

Yearbook of the  
Westfield Center for  
Historical Keyboard Studies

# Keyboard *Perspectives*

VOL. IV/2011

EDITED BY

*Annette Richards*

Editor-in-chief: Annette Richards

Associate Editor: Evan Cortens

Editorial Assistants: Mathieu Langlois, Caroline Waight

© 2012 The Westfield Center

All rights reserved

Manufactured in the U.S.A.

ISSN: 1943-0809

*Keyboard Perspectives* is the Yearbook of the Westfield Center for Historical Keyboard Studies. Information on the Westfield Center can be found at [www.westfield.org](http://www.westfield.org)

*Membership of the Westfield Center includes a subscription to Keyboard Perspectives.*

Text and cover design: Kristen Bernard/Visual Communications,  
[www.vizcom.com](http://www.vizcom.com)

Cover photo: Tom Wolff. Double-manual German harpsichord after Vater (1738) by Thomas and Barbara Wolf, Washington, 1986 (soundboard painting by Sheridan Germann).

# Keyboard Perspectives IV

## *The Yearbook of the Westfield Center for Historical Keyboard Studies*

### 2011

---

#### TABLE OF CONTENTS

Contributors . . . . .	v
CD Contents . . . . .	vii
Editor's Preface. . . . .	viii
<i>Clementi the Heresiarch and a "Black Joke"</i> . . . . .	1
<i>of English Domestic Keyboard Culture</i>	
ERIN HELYARD	
<i>From Spain to the New World: the Hiring of the</i> . . . . .	27
<i>Madrid Organist Fabián Pérez Ximeno by Mexico City Cathedral</i>	
EDWARD CHARLES PEPE	
<i>Dudley Buck and the Evolution of American Pedal Technique</i> . . . . .	49
CHRISTOPHER MARKS	
 <b>KEYBOARD CULTURE IN EIGHTEENTH-CENTURY BERLIN</b>	
<i>Mozart's Gothic: Feelings for History in the Rondo in A minor, K. 511</i> . . . . .	69
MATTHEW HEAD	
<i>Seventeenth-Century Organ Music in Eighteenth-Century Berlin:</i> . . . . .	115
<i>Early Music in the Time of Frederick the Great</i>	
KERALA J. SNYDER	
<i>Marpurg's Dream and the Meaning of Melody</i> . . . . .	139
MARTIN KÜSTER	
<i>An Enigmatic Legacy: Organ Music and the Berlin Bach Traditions</i> . . . . .	153
DAVID SCHULENBERG	
<i>Charlottenburg Schnitger, 1706—1931—2011</i> . . . . .	175
ANNETTE RICHARDS	

*continued...*

**PROFILE**

*Fortepianist Malcolm Bilson* . . . . .197  
NICHOLAS MATHEW

**REVIEWS**

*To Fix or Not to Fix* . . . . .207  
Review of *Artifacts in Use: The Paradox of Restoration  
and the Conservation of Organs*, by John Watson  
TILMAN SKOWRONECK

*Renewed Refreshments: Bach's Clavierübung in the  
Latest Authoritative Edition* . . . . .213  
Review of *J. S. Bach: Clavierübung III*, edited by George B. Stauffer  
DAVID YEARSLEY

Guidelines for Contributors . . . . .219

The Westfield Center . . . . .220

# Contributors

---

## **MATTHEW HEAD**

Matthew studies the music of the German-speaking eighteenth-century. His work to date focuses on marginal and problematic repertoires, or repertoires that can appear as such: the fantastic style in C. P. E. Bach; exoticism and orientalism in Mozart and Haydn; female composers and the discourse of femininity. He is currently exploring expressive practices in keyboard culture, with a particular focus on terror, melancholy, love, desire, and humor in Haydn, Mozart, and C. P. E. Bach. He is the author of two books, *Orientalism, Masquerade and Mozart's Turkish Music* (RMA/Ashgate, 2000), and *Sovereign Feminine: Music and Gender in Eighteenth-Century Germany* (University of California Press, forthcoming).

