern's speech to the Netherlands Literary Congress at Dordrecht in "Maandelijksche Revue van Brochures en van Tijdschrift- en Dagbladartikelen," *IG*, 19, 2 (1897), pp. 1342-43.

<sup>3</sup>*Bijblad op het Staatsblad van Nederlandsch-Indië* [hereafter *BSNI*] (Batavia: Landsdrukkerij, 1907), No. 6496, pp. 265-66. See also *BSNI* (1910), No. 7029, pp. 120-21.

fact, assumed by the Javanese in the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries to be an elaboration of their own system of social stratification through *taalsoorten* (language levels).<sup>4</sup>

By the beginning of the twentieth century, where this paper ends, service-Malay was so recognized as the administrative language of the Indies that seventy years later the Indonesian government could refer to the form given to it in 1901 by Charles Adriaan van Ophuijsen<sup>5</sup> as Bahasa Indonesia.<sup>6</sup> This arresting retrospective labeling in fact obscures the complex history of the language, to whose shape and status the Dutch made a central contribution. Indies Malay was in reality the outcome of centuries of controversy about when and how Dutch, Portuguese, High or Low Malay, Javanese, and many other Indies vernacular tongues were to be used in trading stations, churches, diplomatic dealings and, later on, in both territorial government and the production of agricultural exports.

The character of this controversy was decisively marked by the specific language situations that existed and developed around the two principal early concentrations of Dutch enterprise--Ambon and Batavia.

In Ambon, clergy of the Dutch United East India Company at first tried to disseminate the Dutch language through both general and religious instruction, and by 1627 a considerable amount of Dutch was evidently being spoken in as many as sixteen schools on Ambon.<sup>7</sup> As early as 1618, however, it was noticed that the Dutch learned in schools was soon forgotten by the children because few opportunities existed for its further cultivation. Even in the apparently successful year of 1627, there were complaints that children aged ten and eleven were being taken out of school and then forgetting what Dutch they had acquired.<sup>8</sup> An apparent solution to these problems and the language complexity of the Ambon area was suggested by Malay, which traders from the Malacca Straits had introduced into the Spice Islands from about the mid-fifteenth century<sup>9</sup> and which by the early seventeenth century

---

<sup>4</sup>Kartini to Zeehandelaar, in *Door Duisternis*, p. 34.

<sup>5</sup>Ch. A. van Ophuijsen, *Kitab Logat Melajoe. Woordenlijst voor de Spelling der Malaische Taal met Latijnsch Karakter* (Batavia: Landsdrukkerij, 1901). This was given statutory force in the following year. See *BSNI* (1904), No. 5821, pp. 78-79.

<sup>6</sup>"Sedjak peraturan edjaan Bahasa Indonesia dengan huruf Latin ditetapkan pada tahun 1901 berdasarkan konsep Ch. A. van Ophuysen," *Pedoman Edjaan Bahasa Indonesia yang Disempurnakan* (Jakarta: Departemen Pendidikan dan Kebudayaan Republik Indonesia, 1972), p. i.

<sup>7</sup>François Valentyn, "Omstandig verhaal van de geschiedenissen en zaaken het kerkelyke ofte den godsdienst betreffende, zoo in *Amboina*, als in alle de eylanden, daar onder behoorende," *Oud en Nieuw Oost-Indiën* (Dordrecht, Amsterdam: n.p., 1726), 3, 1, pp. 35-36, 38, 40, 41, 44.

<sup>8</sup>*Ibid.*, pp. 40, 44.

<sup>9</sup>The earlier prevailing view that Antonio Pigafetta had simply acquired his list of 450 Malay words while his ship was anchored in the roads off Tidore between November 8 and December 21, 1521, has been modified by at least three significant recent findings: (1) in the Ternate-Tidore area of the Moluccas at the period of Pigafetta's visit Riau-Malay was generally used as an intermediary language for dealing with foreign traders, most notably Straits Malays and Portuguese, as the spice

was generally, if imperfectly, understood by the Ambonese.<sup>10</sup> Many Dutchmen soon came to regret the lack of persistence of the efforts to make Dutch the local lingua franca,<sup>11</sup> and their numbers had multiplied by the early eighteenth century, when a rending sixty-year controversy was waged over whether High or Low Malay was to be the language of preaching and of the standard Indies Bible.

Even before Batavia's inception in 1619, then, the Dutch were resorting to the use of Malay in the eastern end of the archipelago as well as in their dealings with the Malay-speaking ports of the western region. The growing use of Malay in Batavia, however, was the outcome of rather different factors. The settlement itself was isolated from the Sundanese- and Javanese-speaking interior by formidable physical barriers.<sup>12</sup> This isolation was reinforced administratively by the Company for strategic reasons<sup>13</sup> and became an irremovable tradition under colonial rule.<sup>14</sup> As a result, neither the Javanese nor Sundanese

---

trade was controlled by merchants from Malacca and Johor, many of whom had married into local ruling families; (2) Malay was nonetheless so poorly known that even scribes who had to write it for the infant Sultan of Tidore in 1521 and 1522 showed that they were "certainly very imperfectly acquainted with it"; (3) although he may have composed his Malay word-list off Tidore, Pigafetta was probably using Malay with several people on board. See C. O. Blagden, ed. and trans., "Two Malay Letters from Ternate in the Moluccas, Written in 1521 and 1522," *Bulletin of the School of Oriental Studies*, London Institution [hereafter *BSOS*], 6 (1930-32), pp. 87-101; and C. C. F. M. le Roux, "Nogmaals Pigafetta's Maleische woorden," *Tijdschrift voor Indische Taal-, Land- en Volkenkunde* [hereafter *TBG*], 79, 3 (1939), pp. 447-51. See also C. O. Blagden, "Corrigenda to Malay and Other Words Collected by Pigafetta," *The Journal of the Royal Asiatic Society of Great Britain and Ireland* [hereafter *JRAS*] (1931), pp. 857-61; W. Kern, "Waar verzamelde Pigafetta zijn Maleise woorden?" *TBG*, 78, 2 (1938), pp. 271-73; J. Gonda, "Pigafetta's Vocabularium van het 'Molukken-Maleisch,'" *Bijdragen tot de taal-, land- en volkenkunde* [hereafter *BKI*], 97 (1938), pp. 101-24; R. A. Skelton, trans. and ed., *Magellan's Voyage: A Narrative Account of the First Circumnavigation by Antonio Pigafetta* (New Haven, London: Yale University Press, 1969), 1, pp. 113-30.

<sup>10</sup>Ibid. See also Valentyn, "Omstandig verhaal," p. 36.

<sup>11</sup>Ibid., pp. 35-36, 40. The relevant passage referred to on p. 40 purports to be part of a quoted report written by the second *predikant* [clergyman] on Ambon (who arrived in 1618), recounting his efforts to build on the Dutch-language instruction given by his predecessor.

<sup>12</sup>On the swamps and jungles around Batavia then and the limited contact with the ethnic groups of the interior, see the descriptions collected in Dr. F. de Haan, *Priangan, De Preanger-Regentschappen onder het Nederlandsch Bestuur tot 1811* (Batavia: Genootschap van Kunsten en Wetenschappen, 1912), 3, pp. 5-8. These conditions are further clarified in the narrative of Van Riebeeck's expedition to the south coast at Wijnkoopsbaai in 1711, for which see *ibid.* (1911), 2, pp. 330-66, esp. p. 359.

<sup>13</sup>The policy of preventing consolidated settlements of indigenous groups close to Batavia began long before the aftermath of the siege of 1629. For its small beginning, see the "Accoord gemaakt tusschen den Koning van Jakatra, en Pieter van den Broeke, Commandeur . . . onderteekend in 't Fort Jakatra den 19 January 1619," in Valentyn, *Oud en Nieuw Oost-Indiën*, 4, 1, pp. 436, 437. See also p. 434.

<sup>14</sup>See Valentyn, "Zaaken van den godsdienst op het eyland Java," *Oud en Nieuw Oost-Indiën*, 4, 2, p. 69. See also G. H. Werndly, "Maleische Boekzaal," *Maleische*

language was really viable in the colonial capital. The effective competitors were Malay, Dutch and Portuguese. From 1620 on, Malay and Dutch were the languages of the Reformed Religion in Batavia.<sup>15</sup> But, despite viceregal opposition, Portuguese was also widely used in Batavian church services from 1634.<sup>16</sup> The Portuguese language had been spread by a work-force recruited around the Arabian Sea, the Bay of Bengal and in the Moluccas, and the number of Portuguese speakers was sizeably augmented by the forcible transportation of people from Malacca after its fall to the Dutch in 1641. Widespread use of Portuguese among household slaves had already led to the undermining of the Dutch language within Dutch homes, to the point that special inducements had to be offered to the slaves to learn the language.<sup>17</sup> Indeed among non-Dutch Christian groups in Batavia, the main struggle was between Malay- and Portuguese-speaking congregations. From this conflict eventually emerged the identification of Malay with the aspiration to build "a common indigenous Church."

Although the philological polemicist and cleric François Valentyn, who arrived in Ambon in 1680, was to lament the social precedence accorded to *predikanten* (clergymen) in the Indies who adhered exclusively to the Dutch language,<sup>18</sup> by the early decades of the eighteenth century the Company's preference for Malay in mercantile and administrative matters had made that language accepted as a responsibility and mark of Dutch rule.<sup>19</sup> The active energies of Indies Christendom in the early creative period were, in fact, heavily engaged in establishing a printed standard for Malay in Western script.

The Company, however, also played a discriminating and unmercantile role in the debate over the merits of High versus Low Malay taken up in the Netherlands from arguments initially raised in Ambon and Batavia. According to Valentyn, from at least 1660 "those of Batavia" had been promoting High Malay, and in 1677 and 1678 they sent out orders for it to be used rather than the "low, common and intelligible

---

*Spraakkunst uit de eige schriften der Maleiers opgemaakt* (Amsterdam: n.p., 1736), p. 249.

Even in 1789, the renowned navigator William Bligh noted that: "It is perhaps from hence that Java and Batavia are spoken of as Two seperate [*sic*] places, for a Dutchman always make [*sic*] a distinction between them & it is a Common expression, are you going to Java or Batavia? as if Batavia was not in Java." See O. Rutter, ed., *Bligh's Voyage in the Resource from Coupang to Batavia* (London: Golden Cockerel Press, 1937), p. 86. For the lingual effects of this apartness, see H. N. van der Tuuk's "Voorrede" and "Aan den lezer," in H. N. van der Tuuk, ed., *Bijdrage tot de kennis van 't Bataviasch [*sic*] Maleisch door Dr. J. D. Homan, in leven Ambtenaar ter Algemeene Secretarie te Batavia* (Zalt-Bommel: Noman & Zoon, 1867).

<sup>15</sup>Valentyn, "Zaaken van den godsdienst," p. 6.

<sup>16</sup>S. Kalff, "Een doode indische taal," *IG*, 36, 2 (1914), p. 954.

<sup>17</sup>*Ibid.*, pp. 955-56.

