



## **JOINT WORKING GROUP ON LABOR IN COCOA FARMING**

**Utrecht, the Netherlands**

**May 21, 2010**

**Meeting Minutes**

### **Present**

**Ghana:** Honorable Minister E.T. Mensah, Vincent Frimpong Manu, Professor N.N. N. Nsowah-Nuamah, Eric Okrah, Gifty Nartey, Deputy Ambassador Mr. Odoi

**Côte d'Ivoire:** Djéhiffé Bi Bollou, Serge N'Cho, Dr. Joseph N'Guessan, Monnet Innocent Abi

**Industry:** Jeff Morgan, Jonathan Atwood

**Secretariat:** Mil Niepold

### **Official Opening of Meeting**

The group welcomed new members to the Ghanaian delegation now led by Minister of Employment and Social Welfare, E.T. Mensah. Minister Mensah updated the group that he would henceforth be leading their delegation.

Members of all delegations reaffirmed their commitment to the JWG, especially noting the unique opportunity it provides for exchanging best practices, strategies and lessons learned between the governments of Ghana and Côte d'Ivoire. The governments further noted that having a forum to leverage their mutual experience has been needed since the signing of the Harkin-Engel Protocol. They further reiterated the commitment from the highest levels of their governments to the JWG.

### **Future Activities**

The group discussed possibly expanding participation in future meetings to include experts from the European Union, the US Departments of Labor and State, etc. There was a consensus that communication about program developments, progress on the ground and new initiatives needed to be improved. It was felt that involving

additional stakeholders in future meetings would help with this process and improve programming more generally for all stakeholders.

### **Statement of Cooperation**

- ✓ The content from the original Statement of Cooperation remains unchanged though it was never executed. The Secretariat will work to revise the original document and add new signatories.
- ✓ Both governments indicated that they are ready to sign once these small corrections are made. It was agreed that Minister Mensah and Minister Emile Guerieoulou would be the likely signatories, but that this would be confirmed by both governments after cabinet discussions and approval (and communicated to the Secretariat) the week of June 7<sup>th</sup>.
- ✓ It was agreed that this document would be signed the week of June 15<sup>th</sup>.
- ✓ After considerable discussion, it was recommended that the names of all JWG members be listed within the body of the document, with only heads of delegations (or the relevant Minister) as signatories.

### **US Department of Labor Update**

#### **Côte d'Ivoire**

- ✓ CDI update the group on their recent meetings in Washington.
- ✓ The delegation also provided the following updates:
  - The government recently updated a law forbidding trafficking and WFCL which is now with government council, awaiting passage by the National Assembly, perhaps in July.
  - Minister Emile Guerieoulou, Minister of Labor will come to Washington to present this law, ideally by October.
  - This law was designed to implement their engagements under ILO Convention 182.
  - The ILO, UNICEF, IOM, NGOs, trade unions, etc. all provided input to this new legislation.

#### **Ghana**

- ✓ Noted that while they passed anti-trafficking law in December, 2005, their efforts and resources must focus on the enforcement of this law and rehabilitation of any children intercepted. Their responses, in all cases, must include all sectors, not just cocoa.

- ✓ Ghana informed members of its recent meetings with stakeholders such as USDOL, US State Department, WCF, etc. in Washington. Ghana noted that the key outcome of the meetings was the importance of increased communication and, to this end, the Ministry of Employment and Social Welfare (MESW) is creating a Public Affairs Unit and a new website (by October).

### **Summary of Overall USDOL notes**

- ✓ It was agreed that multiple bi-lateral meetings (between individual governments, industry and US Departments of State and Labor) were not the most productive way to achieve lasting change.
- ✓ The JWG members agreed that the time had come for a meeting between the JWG and State, US DOL and possibly the European Union.
- ✓ Such a meeting could be used to:
  - Assess progress of Harkin-Engel Protocol at the 10 year mark and refine strategic vision now for the next decade and beyond
  - Better understand the indicators used by the USDOL scoping teams, the governments, etc. and discuss a growing concern about the lack of understanding and commonality of indicators
  - Understand the timeframes various stakeholders use for impact measurement
  - Discuss the possibility of having both governments be measured using the same indicators
  - Better understand Tulane's criteria for impact measurement and more generally their current project to coordinate indicators
  - Better understand how is information gathered for the US State Department Office to Monitor and Combat Trafficking in Persons (GTIP)?
- ✓ It was agreed that the possibility of a joint letter inviting US DOL, State and the offices of Harkin and Engel should be considered by all delegations (the secretariat will follow up with each delegation for their suggestions and circulate a recommendation to the full group).
- ✓ It was further agreed that such a letter would need to come from the highest levels of government in Ghana and Côte d'Ivoire.
- ✓ It was agreed that the JWG should work on defining common indicators for impact measurement, but that this work should build off of the work being

done by Tulane. However, the JWG needs to better understand Tulane's process.

- ✓ All agreed that building impact measurement mechanisms into the community based monitoring systems from the outset is critically important. However, there was also a consensus that additional resources, expertise and capacity building needed to be identified. Further external evaluation will also be required.
- ✓ Community monitoring needs to increase the role of women who are often better suited to gather information regarding children.