## **ERIN HELYARD**

Praised as a virtuosic and eloquent soloist as well as an inspired and versatile conductor, Erin Helyard is at the forefront of a new generation of young musicians who combine the latest musicological and historical enquiry with a passion for promoting live music in contemporary culture. Erin studied harpsichord at the Sydney Conservatorium of Music, fortepiano at the Schulich School of Music, McGill University and in 2011 obtained a PhD in musicology from the same institution. He is co-artistic director of Pinchgut Opera, Sydney, and is Lecturer in Period Performance at the New Zealand School of Music, Wellington.

## **MARTIN KÜSTER**

Martin Küster has recently completed his doctoral dissertation (“Thinking in Song: Prosody, Text-Setting and Music Theory in Eighteenth-Century Germany”) at Cornell University, and now holds a position as organist and music director in south-west Berlin. His interests include the intersections of music theory and music history, eighteenth-century song, historically informed performance, and analysis.

### **CHRISTOPHER MARKS**

Christopher Marks is Associate Professor of organ at the University of Nebraska-Lincoln. From 1999 to 2006, he taught organ and served as University Organist at Syracuse University. Marks has been hailed for his “style and assurance” in performance. His interest and skill with historic American instruments has led to four appearances at conventions of the Organ Historical Society. His latest recording is *Organ Works of Seth Bingham, Vol. 2: “Memories of France.”* The critically acclaimed first volume in this series was the first recording to be devoted solely to the organ music of Bingham, who was a prominent New York composer and organist.

### **NICHOLAS MATHEW**

Nicholas Mathew is Assistant Professor of Musicology at the University of California, Berkeley. His research focuses primarily on the music of the Enlightenment and Romantic periods, especially that of Haydn and Beethoven. To date, Mathew’s published work examines the relationship between music and politics, the place of music in the public sphere, as well as issues of kitsch and musical taste. His book *Political Beethoven* (Cambridge University Press, forthcoming) discusses the political rhetoric, cultural contexts, and later reception of Beethoven’s music. Mathew is currently co-editor with Dean Sutcliff of the *Journal of Eighteenth-Century Music* and co-editor with Benjamin Walton of *The Invention of Beethoven and Rossini* (Cambridge University Press, forthcoming).

### **EDWARD PEPE**

An organist and independent scholar now living in Oaxaca, Mexico, Edward C. Pepe has focused his recent research on viceregal Mexican organs. His work has appeared in *Revista de Musicología*, *The Organ Yearbook*, *Heterofonía* and *Inter American Music Review*, as well as in Festschriften for Harald Vogel and Peter Williams. Presently he also performs the hispanic repertoire and has just recorded works of Antonio de Cabezón on the sixteenth-century organ in Oosthuizen, The Netherlands. Pepe co-founded both the Westfield Center and the Instituto de Órganos Históricos de Oaxaca.

### **ANNETTE RICHARDS**

Annette Richards is professor of music at Cornell, where she is the university organist, and Executive Director of the Westfield Center. Her scholarly work focuses on eighteenth-century music aesthetics and reception, and on C. P. E.

Bach. She is currently working on a book on C. P. E. Bach, portraiture and the idea of music history in the late eighteenth century, while continuing to indulge her interest in ghosts and the uncanny in a project on the musical Gothic entitled *Music on the Dark Side of 1800*. This year she will also record the complete organ music of C. P. E. Bach.

#### **DAVID SCHULENBERG**

David Schulenberg is author of *The Keyboard Music of J. S. Bach* and *The Music of Wilhelm Friedemann Bach*, as well as the textbook and anthology *Music of the Baroque*. He has also edited keyboard sonatas and concertos by C. P. E. Bach and is a contributor to the new Breitkopf und Härtel edition of the organ works of J. S. Bach. A performer on harpsichord and fortepiano, he has recorded chamber music by Quantz and King Frederick II of Prussia with baroque flutist Mary Oleskiewicz on the Naxos and Hungaroton labels. Chair of the music department at Wagner College in New York City, he also teaches in the Historical Performance program at The Juilliard School.