<sup>18</sup>See Valentyn, "Zaken van den godsdienst," p. 113.

<sup>19</sup>The scrupulosity of Dutch care for Malay was already so developed in Valentyn's time that he admitted to being criticized on the ground ". . . dat 't Maleitsch in myne afschriften niet eenparig, ook te veel na 't Nedertuutsch geschikt, en daarom niet goed was." "Omstandig verhaal," p. 111.

(although degenerate) language."<sup>20</sup> Further, in a letter sent in October 1685 by the Company's Directors in the Netherlands, "their Nobilities charged, concerning the Malay language, that now in Batavia and elsewhere had been very much corrupted, that it should be restored to its old purity."<sup>21</sup> This curious concern by a merchant aristocracy for a learned reconstruction of the contact-language in so remote a trading domain was buttressed by an order for the purchase and dispatch to the Netherlands of books "in the pure Malay language," particularly those concerned with Indies history.<sup>22</sup>

The major, although not necessarily the most cogent, account of the High- and Low-Malay dispute that was canvassed between the Moluccas, Batavia, and the Netherlands during the period from about 1677 to 1737<sup>23</sup> is from Valentyn,<sup>24</sup> whose partisanship and indefatigable self-justification cannot diminish the consciousness which he reveals of the consequences of the dispute. He was essentially opposed to the standardization and unification of the Malay language, and his work survives as testimony to his unsuccessful efforts. His major opponents were active linguists among the Company's clerics, whose power was sustained by family ties to the Indies establishment, and who were advantaged by access to official printing facilities in Batavia and the Netherlands.<sup>25</sup> They were convinced that unity and "purity" in Malay were desirable in the interests of Christian-Dutch ascendancy in the archipelago. The deliberation with which they prosecuted this policy which required much application of scholarship, time, and money in Asia and Europe is demonstrated in the mass of data which Valentyn produced in his intended rebuttal.

Valentyn's argument for Low Malay was that its flexible, local adaptability served the ends which he, as a clergyman employed by the Company, was supposed to serve. In language meant to influence contemporaries, especially church assemblies in Europe and the Indies, he

---

<sup>20</sup>Ibid., pp. 57, 78. A translation of the catechism was received but not used by the Ambon Council of Churches--"probably," wrote Valentyn, "because this Malay of the Reverend [Dominee] Roman was a little too high, and indeed not as intelligible in Ambon as that of Reverend Danckaerts."

<sup>21</sup>Valentyn, "Zaaken van den godsdienst," p. 75.      <sup>22</sup>Ibid.

<sup>23</sup>The period opens with the "High Malay" order from Batavia to Ambon in 1677, and closes, after G. H. Werndly's accomplishment in his Bible translation and his *Maleische Spraakkunst* [see below, p. 71], with his *Oratio Inauguralis*, delivered on December 17, 1737, at Lingen. See "II. Georgii Henrici Werndly. Oratio Inauguralis de linguarum Orientalium et indicarum cognitione necessaria theologo ad Indos profecturo," *Tempe Helvetica, Dissertationes atque Observationes theologicas, philologicas, criticas, historicas, exhibens*, 4 vols. (Ex Officina Heideggeriana, 1740), 4.

<sup>24</sup>See Werndly, "Maleische Boekzaal," esp. pp. 240-65, 304-5, 318-21.

<sup>25</sup>For example, the official High Malay Bible translation that Petrus van der Vorm took over in 1701 after the death of Leydekker (see Valentyn, "Zaaken van den godsdienst," p. 89); the familial connections between Leydekker and Governor de Haas, of Ambon (see Valentyn, "Omstandig verhaal," pp. 79, 80, 82, and 90), and between Van der Vorm and Nicolaas Hodenpyl (ibid., p. 90), allegedly serving the High-Malay cause. According to Valentyn, the "High Malay" group's family links continued to be significant into the Viceroyalty of Abraham van Riebeeck (1709-13). Ibid., pp. 90 and 103.

alleged that Batavia was forcing an artificial "High Malay" upon areas where a form of Low Malay, or no Malay at all, had been spoken before.

Valentyn's evidence can be seen to bear upon four major and distinct language-policy conflicts:

1. With regard to the value of Dutch as opposed to Malay and all other archipelago languages, he regretted that Dutch had not been persevered with.<sup>26</sup>

2. In Batavia at least, his sympathies were with what he regarded as the working advantages of Portuguese over Malay.<sup>27</sup>

3. With respect to the use of Malay as distinct from Javanese, Chinese, and Portuguese throughout the archipelago, Valentyn believed that many potential Christian converts lay beyond the reach of the Malay and Portuguese languages; he therefore advocated systematic instruction in the four languages mentioned (in addition to Arabic) for religious scholars.<sup>28</sup>

4. With respect to the Low versus High Malay debate, Valentyn criticized what he regarded as a confusion over the tasks of the Company's clerics. If they were to direct their efforts to teaching the inlanders a purer version of the language in use rather than availing themselves of its universal convenience,<sup>29</sup> the Company's Christian enterprise could lose its identification with Malay throughout the Indies.<sup>30</sup> Valentyn himself believed that the Malay-speaking Christians of the archipelago identified themselves, their institution and their larger society by their language.<sup>31</sup>

---

<sup>26</sup>Valentyn, "Omstandig verhaal," pp. 35-36.

<sup>27</sup>Valentyn, "Zaaken van den godsdienst," pp. 99, 101-2, 103-4. Clerical partisans of Portuguese questioned the assumption of the common intelligibility of Malay, and stressed that the Portuguese-language church structure of the Indies was "of greater attachment and fidelity to this State than the Malay." In opposition to this view, clerical supporters of Malay pushed the idea of creating "a common indigenous Church" within what was called "the Church of the Indies" or "the Churches of the Indies." See *ibid.*, pp. 90, 91, 100-5.

<sup>28</sup>He also recommended preparatory Malay-language courses for clerics before they left the Netherlands, so that they could be used in Indies churches of two language-streams on their arrival instead of spending long periods idle. *Ibid.*, p. 7. This recommendation was based on an awareness of the level of scholarship then available in the Netherlands to support, when necessary, new language policies for the archipelago. His awareness probably derived from his acquaintance with Adriaan Reland. See Valentyn, "Omstandig verhaal," p. 112. See also "VI Dissertatio de Veteri Lingua Indica," in Hadriani Relandi, *Dissertationum Miscellanearum* (Utrecht: Willem Broedelet, 1706), 1, esp. pp. 218-27 where Reland, in Latin, compares usages in Malay, Greek, and Persian.

<sup>29</sup>See François Valentyn, *Deure der Waarhyd voor 't ooge der Christen-wereld geopend, waar door klaar te sien is, wat Tale voor alle Malytse Christenen in Oost-Indien, van gebruik, en alleen van dienst zy . . .* (Dordrecht: n.p., 1698), pp. 37-40.

<sup>30</sup>Valentyn, "Omstandig verhaal," p. 111.

<sup>31</sup>In *Deure der Waarhyd*, Valentyn refers, *passim*, and in variant spelling, to "Malijsche Christenen" (pp. 4, 5, 35, 55, 57, 60, 67, 76, 78, 79, 86, and 91). He

The most important outcome of the debate among clerics regarding the relative merits of Low and High Malay, was production of the so-called Leydekker-Werndly<sup>32</sup> Bible translation of 1731-33.<sup>33</sup> Together with Werndly's grammar of 1736 this translation provided enduring standards for religious and general education in areas where the Company and its successor, the Netherlands Indies government, introduced or regulated the Malay language.<sup>34</sup> The two texts, both commissioned by the Company, were the product of a search for standards which involved and linked educational, religious, and community organizations in both the archipelago and the Netherlands in a pattern persistently characteristic of Dutch colonial conduct. In turn, these texts provoked a nineteenth century dispute over the validity of their great influence. Together with the concept of an official dictionary project which the philologist and cleric Melchior Leydekker had initiated during his translation work,<sup>35</sup> they supplied grounds for extension into the nineteenth century of endeavors to match criteria for usage and representation of Malay in the increasingly professionalized educational and administrative services.

In an inaugural lecture which Werndly delivered at the University of Lingen in northwest Germany at the end of 1737, he clarified two of the products of this period of polemics: the Company's symbiotic propagation of Christian education and the Malay language; and the need for better lingual preparation that had been stressed by Valentyn.<sup>36</sup> Soon afterwards, Van Imhoff, even before he became Governor-General, wrote about his awareness of lingual requirements in the

---

identified the "Malijtse Kerken in Indien" (ibid., p. 32); also "'t geheele Malijsche Christendom" (p. 4), "'t geheel Malijtse Christendom" (p. 7), and "het gansch Malijs Christendom" (p. 59).

<sup>32</sup>For the various stages of Melchior Leydekker's approach to and involvement in the work, see Valentyn's "Zaaken van den godsdienst," p. 69, and his "Omstandig verhaal," pp. 107 and 108. See also Werndly, "Maleische Boekzaal," pp. 249, 252-53.

<sup>33</sup>For an assessment of the influence of the Leydekker-Werndly translation upon Indies-Malay usage, especially in religious education, see N. Graafland, "Het criterium voor geschriften in de Maleische taal," *BKI*, 15 (1868), pp. 407-35, esp. p. 425.

<sup>34</sup>In the field of Malay philology, the Company's influence was apparently intended to be decisive through its financial sponsorship of the Werndly *Maleische Spraakkunst*. In addition to the continuing initiatives taken both by the Directors of the Company and by the Council of the Indies during the whole period, the Synod of North Holland at Enkhuizen, the Synod of Amsterdam and of Walcheren, and the Church Councils of Batavia and of Amboina also intervened actively in the controversy that wound to and fro between the Netherlands and the archipelago. See Valentyn's "Zaaken van den godsdienst," "Omstandig verhaal," and *Deure der Waarhyt*. A useful summary of some of these actions between 1675 and 1733 is contained in Werndly's "Maleische Boekzaal," pp. 249-65.

<sup>35</sup>For the dictionary project inherited from Leydekker, see Valentyn, "Zaaken van den godsdienst," p. 114; H. von Dewall, "Ontwerp van een Maleisch Woordenboek en eene Maleische Spraakkunst," *TBG*, 6, 3 (1857), p. 536; and P. H. van der Kemp, "Uit den tijd van C. P. J. Elout's toewijding aan de Maleische taal," *BKI*, 69 (1914), pp. 185-86.

<sup>36</sup>See note 28.