### **Considerations for Future Programming**

- ✓ The group noted the importance of mainstreaming cocoa and that National Plans must cover all sectors, but the work of the JWG only covers cocoa.
- ✓ There was agreement that projects need to be focused at the community level. Projects on livelihoods are also especially important now.
- ✓ There was also an agreement that there is enough data. Focus is now on remediation, and impact evaluation is fundamental. All stakeholders need to know what is working and what is not working.
- ✓ Funding, whether from internal or external sources, should prioritize longer term funding as funding short term projects are challenging.
- ✓ There is an overall need to collaborate and coordinate with programs like STCP (farmer field schools), the Gates Foundation project, industry funded programs, government programs, etc.

### **Trafficking**

- ✓ There was a lengthy discussion about the JWG's next steps regarding trafficking centered on whether to focus on additional research (given that household surveys are not appropriate for trafficking) or to conduct a pilot project instead?
- ✓ If additional research is done, would it be quantitative (to reach a reliable estimate of the number of trafficked persons) or qualitative (to determine the root causes of trafficking)?

- ✓ If a pilot project is developed, possible areas of intervention could be the creation of shelters, strengthening enforcement mechanisms, ensuring that the community systems are designed to gather information on trafficking, etc. Such a pilot would have to target high risk areas.
- ✓ As a means to further progress on this, industry agreed to circulate their current list of possible projects that they have under consideration to the governments for their input (secretariat to manage this process and circulate results to JWG members).
- ✓ Both governments expressed an interest in working on such a pilot jointly.
- ✓ Ghana noted that they are currently developing standard operating procedures regarding the proper handling of suspected cases of trafficking. Côte d'Ivoire noted that they had already developed such procedures and that they would translate them and share them with the government of Ghana.

## **Communications**

- ✓ Côte d'Ivoire noted that they would hold a press conference in Geneva (with Malick Tohe and Minister Emile Guerieoulou) on June 10 to coincide with the labor conference. Ghana noted that they would consider joining them at this event.
- ✓ Côte d'Ivoire also added that there would be a series of round tables in Washington Brussels, Copenhagen and London (regarding their report that covers progress made from 2000 – 2009).
- ✓ Ghana noted that they would soon be creating a Public Affairs Unit within Ministry of Employment and Social Welfare (MESW) to ensure that regular information pertaining to their progress on eliminating WFCL was made available to the public.
- ✓ The need to refresh current government websites on child labor issue was discussed.
- ✓ The secretariat will gather the various media plans from all delegations and circulate them amongst JWG members (with the goal of helping improve coordination in public communications).

- ✓ The secretariat will link the Verité website (the JWG page) to both government websites (pertaining to WFCL).
- ✓ The secretariat, with input from the delegations, will draft talking points that summarize the sector-wide surveys. All delegations will work to increase dissemination of the weighted sector-wide survey results (that were recently verified).

### **Update on the Meta-Analysis and Data Collection**

- ✓ A consensus was reached that there had been sufficient data gathered to date and, as such, current resources needed to be dedicated towards strengthening community based monitoring and remediation programs.
- ✓ Abi and Professor Nsowah-Nuamah will send Verité a “catalog” listing all the surveys that the governments have done since 2001 (deadline June 30).
- ✓ The secretariat will circulate the catalog of surveys to the organizations who submitted proposals to conduct the meta-analysis. They will be asked to further refine, where possible, their budgets in light of this new information.
- ✓ Final decision on the meta-analysis is tabled until additional budget information is obtained.
- ✓ Additional work needs to be done to identify which indicators were used in the government surveys. The hope is that those conducting the meta-analysis could also help pull out indicators and strengthen future surveys.
- ✓ The JWG aligned with the view that emerged from the April Tulane University meeting that the interval between sector-wide surveys should be approximately five years (with both governments reserving the right to set the exact timing to ensure sufficient time for remediation programs to take effect between surveys).
- ✓ It was agreed that time should be allotted at the next JWG meeting to focus on refinements to the “certification” system (the four part system as originally developed after the signing of the Harkin-Engel Protocol).
- ✓ In the future, it was agreed that data collection will put more emphasis focus on the CLMS.

- ✓ In order to ensure that the community based monitoring systems that are now launching are as robust as possible, and especially to address the important issue of impact measurement from the outset, it was agreed that the JWG would leverage its joint platform to seek help from an outside institution to develop a common:
  - compendium of best practices for both Ghana and Cote d'Ivoire in eliminating WFCL and FAL
  - set of impact indicators (for the community based systems)
  - approach to community based monitoring
  - approach to coordinating remediation
  - strategy for the "Partners Forums" (for stakeholder outreach and coordination)
  
- ✓ The secretariat will gather work done to date on this topic and circulate to the governments by June 15<sup>th</sup> for their input.

### **Next Meeting**

It was agreed that next meeting would be **October 8-9, 2010**, in Accra, Ghana.

Several key topics at next JWG meeting include:

- Discussion on strengthening CLMS
- JWG Secretariat after December 31, 2010 – agreed that Africa based organization would assume Secretariat after a period of transition.
- Further refining Communications of activities to date and commentary on agreed next steps in the sector.