#### **TILMAN SKOWRONECK**

Bremen-born Tilman Skowroneck studied harpsichord with Bob van Asperen, Anneke Uittenbosch, Ton Koopman, and Gustav Leonhardt, and fortepiano and performance practices with Malcolm Bilson (Cornell University). He is active both as a performer and scholar: he has played and recorded extensively with the Swedish baroque ensemble Corona Artis, and is the author of *Beethoven the Pianist* (Cambridge University Press, 2010). Between 2009 and 2011 he held a postdoctoral fellowship from the Swedish Research Council at the University of Southampton for research on Viennese fortepianos. Tilman teaches at the University of Gothenburg.

#### **KERALA SNYDER**

Kerala J. Snyder is Professor Emerita of Musicology at the Eastman School of Music. She is the author of *Dieterich Buxtehude: Organist in Lübeck* and the editor of *The Organ as a Mirror of its Time*. She recently received an honorary doctorate from Göteborg University.

#### **DAVID YEARSLEY**

David Yearsley's *Bach's Feet* has recently appeared from Cambridge University Press; his recording of the Bach trio sonatas on Cornell's new Arp Schnitger-inspired organ is soon to follow.

# CD Contents

---

**Track 1** Anon., “The Original Coal-black Joke,” Verses 1, 2, 8, and 9. Brit. Mus., G. 316. e. fol. 99.

Morgan Pearse, baritone.

**Track 2** Muzio Clementi (1752–1832), *The Black Joke, with 21 Variations, for the Piano Forte, or Harpsichord* (London: Welcker, 1777).

Erin Helyard, fortepiano (Derek Adlam, 1991, after Anton Walter, c. 1795, courtesy of the New Zealand School of Music).

**Track 3** Antonio de Cabezón (1510–1566), *Quaeramus [cum pastoribus]*. From *Obras de música para tecla, harpa y vihuela* (Madrid, 1578).

1. [Primera parte]
2. Segunda parte
3. Tercera parte

Edward Pepe, organ. Recorded at the Grote Kerk in Oosthuizen, The Netherlands, September 11, 2011. Organ maker and date unknown, but from the fifteenth or sixteenth century. Erik Sikkema, recording engineer.

**Track 4** Dudley Buck (1839–1909), Variations on a Scotch Air, op. 51

Christopher Marks, organ. Recorded at United Presbyterian Church, Schaghticoke, NY, June 30, 2006, at the Organ Historical Society National Convention. Giles Beach organ from 1865, 2 man. & ped.

**Track 5** King Frederick II “The Great” of Prussia (1712–1786), Sonata No. 146 in C major for flute and basso continuo (Spitta no. 40). I. Grave e sostenuto

**Track 6** Frederick “The Great,” Sonata No. 146, II. Allegro

Tracks 5 and 6: Mary Oleskiewicz, transverse flute after J. J. Quantz. Balázs Máté, violoncello after Stradivarius. David Schulenberg, fortepiano after Gottfried Silbermann. Recorded in the historic Music Room of Sanssouci Palace in Potsdam (Germany). From *Seven Flute Sonatas by King Frederick “The Great” of Prussia*, Hungaroton Classic, HCD 32698, (p) 2011. Reproduced with permission of Hungaroton Records Ltd. <<http://www.hungaroton.hu/>>. This recording project was supported by the Stiftung für Preußische Gärten und Schlösser Potsdam, the Alexander von Humboldt-Stiftung, and the University of Massachusetts Boston.

**Track 7** Wolfgang Amadeus Mozart (1756–1791), Sonata in D major, K. 576, III. Allegretto.

Malcolm Bilson, fortepiano. Fortepiano, built in 1979 after Louis Dulcken, 1790. *Complete Mozart Sonatas*, vol. 2. Hungaroton Classic, HCD 31012, (c) 1990.



**Track 8** Franz Schubert (1797–1828), Sonata in F-sharp minor, D. 571, I. Allegro moderato (completion from 6’57” by Malcolm Bilson).