Company's Indies dispositions, and not solely those that were entrusted to its clergy.<sup>37</sup> Paradoxically, however, it was perhaps the great respect paid to the Leydekker-Werndly Bible and the Werndly grammar<sup>38</sup> as prime materials in religious education, that caused their publication to be followed by a long period of neglect of Malay studies.<sup>39</sup>

\* \* \*

In the mid-eighteenth century a serious decline in the spice trade led the Dutch to lay greater emphasis on cultivation and export of large-scale crops, particularly coffee. Opportunities for export crop cultivation increased when, as the result of a series of treaties with the local Javanese rulers, the Dutch, after 1757, exercised paramount control in the interior of Java. As the importance to the Dutch of the eastern archipelago, particularly Ambon, declined, then, that of Java rose. Now despite the Company's continuing encouragement of High Malay, this language never gained acceptance on Java any more than in other parts of the archipelago among either Indonesians or Europeans.<sup>40</sup> In its place, indigenous rulers and Company administrators groped for mutual comprehension via a usage which after spreading through many protean guises,<sup>41</sup> was to be formally entitled *dienstmaleisch*.<sup>42</sup> At the same time--through the eighteenth century--though Batavia continued the practice of conducting diplomatic negotiations with Javanese rulers in

---

<sup>37</sup>G. G. d'Imhoff, "Considérations sur l'État Présent de la Compagnie Hollandoise des Indes Orientales," in J. P. I. du Bois, *Vies des Gouverneurs Généraux, avec l'Abrégé de l'Histoire des Établissements [sic] Hollandois aux Indes Orientales* (The Hague: Pierre de Hondt, 1763), esp. pp. 41-42, 44-45.

<sup>38</sup>See, for example, the usage in "Ka ųingĳnan kapada Katambāhan ųIndjil," *Kitāb Njānji an ākan depākeĳkan dālam Midras*. (with the publishing ascription rendered as "Tertarā pūla di Rotterdam ųawleh M. Wajt dan ųĀnakh", 1850), p. 3.

On a broader scale: in a letter in 1856 to the Bijbelgenootschap, Van der Tuuk, whose commission was to study Batak and translate the Bible into that language, wrote that he believed that the "wretched" work put into the standard Malay Bible had exerted a "fatal influence" upon translations into other Indies languages. See "52. Brief aan het Bijbelgenootschap van 20 februari 1856," in *Herman Neubronner van der Tuuk. De Pen in Gal Gedoopt*, ed. R. Nieuwenhuys (Amsterdam: van Oorschot, 1962), p. 76.

<sup>39</sup>See N. Graafland, "Het criterium voor geschriften," p. 425.

<sup>40</sup>Van der Tuuk, "Iets over de Hoog-Maleische Bijbelvertaling," p. 172.

<sup>41</sup>For examples of officialese Indies-Malay, in Western script, in the second half of the eighteenth century and the first half of the nineteenth, see A. Meursinge, ed., *Maleisch Leesboek voor eerstbeginnenden en meergevorderden*, 2 (Leiden: Luchtmans, 1845), pp. xv-xvii, xxviii-xxxv. In addition to *hoog-Maleisch* and *laag-Maleisch*, some of the Indies attributives adhering to *Maleisch* have included *ambtelijk-*, *basterd-*, *Bataviaasch-*, *Bataviasche-havenwerken-*, *boeken-*, *brabbel-*, *centralisatie-*, *Christelijk-*, *conventie-*, *couranten-*, *Dienst-*, *haven-*, *Hollands-Ambons-*, *Java-*, *kazerne-*, *klontong-*, *locaal-*, *marine-*, *matrozen-*, *middel-*, *Mohammedaansch-*, *Nieuw-*, *Oost-Javasche-*, *passer-*, *soldaten-*, *spoorwegbeambten-*, *toko-*, *vergaderingen-*, and *waterstaats-Maleisch*.

<sup>42</sup>See H. E. Steinmetz, "Handleiding ten gebruike bij het voorlopig onderzoek in strafzaken . . .," *Tijdschrift voor het Binnenlandsch Bestuur (TBB)*, 38 (1905), pp. 554-55.

Malay,<sup>43</sup> documents in Javanese were also accepted.<sup>44</sup>

The dissolution of the Company at the end of the eighteenth century and related changes in colonial and institutional theory, further affected language developments in the Netherlands Indies. The most striking outcome was the "remarkable decree" of 1811 which called for administrative officials to be acquainted with Javanese and opened a period of strong Javanese language promotion.<sup>45</sup> During the British interregnum (1811-16) Thomas Stamford Raffles, then Lieutenant-Governor of Java, also moved to promote Javanese, emphasizing "the necessity of encouraging and attaining a more general knowledge of the Javanese language," and criticizing the previous situation on the island: "Hitherto the communication with inhabitants of the country has been chiefly through illiterate Interpreters [*sic*], or when direct, through the medium of a barbarous dialect of Malays, confounded and confused by the introduction of Portuguese and Dutch,"<sup>46</sup> Raffles' opinion was echoed by Colonel Colin Mackenzie, chairman of the committee investigating land tenure on Java, who also criticized "the general want of any knowledge of the [Javanese] language by the Dutch inhabitants" and the uselessness of Malay in gaining information directly from Javanese cultivators.<sup>47</sup>

When Dutch rule was restored, the emphasis of the 1811 language decree was renewed in the promotion of the use of Javanese alongside Malay among colonial administrators. The Resolutie of March 25, 1819 and further government measures in 1827, 1837, and 1839 enjoined officials to use Malay and less consistently Javanese.<sup>48</sup>

---

<sup>43</sup>See J. K. J. de Jonge, *De Opkomst van het Nederlandsch Gezag over Java* (The Hague: Nijhoff/Amsterdam: Muller, 1877), 6, pp. 231, 283 for dealings with Banten in Malay, and p. 415 for dealings with the Susuhunan of Surakarta.

<sup>44</sup>See *ibid.*, pp. 176, 196, 240.

<sup>45</sup>See "20 Julij [1811]. Maatregelen ter bevordering van de kennis der Javaansche taal bij civiele ambtenaren," in *Nederlandsch-Indisch Plakaatboek*, ed. J. A. van der Chijs (Batavia, The Hague: n.p., 1897), 16, pp. 715-17. See also G. J. Grashuis, "Over het Javaansch als studievak en als examenvak," *IG*, 33, 2 (1911), pp. 1016-18.

<sup>46</sup>"A Discourse Delivered at a Meeting of the Society of Arts and Sciences in Batavia, on the Twenty-fourth day of April 1813, . . . by the Honourable Thomas Stamford Raffles, President . . .," *Verhandelingen van het [Koninklijk] Bataviaasch Genootschap van Kunsten en Wetenschappen* [hereafter *VBG*], 7 (Batavia, 1814), p. 13. See also H. J. de Graaf, *The Spread of Printing. Eastern Hemisphere. Indonesia* (Amsterdam: Vangendt, 1969), p. 20.

<sup>47</sup>See C. E. Wurtzburg, *Raffles of the Eastern Isles* (London: Hodder and Stoughton, 1954), pp. 243-44, where Mackenzie's "provisional report" to Raffles is quoted. Mackenzie wrote that questions were "necessarily addressed through the Chief and through him put round till it came to the proper person, perhaps the lowest cultivator; the answer coming in the same circuitous mode and with all the inconvenience of rendering through three different languages, Javanese, Malay and Dutch, into English. It may be imagined with how little effect any enquiry could be managed in this way. . . ." See also W. C. Mackenzie, *Colonel Colin Mackenzie, First Surveyor-General of India* (Edinburgh, London: Chambers, 1952), p. 149, and John Bastin, "Colonel Colin Mackenzie and Javanese Antiquities," *BKI*, 109 (1953), pp. 273-75.

<sup>48</sup>See *Staatsblad van Nederlandsch Indië* [hereafter *SNI*], 1819, No. 34; 1827, No. 109; 1837, No. 38; and 1839, No. 38.

The controversy over the relative importance to be assigned to Javanese and Malay in the administration was to run for almost the whole of the nineteenth century. Colonial Minister Jean Chrétien Baud, who in his youth had probably been responsible for the 1811 decree, complained to King Willem II in 1842<sup>49</sup> that Dutch government on Java still offered "the strange and embarrassing spectacle" of only a few officials understanding Javanese, while most officials were unable to undertake an inquiry and to carry out an order without the aid of interpreters who often had an interest in disguising the truth. Complaining that the Low Malay used by Dutch officials was "a *patois* unknown to the great mass of the people," he argued that a dominated people could not, in the long run, be held in subjection without violence unless the controlling power governed with fairness, justice, and respect for institutions, customs, and prejudices of the country; this demanded familiarity with the language, which, in any case, was, administratively, an absolute requisite.<sup>50</sup>

This argument formed part of a debate regarding the training and qualifications for Binnenlandsch Bestuur administrators that focused on changing requirements for entry to the Indies civil service, and for postings on Java and in the Outer Possessions.<sup>51</sup> Consciously responding to the new skills required by the Cultivation system on Java,<sup>52</sup> J. F. C. Gericke founded the Surakarta Institute from 1832 with the goal of affording "young officials the opportunity of obtaining a scholarly knowledge of the Javanese language, to learn to express themselves in it orally and in writing in an intelligible way, and to make themselves acquainted with the laws, the history, and the national institutions of the Javanese."<sup>53</sup> This was only one of a succession of related institutions for Netherlands Indies civil service preparation, which came to include a Chair in Eastern philology, geography, and ethnology in the training school at Delft,<sup>54</sup> a *Rijksinstelling* [government institution] at Leiden,<sup>55</sup> a special division [*Afdeeling B*] teaching similar courses at Batavia's Willem III Gymnasium<sup>56</sup> an *Indische Instelling* at Delft; a Leiden University role taken over from the Rijks-

---

<sup>49</sup>Baud's report to the King, dated June 28, 1842, appears in *Historische Nota over het Vraagstuk van de Opleiding en Benoembaarheid voor den Administratieven Dienst in Nederlandsch-Indië* (Batavia: Landsdrukkerij, 1900), p. 23.

<sup>50</sup>*Ibid.*

<sup>51</sup>These requirements were interwoven with Netherlands and Netherlands Indies decrees evidencing an extraordinary symbiosis of scholarship with the metropolitan politics of a colonizing state. For the decrees issued between 1842 and 1916, see *SNI*, 1843, No. 12; 1859, No. 58; 1862, No. 83; *Staatsblad van het Koninkrijk der Nederlanden* [hereafter *SKN*], 1863, No. 50; 1864, No. 71; *SNI*, 1864, No. 194; *SKN*, 1871, No. 72; *SNI*, 1873, No. 19; *SKN*, 1876, No. 102; *SNI*, 1877, No. 187; 1878, No. 196; 1883, No. 249; 1893, No. 257; *SKN*, 1907, No. 71; *SNI*, 1916, No. 480.

<sup>52</sup>See P. Mijer, *Jean Chrétien Baud geschetst door Mr. P. Mijer* (Utrecht: Kemink & Zoon, 1878), p. 564.

<sup>53</sup>*SNI*, 1834, No. 66, p. 137.

<sup>54</sup>See *SNI*, 1843, No. 12.

<sup>55</sup>See *SKN*, 1864, No. 71.

<sup>56</sup>See under the entry "Opleiding van administratieve ambtenaren (Indische Bestuurs-)," in *Encyclopaedie van Nederlandsch-Indië* (The Hague, Leiden: Nijhoff/Brill, 1919), 3, p. 168.

instelling;<sup>57</sup> a Leiden municipal institution similar to that at Delft;<sup>58</sup> and a Netherlands Indies administrative college in The Hague.<sup>59</sup> In the academy at Delft, Javanese was regarded "as the one necessary [language] beside which all the rest were deemed of no or secondary importance."<sup>60</sup> As late as 1888, two professors who had completed their training for Indies service in the 1860s, recalled "the absolute domination" by Javanese over all other subjects that had been taught at the Delft Academy.<sup>61</sup>

Nevertheless, towards the end of the century experienced theorists in the field were convinced that the necessary long-term preparation for general administrative contact via the vernaculars had not been undertaken, even for the putative needs of Java at the node of Indies power and development. The Batavia-born linguist and civil servant, A. A. Fokker, declared from Leiden in 1893 that the teaching given for many years in Delft to civil service candidates had lacked the clarity and lucidity that accrued only from direct personal experience of the Javanese language in actual use, and from observation and study of the life of the Javanese people. Everybody who knew Javanese could testify that it was difficult enough for beginners, but those who taught it seemed to make it as difficult as possible for their pupils. It was no wonder, wrote Fokker, citing standards during his own period of tuition, that results, taken generally, were "rather pitiful." "Most young officials of the B.B. [Binnenlandsch Bestuur]," he wrote, "quickly gave up speaking Javanese after some desperate attempts--if they ever made them--, and spoke *klontong-Maleisch* (the so-called *dienst-Maleisch*)."<sup>62</sup>

Doubts about officials ever being able to implement their theoretical grasp of Javanese was admitted even by proponents of the language, such as Gerhardus Jan Grashuis, a Leiden scholar active in language research and the civil service on Java who harbored a "fervent conviction" that knowledge of Javanese language and literature was a requisite for the official called to sit in judgment over the Javanese. Nevertheless, he wrote, there would always be great difficulty in finding more general acceptance of Javanese among students of Indies subjects. The copiousness of the language meant that much time and tough perseverance were necessary in order to acquire the elements.<sup>63</sup>

---

<sup>57</sup>This was a result of the new dispensations made in Netherlands Higher Education Laws in 1876 and 1877. See *SKN*, 1876, No. 102, p. 75; and 1877, No. 87, p. 57.

<sup>58</sup>P. J. Veth, "Leiden contra Delft in zake de opleiding der Indische Ambtenaren," *IG*, 1, 1 (1879), p. 403.

<sup>59</sup>See *SKN*, 1907, No. 71, esp. pp. 62-63.

<sup>60</sup>Veth, "Leiden contra Delft," p. 597.

<sup>61</sup>Report to Colonial Minister L. W. C. Keuchenius in 1888 by P. A. van der Lith and J. Spanjaard, in *Historische Nota*, p. 96. At the Royal Academy in Delft the Javanese language was placed above Malay in the lists of subjects in which instruction was to be given to prospective Indies officials of the first and second classes. *SNI*, 1843, No. 15, pp. 20-21.

<sup>62</sup>A. A. Fokker's review of "Poensen's lees oefeningen," *IG*, 15, 1 (1893), pp. 696-97.

<sup>63</sup>G. J. Grashuis, "De Javaansche Letterkunde," *ibid.*, p. 870.

These misgivings were expressed only a few months before the issuing by royal decree in 1893 of new regulations for the *grootambtenaars-examen* (Indies civil service examination), in which Javanese was given a place beside Malay, and even a preference in qualifications for coveted appointments on Java.<sup>64</sup> This 1893 royal decree should have crowned scholarly and administrative endeavor of more than sixty years to link Netherlands Indies civil service training with primacy for the study of Javanese language and literature. It was, however, greeted with pessimism even from partisans, because of their consciousness of the failure to propagate solid comprehension of Javanese throughout the civil service. Fears of the obvious consequences of an inability to effect basic communication, between Dutch officials and the Javanese at the center of empire, and Dutch discouragement of use of their own language by educated Javanese, tended to force all parties more surely into Malay.

\* \* \*

During the years from 1819 to 1839, against the background of the four official enjoinders on language practice,<sup>65</sup> Malay in Western script and print was being linked with the Indies Government's aim of extending and unifying its control throughout the archipelago. A new perspective on Dutch involvement with Malay was inspired by Dr. Philipus Pieter Roorda van Eysinga, a young veteran of the Battle of Waterloo, who arrived in Batavia in this period. Soon transferred from military service to colonial administration,<sup>66</sup> he brought with him radical ideas about the development of ethnic identity through language. Already by 1824-25 he had published a Dutch-Malay and Malay-Dutch dictionary, which supplemented the Leydekker-Werndly Bible translation and the Werndly grammar, Malay-language contributions which Christian missionaries had provided to Netherlands Indies governance via the school and the congregation.<sup>67</sup>

His effort coincided with officially deplored bureaucratic habits inherited from Company days. Colonial Minister Baud in a report of December 1842 admitted that "making use of the ingrained habit of Low Malay by preference in contacts and conversation with the Javanese is the general, and I do not deceive myself, the continually increasing rule."<sup>68</sup>

By the middle of the nineteenth century, the officialese-Malay of Dutch administration was even supplanting the correspondence-Javanese (*djawarê*) that had long been *de rigueur* among the Javanese Regents, and, in their dealings with foreigners, among the Sundanese-speaking people of the Priangan.<sup>69</sup> This process continued under Governor-General

<sup>64</sup>See *SNI*, 1893, No. 257. <sup>65</sup>See note 48.

<sup>66</sup>*Encyclopaedie van Nederlandsch-Indië*, 3, p. 636.

<sup>67</sup>Graafland, "Het criterium voor geschriften," p. 425.

<sup>68</sup>"Ministerieele dépêche 22 Augustus 1842 no. 21/477" in "Besluit 17 December 1842 no. 13," in the *Historische Nota*, p. 25.

<sup>69</sup>See K. F. Holle, "Dat, en hoe men in 1848 in de Preanger als diensttaal nog Javaansch gebruikte," *TBB*, 4 (1890), pp. 128-30; J. J. Meijer, "Bijdrage tot de kennis van het Bantensch dialect der Soendaneesche taal," *BKI*, 39 (1890), pp. 224, 227; F. de Haan, *Priangan, De Preanger-Regentschappen*, 4, pp. 381-83; Kern, "Een Maleische brief van Nicolaus Engelhard," *BKI*, 101 (1942), p. 207.

Rochussen (1845-51) who issued orders for Malay to be used rather than the vernaculars in dealings with local rulers.<sup>70</sup> The Indies governmental regulation (*Regeringsreglement*) of 1854 included a loosely expressed obligation upon the Governor-General to establish schools for the indigenous population (in addition to providing free education for Europeans "or persons put on the same level"<sup>71</sup>). In the immediately succeeding years, those concerned with implementation in the Indies of concepts drawn from the new Dutch constitution (*Grondwet*) of 1848 tried to use the Malay language as a means for introducing broader and better secular and religious education for inlanders. At the same time, they worked towards a standardized usage and representation of the language that was still printed with clumsy and idiosyncratic variations despite the demands of an increasingly regularized and expanding administration and educational system.

The movement towards standardization of Malay was evident on several levels. Its character was partly influenced by renewed concern about Islamic militancy. Dr. Jan Pijnappel, who taught Malay at the Delft Academy (see above pp. 74-75) and who uneasily and unwillingly worked upon the nineteenth-century revival of the Indies Government's dictionary project,<sup>72</sup> argued in 1860 for much more purposeful harnessing of the Western-script rendering of Malay which Meursinge twenty years earlier had believed would "become more and more customary."<sup>73</sup> He contended that the Arabic alphabet was completely unsuited to writing Malay, and that rules for spelling Malay in Arabic script could not be elucidated without understanding the intimate connection between Arabic language and script. He argued, on orthographical evidence, that the original transcription had, in any case, been effected by the first Arabs to reach Malacca, and that they had been "ignorant." The Malay language had thus adopted Arabicisms, and thereby lost many of its own peculiarities. Use of the script had undoubtedly drawn tighter the connection between peoples to whom the Arabs had given their religion. Pijnappel concluded that "the worst" of it was the pressure of an unwholesome leaven of fanaticism personally acquired by all those who, through knowledge of Arabic script, had access to Arabic culture and the Koran.<sup>74</sup>

Another catalyst in the movement towards standardization of Malay in Western script was an amalgam of philology and a growing consciousness of an Indies identity such that a "lingua franca" justification for Malay had become insufficient. This was the time when the imperial forward movement into the Outer Islands and the imposition of the cultivation system on Java led to the spread and intensification of relations between the government and its subjects. In using philology to assist implementation of new policies bearing on the status of the governed peoples in the archipelago and on the sensitivities now to be

---

<sup>70</sup>J. E. van der Chijs, "Bijdragen tot de geschiedenis van het inlandsch onderwijs in Nederlandsch-Indië, aan officiële bronnen ontleend," *TBG*, 14, 5 (1864), p. 292.

<sup>71</sup>*SKN*, 1854, No. 129, p. 63.

<sup>72</sup>See Von Dewall, "Ontwerp van een Maleisch Woordenboek," pp. 538-39.

<sup>73</sup>A. Meursinge, *Maleisch Leesboek voor eerstbeginnenden en meergevorderden* (Leiden: Luchtman, 1842), pp. iii, v.

<sup>74</sup>J. Pijnappel, "Over het Arabisch-Maleische Alphabet," *BKI*, 7 (1860), pp. 239-42.

taken officially into account, the colonial administration drew on both the Leydekker-Werndly Bible and the concept of a large, standard Malay-Dutch dictionary inherited from the Company era.

Roorda van Eysinga was unsuccessful in his labors to produce such a standard Malay-Dutch dictionary during his second Indies term (from 1843 to 1848).<sup>75</sup> In 1855 H. von Dewall was therefore commissioned to compile it, as well as a Dutch-Malay dictionary and a Malay grammar.<sup>76</sup> Although Malay was the vernacular of Batavia and the immediately surrounding area,<sup>77</sup> in compiling his dictionaries Von Dewall felt obliged to travel extensively, even outside the Netherlands Indies, to establish "pure" and "correct" Malay.<sup>78</sup> The dictionary project was still incomplete at the time of Von Dewall's death in 1873,<sup>79</sup> and the work was seen through the press from 1877 by Van der Tuuk.<sup>80</sup>

Twenty years earlier, in a paper written in 1856<sup>81</sup> Van der Tuuk had not only sought to undermine the worth of the so-called Malay lingua franca used by foreigners, but had also criticized the standards which Leydekker and Werndly had set through their grammar and Bible translation.<sup>82</sup> He now established norms for Malay which included new classifications of Malay usage, especially regarding European influences and dialectal variations. His categorizations contributed to the self-consciously proprietorial attitude of didactic Dutch scholarship towards the language from the mid-nineteenth century on.<sup>83</sup>

In 1866, evidence came from the archipelago itself of the linguistic revival that Van der Tuuk had helped to provoke and would continue

---

<sup>75</sup>See Von Dewall, "Ontwerp van een Maleisch Woordenboek," p. 537.

<sup>76</sup>Von Dewall had been born at Giessen in western Germany in 1807. After service in the Prussian army, he went to the Netherlands in 1828, and embarked for Batavia in October of that year. See *Encyclopaedie van Nederlandsch Indië* (1921), 4, p. 663. (Entry is under "Wall [. . . von de].") See also H. von Dewall, "Ontwerp van een Maleisch Woordenboek en eene Maleische Spraakkunst," *TBG*, 6, 3 (1857), p. 540; and his "De Vormveranderingen der Maleische Taal," *VBG*, 31 (1864), p. 9.

<sup>77</sup>Van der Chijs, "Bijdragen tot de geschiedenis van het Inlandsch Onderwijs," p. 289.

<sup>78</sup>See G. Irwin, *Nineteenth-Century Borneo, A Study in Diplomatic Rivalry* (Singapore: Donald Moore, 1967 [orig. pub. 1955]), pp. 156-57, for an assessment of Von Dewall's performance of this "formidable task."

<sup>79</sup>*Encyclopaedie van Nederlandsch-Indië*, 4, p. 664.

<sup>80</sup>See H. N. van der Tuuk, "Aan den lezer," *Maleisch-Nederlandsch Woordenboek op last van het Gouvernement van Nederlandsch-Indie* (Batavia: Landsdrukkerij, 1877), 1.

<sup>81</sup>H. N. van der Tuuk, "Iets over de Hoog Maleische Bijbelvertaling," *BKI*, 1 (1856), pp. 171-83, esp. pp. 172 and 183.

<sup>82</sup>*Ibid.*, pp. 174-75.

<sup>83</sup>Nieuwenhuys, *Herman Neubronner van der Tuuk*, pp. 5-6. For example, apart from his editing (completed in 1866) of the sixth part of the *Maleisch Leesboek* (which was republished in Leiden in 1875), and his final editing of the government-commissioned *Maleisch-Nederlandsch Woordenboek*, of which part I appeared in 1877, he was already cited reluctantly in 1868, during the Malay schoolbook and public reading-book controversy, as "a great philologist." See N. Graafland, "Het criterium voor geschriften," p. 434.

to spur. This was in the form of two articles published by Hillebrandus Cornelius Klinkert, a Dutch surveyor and Rhine riverboat engineer who had gone to Java in 1856 as a missionary.<sup>84</sup> In one of these, an article on Malay proverbs and saws, Klinkert challenged Malay scholars to ensure that Malay language-study "not lag behind the cultivation of Javanese which in latter years indeed has somewhat too exclusively enjoyed precedence."<sup>85</sup> In a paper completed in Riau a few months later,<sup>86</sup> Klinkert went on to attack both Dutchmen who had been born or had lived long in the Indies and inlanders who thought that they knew how to use Malay. Leaving Javanese and Sundanese books to others, Klinkert examined a dozen successful Malay works, rewarded and published under the school-book and public reading-book bounty system that had been in effect since 1858. His main attack was upon Batavia-dialect Malay, "the local Malay of Java," and "a good harvest of Javanisms," which appeared in most of the prize-winning books instead of the "pure" Malay that ought to have been expected.

Joining the attack on the general depression of standards for which he believed Europeans responsible, Van der Tuuk in the following year (1867) wrote in the Netherlands that no inlander, wherever he was from in the archipelago, spoke so-called Low Malay as a mother-tongue; he acquired that *brabbeltaal* (gibberish) because he knew that Europeans would not take the trouble to learn the regional languages properly. Like Klinkert, Van der Tuuk stressed the edifying effect which the government could achieve through application of correct language standards. If it wanted to develop the inlander, then it would have to "speak to his heart," and this would be impossible if the government persisted in availing itself of the *brabbeltaal*; the way to "the great goal," of leading the inlander to higher development, was a long one, but it should not make the Dutch despair.<sup>87</sup>

Another participant now entered the controversy concerning the creation and quality of a standard Malay for the Indies. This was N. Graafland, a missionary teacher of the Nederlands Zendelinggenootschap.<sup>88</sup> Writing from Tanawangko, near Menado, Graafland published a paper in 1868 which was remarkable for its perception of the issues at stake in the "pure Malay" dispute with regard to achieving unity for the peoples and the governing structure of the archipelago. Recalling Van der Tuuk's regret at the lack of good criteria for Malay, Graafland wrote that this was most felt by those not privileged to live in natural Malay-speaking territories or to associate with Malays, and who,

---

<sup>84</sup>See the entry for Klinkert in *Encyclopaedie van Nederlandsch-Indië*, 2, p. 350.

<sup>85</sup>H. C. Klinkert, "Eenige ophelderingen omtrent de Maleische spreekwoorden en spreekwijzen," *BKI*, 13 (1866), p. 53.

<sup>86</sup>See H. C. Klinkert, "Iets over de Maleische school- en volksleesboeken, bekroond en uitgegeven door het Nederlandsch Indische Gouvernement," *ibid.*, pp. 88-112.

<sup>87</sup>Van der Tuuk, "Voorrede" [1867], pp. v, vii, viii.

<sup>88</sup>It may be relevant for appreciating Graafland's views that he seems to have spent his whole career in missionary and, subsequently, government education activities. (He was for a while an assistant-inspector of education in Minahasa and Ambon.) See J. L. Swellengrebel, *In Leijdeckers Voetspoor. Anderhalve eeuw Bijbelvertaling en taalkunde in de Indonesische talen. I. 1820-1900* (The Hague: Nijhoff, 1974), p. 250.

therefore, had to hear daily in their surroundings a coarse local-Malay speech. Klinkert's (pure) Malacca- or Riau-Malay was, as a survey using his proverbs and saws had shown, unusable in the eastern part of the Indies, even in coastal regions where Malay had been spoken for about three centuries before it was introduced into the uplands. Graafland contended that Malay was a living language, undergoing change with the people who used it, and added that, after all, "de taal is het volk [the language is the people]."

To work for the purification and improvement of Malay was, wrote Graafland, in every sense possible and desirable, but to coerce the language was not. The "finest future" for Malay lay in better and wider study, but, above all, in a more general extension of well-written publications throughout the archipelago. Only in that way could one hope for greater unity and purer usage, and enrichment of the language from many sides.

Graafland admitted that Klinkert had gained the adherence of Van der Tuuk, who was "a great philologist." But, he declared, Van der Tuuk did not know the conditions and languages in Graafland's part of the archipelago. There the "Malay" culture of which Van der Tuuk had spoken did not exist. Van der Tuuk tended to lump everyone together, the Alfurese people of Ceram, for example, with the Malays of Riau and "Malaka."<sup>89</sup>

\* \* \*

During this controversy over Malay among scholars and administrative, ecclesiastical and economic interests, newspapers in the Malay language started publication in both the Netherlands and the Indies. In 1856, Roorda van Eysinga, after the second of his terms in Indies government service, began to bring out in Holland a Malay-language newspaper called *Bintang Oetara*,<sup>90</sup> which was immediately hailed as part of an effort towards "the true enlightenment and culture of the millions of people who have been placed under the rule of the Netherlands in the Indies."<sup>91</sup> (The newspaper had to be printed in the Netherlands because of the "foolish system" sanctioned by the recent Regeringsreglement, by which the Indies press was under official restraint, whereas all print from the Netherlands was legally entitled to unhindered dissemination.<sup>92</sup>) Unfortunately *Bintang Oetara*'s language failed to meet one basic requirement--being intelligible to the readers at whom it was directed. Roorda van Eysinga seems to have done his utmost to seek out strange, seldom-used Arabic words, when simple, generally understood expressions lay at hand.<sup>93</sup>

<sup>89</sup>Graafland, "Het criterium voor geschriften," pp. 407-34 passim.

<sup>90</sup>The twelve monthly issues of *Bintang Oetara* for its second year, 1857, are in the Leiden University Library. Roorda van Eysinga had died on October 14, 1856. His son, W. A. P. Roorda van Eysinga, succeeded him as editor.

<sup>91</sup>The reviewer of *Bintang Oetara* in Dr. W. R. Baron van Hoëvell's *Tijdschrift voor Nederlandsch Indië* (Van Hoëvell himself?) had apparently read the first issue in 1856. The Roorda van Eysinga dictionary published the previous year was reviewed at the same time. *TNI*, 18, 1 (1856). The passage quoted above is on p. 218.

<sup>92</sup>See *SKN*, 1854, No. 129; see also *SNI*, 1856, No. 74.

<sup>93</sup>*TNI*, 18, 1 (1856), p. 217.

Contemporaneous with the *Bintang Oetara* venture in the Netherlands, *Soerat Kabar Bahasa Melaijoe* began publication in Surabaya. This paper was less self-conscious about its purpose in using Malay, and was without broadly political aims, which, in any case, censorship would have made virtually impossible to pursue. It stated in its second issue in 1856 that it was intended as an aid to the Chinese, Arabs, Malays, and Indians of the trading communities of coastal (north-) east Java.<sup>94</sup> While the commercial orientation of this newspaper was indicated by the frequent advertising of a local steamship service, Malay poetry was also published, showing some interest in the language for its own sake.<sup>95</sup> *Biang Lala* (Batavia, 1867-68), a more restricted and less professional publication, identified itself with the self-improvement aspirations of the capital's relatively cosmopolitan, Westernized, non-European community. It was linked with a local Malay-language school where tuition was also available in Javanese, Dutch, and English.<sup>96</sup> *Bientang Timoor*, first published in Surabaya on May 10, 1862, identified its readership in 1863 as the Javanese official class, Javanese generally, Chinese, and Malays, in that order;<sup>97</sup> unnecessarily, it told readers that its usage was Low Malay.<sup>98</sup>

Despite this growing involvement of Malay with the burgeoning intellectual and commercial life of the archipelago--now becoming far more diversified through internal and external change<sup>99</sup>--J. Pijnappel in 1870 expressed his regret at "the failure" of European association (with the general Malay-language region) to have generated anything other than stagnation in the quality of works written in Malay.<sup>100</sup> This was, of course, a judgment covering a far wider field of concern than that to which Van der Tuuk, Klinkert, Graafland, and the others had addressed themselves in the Malay-usage controversy of the 1850s and 1860s.

---

<sup>94</sup>*Soerat Kabar Bahasa Melaijoe*, No. 2, "Soerabaya, hari Saptoe, tanggal 3, Djoemadilawal, taon Djawa 1784 . . . , oetawa 12 Januarij 1856," first page. Publication is attributed as "Di tjap dan boleh dapat darie E. Fuhri di Soerabaya."

<sup>95</sup>The steamship service was to Semarang, Batavia, and Singapore. See, for example, *Soerat Kabar Bahasa Melaijoe*, April 26, 1856, p. 3. A statement of literary intent, and some verses, are in *Soerat Kabar Bahasa Melaijoe*, May 17, 1856, p. 3.

<sup>96</sup>On these points, see *Biang Lala*, September 11, 1867, No. 1, for the notice concerning location, and editorial control; also September 25, 1867, No. 2, third and fourth pages; and October 23, 1867, No. 4, third page.

<sup>97</sup>*Bientang Timoor*, November 28, 1863. It changed its name to *Bintang Timor* on October 11, 1865.

<sup>98</sup>*Bintang Timor*, November 4, 1865.

<sup>99</sup>Some of the obvious elements in the process were: a start with internal telegraph links in 1856, with a modern postal service in 1862, with a railways service in 1867, and with cable communication with Europe in 1880; the opening of the Suez Canal in 1869, and the domination of travel to and communication with Europe by scheduled steamship services; the inception of tobacco cultivation in East Sumatra from 1863, the Agrarian Law and the Sugar Law of 1870, and the 1871 treaty with Britain for a new Dutch standing in Sumatra.

<sup>100</sup>J. Pijnappel, "De Maleische handschriften der Leidsche bibliotheek," *BKI*, 17 (1870), p. 148.

That debate, however, had meantime produced a disciple for Pijnappel's advocacy of an identification of Malay with Western rather than Arabic script, and a prophet of an achievable cultural unity in the archipelago via Malay. This figure was J. R. P. F. Gonggrijp,<sup>101</sup> who had served in the Indies as a teacher for the Netherlands Missionary Society and was now a lecturer in the Delft municipal institution which trained candidate-officials for the Indies. In editing the eighth volume of the *Maleisch Leesboek* (1876) Gonggrijp wrote:

As far as publication in *Latin* type is concerned, I hope that the experience may prove that the Government has done well to choose these letters. Until now, Malay literature was unknown and inaccessible to the many who do not know Arabic alphabetical writing. . . [there are] also many *Inlanders* who indeed read Latin, but not Arabic, characters. . . . Moreover the lack of vowels in the latter script occasions great difficulty whereby meaning read slightly awry becomes unintelligible. . . . For the *Inlander* these letters are thus easier, for the foreigner a Malay work is more than half translated as soon as it is given to him in Latin characters.<sup>102</sup>

Meanwhile, Pijnappel's long insistence upon government application of scholarship to the needs of administrative contact with the Indies population led to the contention by an Indies educator in 1881 that:

The reason why the idea prevails with most Europeans that common Malay, yes even gibberish-Malay is all right, proceeds from the circumstance that Europeans, for the greater part, come into contact only with indigenous local rulers, servants, batmen, merchants; in general, with people whose interest carries the responsibilities of understanding Europeans and of being understood by them.<sup>103</sup>

This argument was pursued in relation to the colonial army, where Dutch officers leading Javanese, Madurese, Buginese, Sundanese, Malays, Niassers, Dayaks, Alfurese, Ambonese, and Menadonese, as well as Europeans, did not always find the lingual intricacy of the situation eased by indigenous tolerance of European "gibberish-Malay." An article published in 1884<sup>104</sup> alleged that not until 1870 had any efforts been made to encourage European military men to devote real study to Indies languages, especially Malay and Javanese: at the time of the article's publication, a cadre of Europeans literate in Malay and Javanese was still lacking even though between 1871 and 1873 infantry drill-instructions had been translated into Malay. Several years later, in 1891,

---

<sup>101</sup>In 1866, he had written a provisional rebuttal of the charges which Klinkert had sent from Riau. See his "Een woord over het opstel van Heer H. C. Klinkert," *BKI*, 13 (1866), pp. 402-8. Gonggrijp had worked in Semarang, where the Klinkert Malay Gospels which he deplored were published. See *ibid.*, p. 407. See also *Encyclopaedie van Nederlandsch-Indië* (1917), 1, p. 803.

<sup>102</sup>J. R. P. F. Gonggrijp, "Aanteekeningen," in *Maleisch Leesboek voor eerst-beginnenden en meergevorderden* (Leiden: Gualth Kolff, 1876), 8, p. 2.

<sup>103</sup>J. Habbema, "Naar aanleiding van den Heer W. Hoogkamer's 'Toelichtingen tot de door Prof. Pijnappel uitgegeven Menangkabausch-Maleische Zamenspraken,'" *BKI*, 29 (1881), p. 137.

<sup>104</sup>See W. C. Nieuwenhuyzen, "De beoefening der Inlandsche talen in het Indische leger," *IG*, 6, 1 (1884), pp. 335-62.

the Indies army officer J. C. C. Nijland, noting that the colonial army was composed mostly of Javanese villagers, wrote that as recruits ". . . they do not know a word of Malay, let alone Barracks-Malay . . . the Javanese keeps thinking in Javanese--for that matter among his comrades, with his wife, and so on, he never speaks Malay."<sup>105</sup>

Essentially the same Low Malay that had gone into the composition of "barracks Malay"<sup>106</sup> sufficed for officer-appointees to the naval service of the Netherlands under a syllabus of 1889.<sup>107</sup> Functionaries of various kinds in the colonial administration were brought under similar rules. For example in the post and telegraph service, eligibility for appointments through the ranks was determined by examinations which included "elements of the Malay language"; proficiency was also necessary in the translation of easy Dutch sentences into Latin-script Malay.<sup>108</sup>

The momentum of Malay-ization through so many aspects of the Dutch presence did not go without notice, and there were expressions of unease and even protest from administrators in different parts of the Indies who had access to critical organs. With respect to Ambon, G. W. C. Baron van Hoëvell declared in 1877 that "Our forefathers have thrust Malay upon the inhabitants of the Ambonese archipelago, and have given themselves little concern about the real language of the country"; after their long establishment in the area, the Ambonese vernacular was still "not much more than an argot" to the Dutch.<sup>109</sup> Regarding West Sumatra, J. Habbema, a specialist in Indies education, in 1881 challenged the "misconception" that *gewone Maleisch* always sufficed in that area,<sup>110</sup> and his protest was joined by J. L. van der Toorn, in an article from Fort de Kock published in the civil service periodical in 1888 on "Minangkabau as against Riau (Malay)."<sup>111</sup> A stronger attack on Dutch employment of Malay followed in 1889 in the *Indische Gids*, where a review of a new manual for Acehnese language-study and of a new Acehnese dictionary, argued that, although as a lingua franca Low Malay by no means deserved the contempt it had drawn, it was "a disgrace that such a language should be thrust onto millions of *Inlanders*. . . ." There were still missionaries continuing "in incomprehensible short-sightedness, to thrust Malay onto populations for

---

<sup>105</sup>J. C. C. Nijland, "Het Maleisch in de Kazerne Beschouwingen naar aanleiding van de handleiding 'het Maleisch in de Kazerne' door M. C. van Rouveroy van Nieuwaal, kapitein der Genietroepen van het O.I. leger," *Indisch Militair Tijdschrift (IMT)*, 22, Nos. 1-6 (1891), pp. 546-47. He added that barracks-Malay itself was of European manufacture, serving not only for communication between inlanders and the Dutch in the Indies army, but also between the Germans and Dutch on one side, and French on the other (the French especially finding Dutch very difficult). *Ibid.*, pp. 547-48.

<sup>106</sup>For a discussion of the influences, including "Soldaten-en ook matrozen-Maleisch," upon old usage employed by the Dutch in the Indies, see also S. Kalff, "Een doode indische taal," *IG*, 36, 2 (1914), pp. 953-72.

<sup>107</sup>*SNI*, 1889, No. 218.      <sup>108</sup>*SNI*, 1878, No. 48.

<sup>109</sup>G. W. C. Baron van Hoëvell, "Iets over de Vijf Voornaamste Dialecten der Ambonsche Landtaal (Bahasa Tanah)," *BKI*, 25 (1877), p. 3.

<sup>110</sup>Habbema, "Naar aanleiding," p. 136.

<sup>111</sup>J. L. van der Toorn, "Het Minangkabausch tegenover het Riausch," *TBB*, 2 (1888/89), p. 36.

whom this language is just as foreign as, for instance, Russian for a Hollander. . . ."112

Nonetheless, Malay came increasingly to be espoused by "progressive" opinion in the Indies<sup>113</sup> for communication between people from different language areas. For example, the bureaucratic cosmopolite Raden Pennah displayed the stamp of "a true Batavian," in that he "stubbornly refused" to learn the language of areas on Java to which he was sent, "saying that everybody could easily learn to speak Malay" which would make them "more robust in their demeanor towards Alien Orientals and Europeans."<sup>114</sup>

An argument of this kind was further pursued in an arresting article contributed to the *Binnenlandsch Bestuur* journal in 1891 on "The Worth of Malay as the Medium of Civilization," by A. A. Fokker.<sup>115</sup> His article appeared in the context of a controversy over whether Dutch should be reintroduced as a subject for indigenous teachers in *kweek-scholen* [teacher training schools]. According to Fokker, attention had to be given to the question of which language had the most value as a medium of civilization (*beschaving*) for the inlander "in our archipelago." "In the first centuries" any idea of making him conversant with "our obstinate idiom" would remain an unattainable ideal. Dutch lacked all affinity with the indigenous dialects. "However, no language is so suitable for the inlander to acquire our concepts in, as Malay. It is astonishing that this can still be doubted."<sup>116</sup>

He went on:

There has long been insufficient consciousness of the great importance of a universal language of civilization, especially with a dominated nation. We believe decidedly that unity of language gives solidarity. . . . The government's task also becomes so much more easy when

---

<sup>112</sup>Unsigned review of K. F. H. van Langen, "Handleiding voor de beoefening der Atjehsche taal," and "Woordenboek der Atjehsche taal," *IG*, 11, 1 (1889), p. 1056. The editors of the "Koloniale Literatuur" section in which the review appeared were named as Professor Mr. P. A. van der Lith and Professor Dr. C. M. Kan. Van der Lith had been secretary to the trustees of the "Gemeente-instelling voor de opleiding van Oost-Indische ambtenaren te Leiden" during the 1878 developments in the long nineteenth century controversy over language-training for Indies civil servants between educational establishments in Leiden and Delft, and Colonial Ministers. The contention that the Malay language, despite its religious significance was comparatively rare in Aceh accorded with Snouck Hurgronje's findings published only a few years later. See C. Snouck Hurgronje, *De Atjehers* (Batavia, Leiden: Landsdrukkerij/Brill, 1894), 2, p. 4. See also Snouck Hurgronje to Director of Education, Batavia, October 28, 1899 in *Ambtelijke Adviezen*, 3, pp. 1810-12.

<sup>113</sup>See Van der Tuuk, "Voorrede," and "Aan den lezer," in *Handleiding tot de kennis*, pp. v, vi.

<sup>114</sup>See the account of Pennah's arrival for an audience with the Regent of Serang, in *Herinneringen van Pangeran Aria Achmad Djajadiningrat* (Amsterdam, Batavia: Kolff, 1936), pp. 39-40.

<sup>115</sup>A. A. Fokker, "De waarde van het Maleisch als beschavingsmedium," *TBB*, 5 (1891), pp. 82-88.

<sup>116</sup>*Ibid.*, pp. 82-83.

an identical idiom is understood and spoken everywhere. The smaller dialects must be lost: that is an unshakeable law: they may be used, by importers of the gospel, as the key to the hearts of the indigenes, and even remain in existence as the language of more intimate life, [but] as the thought-bearer of society they must give way before the stronger and more developed. . . . In the Moluccas, every leader in the areas where there is direct government knows good Malay (Riau), although each island also knows its own Alfuresse dialect. The language of Ambon is disappearing at an increasing rate: so strong is the influence of the more cultured Malay. It is sensible not to oppose such a gradual, natural process.<sup>117</sup>

Fokker argued that it would be impossible to "civilize" the people by means of dialects and subdialects. That would be endless, useless work. For example, how would people fare in Borneo, where a journey from one river-territory to another sometimes meant encountering another dialect; and in New Guinea, where almost every village spoke a different language? When the Roman Empire was at the acme of its prosperity, every well-educated man spoke and wrote Latin. If "Ethiopians" learned to use the language of Cicero, would "the much more distinguished" Javanese, Buginese, and others not be able to learn any Riau-Malay? Fokker predicted:

There must come a time, and we can contribute much to it, when every Inlander who has attended the lower school, and who amounts to anything among his fellow-clansmen, will be just as much ashamed of knowing no Riau-Malay, as, for example, a Friesian artisan when he can understand no Dutch, a Galician water-carrier when he is not at home in Castilian Spanish, a Sicilian or Venetian when he has no Tuscan Italian at his command. That, however, does not alter the fact that, on the domestic hearth, the beloved dialect of the region where one is born resumes its rights.

That the concepts we have advocated are susceptible of realization, Menado, among other places, has demonstrated. Fifty years ago, everyone there spoke Alfuresse, whereas now Malay rules as the language of society.<sup>118</sup>

If Fokker had, as it were, foreshadowed nationalist arguments for Indies unity via Malay, warnings of just this hazard for the Dutch appeared two years later in an article by Jan ten Hove,<sup>119</sup> who had worked in the originally Alfuresse-language region. He claimed that "*the new establishment of Malay is the so-called 'passer-Maleisch.'*" To this Malay is the future, in the Minahasa as well, if we do not erect a new dam with Dutch against that new language-flood."<sup>120</sup>

The kinds of Malay used by the various arms of Dutch authority represented in the Minahasa had reduced the range of expression available to the community. The lingual equipment of a school official, a clergyman, and a *controleur* amounted, Ten Hove claimed, to no more than one

<sup>117</sup>Ibid., pp. 86-87.

<sup>118</sup>Ibid., pp. 87-88.

<sup>119</sup>Ten Hove, "De taalquaestie in de Minahasse," pp. 1610-11. ("Inhoud" has "Minahassa.")

<sup>120</sup>Ibid., p. 1614. The article was written in the context of a dispute over whether Alfuresse should be the school and church language of the Minahasa, Malayabolished, and Dutch introduced.

thousand words of Malay, and many had no more than five hundred. Yet when the Dutch language had been introduced via Alfuresse, the indigenious speaker had six thousand words, and the European ten thousand, at their disposal. "Now that we both use Malay in our association with each other, we have poverty," contended the author. On the other hand, Sumatran, literary Malay was "stricken with palsy" in the Minahasa. Could Malay literary forms not then be introduced "with all main force"? Frankly, no, unless about a hundred Sumatran teachers could be transplanted to the Minahasa to supply the language standard, and infuse the inhabitants with the life of the Malay forms. No government teacher of the up-country or the capital, no clergyman or controleur, no adjunct-inspector or school supervisor ever made complete use of the literary Malay forms. Vital force in such a usage did not exist for them, nor for any single Minahasan. For all of them it was a foreign language.<sup>121</sup>

School and church leaders in the Minahasa did not understand and had no feel for Malay. It was not their fault, however, since none of them had ever yet heard a "pure Malay" speaking, and they learned from books written by people who had also never heard one speak. Ten Hove wrote that for nine years he had tried to find somebody with a book in his hand outside church; and on the few occasions when he had succeeded half the time the book was in Dutch. It could be taken as a rule that the well-educated inlander or *Afstammeling* (*Peranakan*), if he read, never read Malay but always Dutch. Yet education and religion had now contracted a firm alliance with Malay.<sup>122</sup> Ten Hove pointed to the disadvantages under which the Alfuresse labored, in that they were still without adequate means to read in their own language, while since the seventeenth century the Dutch had been rendering Malay into print. Just as there were Hollanders who could not imagine operas in Dutch, so there were also Minahasans who could not visualize Alfuresse books. It was time for the Dutch to turn back from the Malay "wrong-track," and address themselves to nature and to truth.<sup>123</sup>

Where now nothing other than "dead, meaningless words" were heard, preaching and teaching would come alive. Did that mean using Alfuresse, and no Malay? Unconditionally yes, Ten Hove answered. And Dutch? Conditionally yes: "Because in Alfuresse, the inlander and whoever leads him can exercise supervision, and in Dutch we can do it. In Malay, neither can exercise supervision, because neither knows that language as a language should be known."<sup>124</sup>

Various district heads spoke Dutch just as well as the controleur spoke Malay, and whenever this official casually encountered such a chief, he spoke Dutch with him. This, Ten Hove believed, was wholly natural because the chiefs knew enough Dutch, and wished to learn in and through that language. They would be offended whenever they were addressed "in that language [Malay]." Rightly so, because Malay was not their language; it had been forced on them, said Ten Hove.

Let the controleur speak to the chiefs in Alfuresse if he could, and they would be very much taken with that. If he could not speak Alfuresse, then let him use Dutch. Was it not ridiculous, Ten Hove

---

<sup>121</sup>Ibid., pp. 1616-17.

<sup>122</sup>Ibid., pp. 1620-21.

<sup>123</sup>Ibid., pp. 1623-24.

<sup>124</sup>Ibid., p. 1625.

asked, that the controleur used Malay in official letters? And what Malay! He warned that when the Dutch had propagated Malay everywhere, "all the peoples of the Archipelago can confer and correspond with each other about driving away the European, who tries to keep them ignorant."

Ten Hove maintained that he had never yet heard an inlander mock a European in Dutch, but rather in "new-Malay" or in the vernacular. Whenever the Dutch spoke Malay, they had to take care that their legs were not being pulled by those who spoke Malay nimbly. In Dutch, they could rule, in Malay, not. In Dutch, they were "the boss," in Malay, "the inferior." He who best had command of language had preponderance over him who did not know it as well. A Javanese servant who spoke Malay was sometimes insolent; a Minahasan clerk who spoke Dutch was always polite.<sup>125</sup>

\* \* \*

The closing years of the nineteenth century were a period in which the standards for representation of the Malay language came once again under serious study. In a report in 1894 to the Director of Education in Batavia, Snouck Hurgronje both emphasized dissatisfaction with, and recommended changes in, the government's broad rendering of Malay texts into Western script.<sup>126</sup> In a further report four months later, he declared that, because the strict application of a logical system might be impossible, a collection of spelling rules<sup>127</sup> would be less desirable than the issuing of a word list. This method was recommended by C. A. van Ophuijsen (then an inspector of indigenous education at Fort de Kock)<sup>128</sup> in view of the urgent need for a regulated Malay spelling to curb, at least provisionally, the "existing anarchy" in the spelling of Malay.

Snouck Hurgronje recommended that Van Ophuijsen's plan be executed, and that the Western spelling principles which he had expounded be generally followed "with the setting-aside, however, of such rules as he has drafted under the influence of his study of the Minangkabau dialect. . . ." In the many doubtful cases that he would encounter, the compiler of this word-list ought to ascertain the pronunciation of the "cultivated Malays of Riau and elsewhere," especially for establishing vowel standards.<sup>129</sup> Snouck Hurgronje contended that ". . . while the spelling of no other native language presents as many difficulties as

---

<sup>125</sup>For the whole of these three paragraphs see, *ibid.*, pp. 1628-29.

<sup>126</sup>Snouck Hurgronje to Director of Education, Batavia, October 30, 1894, in *Ambtelijke Adviezen*, 3, p. 1766.

<sup>127</sup>Snouck Hurgronje to Director of Education, Batavia, February 28, 1895, in *ibid.*, p. 1771.

<sup>128</sup>Van Ophuijsen was born at Solok, in Minangkabau country, where his father was an Assistant Resident. For details of his later work in the same region, see C. Snouck Hurgronje, "Levensbericht van C. A. van Ophuijsen 1917," *Verspreide Geschriften* (Leiden: Brill, 1927), 6, pp. 423-34. See also *Encyclopaedie van Nederlandsch-Indië*, 3, pp. 154-55.

<sup>129</sup>Snouck Hurgronje to Director of Education, Batavia, February 28, 1895, in *Ambtelijke Adviezen*, 3, p. 1779.

that of Malay, the regulation of this latter is precisely the most urgent."<sup>130</sup>

Snouck Hurgronje disagreed with Van Ophuijsen's reliance on the Malay usage being established near Riau by the Singapore presses,<sup>131</sup> at a time when the Romanized Malay newspaper *Bintang Timor* stressed the healthy state of the Malay-language press in Batavia, and the correctness of its Romanized spelling.<sup>132</sup>

Both Snouck Hurgronje and Van Ophuijsen were also concerned with questions of the vocalization of Arabic-script Malay works being imported into the archipelago, not only via the "mostly . . . pitifully poor editions of Singapore,"<sup>133</sup> but also as books commissioned from presses in Constantinople, Cairo, Mecca, and Bombay. Snouck Hurgronje believed that Malay spelling in Latin characters could easily be bound to rational rules--provided that these were not overdoctrinaire: "because that spelling has originated through our influence, it is directly or indirectly propagated alone through our education, and the minority who avail themselves of it belong to that section of native society that most associates with Europeans."<sup>134</sup> If, however, new standards in Malay--and a new, standard Malay for unity--were to be imposed for new needs of government and private enterprise in the archipelago, this could be effected only if the government was determined to make full use of the whole education system and all its own publishing resources. In 1896 official Malay translations of general ordinances were still "really very poor, [and] more often than not, for someone who knows only Malay, unintelligible."<sup>135</sup>

More and more concerned with problems of uniformity and improvement in language use, especially in Malay, for offices and schools that were an increasingly heavy responsibility for a centralizing Netherlands Indies Government, Snouck Hurgronje wrote a long report to the General Secretariat on the possibility of an official, fixed spelling of geographical proper names in the archipelago, listing recommendations for promoting "precision and uniformity."<sup>136</sup> In November 1896 he returned to the problem of providing textbooks of a common Malay grammar for indigenous education, a task even more difficult than

---

<sup>130</sup>Ibid., p. 1777.

<sup>131</sup>Snouck Hurgronje to Director of Education, Batavia, October 30, 1894, in *ibid.*, p. 1763.

<sup>132</sup>*Bintang Timor*, September 24, 1894; see also *Bintang Timor*, December 29, 1894.

<sup>133</sup>Snouck Hurgronje to Director of Education, Batavia, October 30, 1894, in *Ambtelijke Adviezen*, 3, p. 1763. Van Ophuijsen had written earlier on Malay spelling in Arabic script. See C. A. van Ophuijsen, *Gronden der Spelling van het Maleisch met Arabische Karakters. Nieuwe Leerwijze* (Semarang: van Dorp, 1882), esp. "Inleiding," p. 1.

<sup>134</sup>Snouck Hurgronje to Director of Education, Batavia, October 30, 1894, in *Ambtelijke Adviezen*, 3, p. 1764.

<sup>135</sup>Snouck Hurgronje to Director of Justice, Batavia, May 26, 1896, in *ibid.*, p. 1784.

<sup>136</sup>Snouck Hurgronje to the General Secretariat, Batavia, July 13, 1896, in *ibid.*, p. 1795.

composing Malay grammars for Europeans.<sup>137</sup> Snouck Hurgronje was balancing on one side the nature of the real Dutch achievement in Indies philology up to that time--the "careful recording and, where possible, elucidation" of a Malay dialect--and, on the other, the immediate need for a strict revision of language and style by a learned indigene "not corrupted by the European Malay of office and school."<sup>138</sup>

In preparation for the task of assembling the data necessary to draw up a fixed system of spelling Malay with Latin characters for use in indigenous education, Van Ophuijsen was commissioned by the Indies government in 1896 to travel through the foremost Malay-language areas.<sup>139</sup> He voyaged to Riau and its dependencies, to the east coast of Sumatra, and to Pontianak; and then "abroad" to Penang, Singapore, Malacca, Selangor, Perak, and Johore.<sup>140</sup> Versed in Malay, Javanese, Arabic, and Sanskrit, and at home in a range of Sumatran languages, Van Ophuijsen was able to demonstrate that the best sources for correct Malay lay well beyond Java, center of the Indies state, and at least partly outside the Netherlands Indies itself. Van Ophuijsen himself recognized that his work was likely to have a standardizing effect, even apart from its immediate application in indigenous education and in government Malay-language publications. Indeed, he considered it also his "duty to use [the spelling] in a book for future officials."<sup>141</sup>

The Indies government's implementation of Van Ophuijsen's commission came through a circular sent to Residents in 1902 by the Director of Education, J. H. Abendanon. It specified that "the attainment of a fixed system of spelling the Malay language with Latin characters" made it necessary that those teaching Malay in the indigenous education system should use no other spelling than that followed in Van Ophuijsen's spelling-list (of ninety-four pages). This had already been used in various works printed in the recent past. In the interest of "necessary unity," a recommendation that private schools follow the example of the government was also warranted.<sup>142</sup>

Despite the unifying labors of Snouck Hurgronje and Van Ophuijsen, pursuit of educational, bureaucratic, and developmental interests via a

---

<sup>137</sup>Snouck Hurgronje to Director of Education, Batavia, November 19, 1896, in *ibid.*, p. 1798.

<sup>138</sup>*Ibid.*, pp. 1798-99.

<sup>139</sup>See Snouck Hurgronje, "Levensbericht van C. A. van Ophuijsen 1917," pp. 430-31. See also Ch. A. van Ophuijsen, *Maleische Spraakkunst* (Leiden: van Doesburgh, 1910), implied p.v. before "Inhoud."

<sup>140</sup>"Levensbericht van C. A. van Ophuijsen," pp. 425-28. See also C. Snouck Hurgronje to Director of Education, Batavia, April 26, 1896, in *Ambtelijke Adviezen*, 3, p. 1770.

<sup>141</sup>Van Ophuijsen, *Maleische Spraakkunst*, on the first of two prefatory pages preceding the "Inhoud" and "Inleiding" pages.

<sup>142</sup>*BSNI*, 1904, No. 5821, pp. 78-79. Recognition of Van Ophuijsen's linguistic attainments brought an invitation from Leiden in 1904 to take up the Leiden Chair in Malay Philology and Literature and the general literature of the Indies archipelago, a chair vacant since the resignation in 1889 of Pijnappel, an early advocate of Western script for Indies Malay. See Snouck Hurgronje, "Levensbericht van C. A. van Ophuijsen 1917," p. 428.

standard Indies Malay still faced at least three obstacles. There continued to be an emphasis upon the *foreign* nature of the lingua franca Malay of the archipelago, with the accompanying (mostly Dutch-voiced) protest that Malay, in particular a Dutch-determined form of Malay, was being thrust upon unwilling learners by an administration with which the language was peculiarly identified; the incomprehension of Malay by large majorities within the most important ethnic groups of the Netherlands East Indies; and, in addition, aspirations towards Western-style progress through Dutch-language education, something by no means confined to Kartini's family circle.<sup>143</sup>

In direct administration on Java, the Low Malay officialese continued to be strongly preferred. H. E. Steinmetz, whose translation of the Land Rent Ordinance in 1902 was in "Javanese-Malay colloquial speech,"<sup>144</sup> had already pointed out in 1897 that Malay had become the official language, whereas, forty or fifty years previously, regents and lesser officials had replied in the vernacular, sometimes with a Malay translation alongside. With rising demands being made on the territorial service, it was becoming increasingly difficult to get most circulars translated because of a lack of translators; many documents were simply not being rendered into a Malay understandable to indigenous officials. Translations were limited to the most essential documents, and these versions were highly imperfect.<sup>145</sup>

In his speech before the Literary Congress in Dordrecht in 1897, Professor Kern (who had been born in Central Java)<sup>146</sup> described how Low or gibberish-Malay, this "*Volapük tout trouvé*," had become the lingua franca of the archipelago and of Further India, "in short in the whole of Indonesia, where more languages are spoken than in the whole of Europe." Kern recommended Dutch as the vehicle for culture among the Javanese, who understood, better than old colonials did, the benefit of learning it. Applications to the "chiefs' schools" were five times the number of places available. Kern criticized the prejudice that Dutch prestige would suffer by allowing a cultured Javanese to speak to the Dutch in Dutch. Dutch could be the language of school and pulpit, instead of Malay, in regions where the vernacular resembled Malay as little as Dutch resembled Russian. When a foreign language was imported into state primary schools in Minahasa, where education in the various languages and dialects gave rise to too many difficulties, a language strange to both teachers and pupils was chosen: not Dutch, but Malay. That such an offensive and unstatesmanlike measure was

---

<sup>143</sup>Achmad Djajadiningrat wrote of early schooling in the family's traditional home-center at Pandeglang that "it was touching to see how my uncle spared neither trouble nor cost to have the younger members of his family given education in the Netherlands language." The motive, it appeared subsequently, was that "if the Javanese people wished to achieve more in various fields, they had to try, in the first place, to make modern Western civilization and ideas their own, and that the key to this was the knowledge of the Netherlands language." *Herinneringen*, p. 27.

<sup>144</sup>H. E. Steinmetz, "Bewerking van de Grondhuurordonnantie (Stbl. 1900 No. 24) en hare uitvoeringsvoorschriften (Bijbl. No. 5520)," *TBB*, 22 (1902), pp. 103-8.

<sup>145</sup>H. E. Steinmetz, "Kennis der Nederlandsche taal voor regenten en zelfstandige patih's op Java meer en meer een vereischte," *TBB*, 14 (1897), p. 461.

<sup>146</sup>For an outline of Kern's career, see *Encyclopaedie van Nederlandsch-Indië*, 2, pp. 302-3.

maintained, despite repeated warnings by men who meant well by the Netherlands and the inlanders, was, said Kern, difficult to explain as other than an outcome of a reprehensible love of ease.<sup>147</sup>

A reviewer in the *Indische Gids* in 1898 reflected that Dutch-Malay linguists now regularly testified that the "lingo" ("*taaltje*") that "all we Indies colonials" spoke in dealings with inlanders, Chinese, or Arabs, was something to be ashamed of, and gave the additional assurance that no Low Malay existed, or ever had. This did not negate the fact that the Dutch were able to rescue themselves with this nonexistent language--"those few hundred words that we shall now merely continue to call Low Malay."<sup>148</sup> C. Spat, lecturer and grammarian in Malay, wrote in 1899 of the very wide difference between the colloquial Malay language and the local "jabber" that varied everywhere. People were pleased to take the latter for Malay, and to describe it by the name "Low Malay," but it could just as well be called "Low Netherlands or Low something else."<sup>149</sup>

An official spelling system for Malay, although founded in classical usage, did not solve any of the disagreements over syntax and vocabulary. On the contrary, public argument continued within the Dutch administration over whether Low or High Malay, colloquial or literate Malay, should be used in everyday association between Dutch officials and their indigenous colleagues; and whether public statements and notices should be issued in "correct" Malay, or in the kind which could actually be understood, particularly on Java. Interacting with these questions was a new demand for the wider employment of Dutch as required under conditions of more intense and diversified economic development. From at least 1890<sup>150</sup> (and repeatedly until at least 1909)<sup>151</sup> the Indies government tried to break down the resistance of many regional administrators to dealing with inlanders in Dutch.

Under these conditions, at the end of the nineteenth century, taunts about "gibberish Malay" could still harry the government and undermine the results of persistent attempts to adopt a standard, flexible, and respectable Malay usage for the archipelago. They also amounted to an accusation that language policies attempting to spread the use of Malay were more for the convenience of the rulers than the ruled. By then, however, there could be no dispute that an effective archipelago language had been fashioned, even if the fashioning was essentially in terms of the concepts of colonial government. The initial (and long-persistent) physical and cultural apartness of Batavia from the remainder of Java, and the consolidation of Malay as the governing city's distinctive vernacular for external contact and administration, confirmed the colonial rulers in a proprietary management of the language which prevailed, despite perennial protests (both Dutch and indigenous) that this "Malay" was incomprehensible to the masses

---

<sup>147</sup>See *IG*, 19, 2 (1897), pp. 1342-43.

<sup>148</sup>"Een Duitsch-Maleisch leerboekje," *IG*, 20, 2 (1898), p. 1379.

<sup>149</sup>C. Spat, "De Heer\*\*\*als adviseur ter zake van het onderwijs in Inlandsche talen," *IG*, 21, 2 (1899), p. 1270.

<sup>150</sup>"Hormatgebruiken. Eerbiedsbetoon. Nederlandsch Taal," September 10, 1890, reproduced in *BSNI*, 1907, No. 6496, pp. 265-66.

<sup>151</sup>*BSNI*, 1910, No. 7029, pp. 120-21.

of the Indies population. The related debate over the desirability of "High" or "Low" forms of the language was also characteristically a debate among Dutchmen--at the end of the nineteenth century as it had been at the end of the seventeenth. When developing administrative needs demanded standardization of Netherlands Indies Malay, this was done at the beginning of the twentieth century in terms of Dutch ideas.

By 1901 there was little indigenous consciousness of Malay as a national archipelago-wide means of communication. When the first signs of a concern for such a medium appeared, the choice initially fell on Dutch, as evidenced by such as the families of Kartini and Achmad Djajadiningrat, who wanted universal Dutch among the elite or at least Dutch-language education as a means for elevating the social welfare standards and education of their fellow-Javanese. Yet, the Indies Malay which up to the beginning of the twentieth century had principally served the colonial power's interest, within two decades was generating an organized self-awareness among the indigenous people of themselves as "Indonesians." The question of lingual acceptance needed an indigenous answer.