Malcolm Bilson, fortepiano. Six-octave fortepiano, built in 1998 by Thomas and Barbara Wolf after a Viennese instrument by Nannette Streicher, 1814. Hungaroton Classic, HCD 31591, (c) 2000.

**Track 9** Johann Gottlieb Graun (1703–1771), Organ Concerto in G minor, I. Allegro.

**Track 10** Johann Ludwig Krebs (1713–1780), Fantasy in C major for flute and organ.

**Track 11** Carl Heinrich Graun (1704–1759), “Geist der Wahrheit.”

**Track 12** Johann Sebastian Bach (1685–1750), *A Musical Offering*, BWV 1079, Fuga canonica.

**Track 13** Zachary Wadsworth (b. 1983), *Recitative and Aria, for the dedication of an organ* (2011).

Tracks 9–13: David Yearsley, organ. Kristen Dubenion-Smith, mezzo-soprano (11, 13). Steven Zohn, baroque flute (10–13). Organ by Munetaka Yokota and the Gothenburg Organ Art Center, completed in 2011, inspired by the Arp Schnitger organ in the Charlottenburg Schlosskapelle (1706). From *Keyboard Culture in Eighteenth-Century Berlin and the German Sense of History* (March 10–13, 2011 at Cornell University, Ithaca, NY). Live performance recorded on March 11, 2011 by Roger Sherman.



# Preface

---

**T**HIS VOLUME OF *KEYBOARD PERSPECTIVES* begins in subversive mode, with the infiltration of scurrilous street humor into the late eighteenth-century bourgeois salon. Erin Helyard’s study of Muzio Clementi’s early set of variations on “The Black Joke” asks to what extent the song tune would have connoted the lewd lyrics to which it was originally set (and worse, the unmentionable “Black Joke” itself), and what this might imply for Clementi’s predominantly female, and highly respectable, clientele. Bawdy, as he shows, goes hand in hand with increasingly demanding keyboard technique that might appear to put the lie to the notion of submissive—and innocent—girls idly or avidly fingering the ivories.

From eighteenth-century London we move to seventeenth-century Mexico, and learn not only about organ culture at the Mexico City Cathedral, but also how the archival documents associated with the apparently mundane business of hiring a new organist reveal fascinating insights into the dynamic and complex exchange between New and Old Spain. Edward Pepe’s essay demonstrates how rigorous archival research can yield far-ranging conclusions.

A third focused study rounds out the first section of this volume and moves in yet another direction, geographically and methodologically. Christopher Marks compares the two editions, from two separate stages in his career, of *Studies in Pedal Phrasing* by the nineteenth-century American organist Dudley Buck. The significant differences between them provide vital information on changes in Buck’s own pedal technique but also, perhaps more importantly, in those of his students and colleagues, at a time when American organs were themselves undergoing a transformation. Marks’ essay encourages us to think carefully about performance practice and technique, or perhaps about multiple practices and techniques relevant even to a single geographical location and point in time. The essay suggests that we should appreciate both specificity and diversity in performing styles as we approach instruments of different vintages.

In March 2011, the Westfield Center collaborated with the Institute for German Cultural Studies at Cornell to sponsor a conference entitled “Keyboard Culture in Eighteenth-Century Berlin and the German Sense of History,” held to inaugurate Cornell’s new early eighteenth-century German-style organ

recently completed by Munetaka Yokota and colleagues at the Gothenburg Organ Art Center. The instrument was a collaborative effort bringing together American organ builders and craftsmen with the international team based in Sweden; the conference to celebrate its completion likewise gathered a wide spectrum of scholars and performers from the United States and Europe who had been asked to consider not only the organ but also other keyboard instruments, their associated repertoires and practices, and the wider musical culture. Five of those presentations form the basis for the essays printed here.

Approaching Berlin from the capital city that has dominated music history's late-eighteenth and early nineteenth centuries, Vienna, Matthew Head follows Mozart's path from Austria to Germany. His essay puzzles over the "Gothic gloomth" of Mozart's Rondo K. 511, exploring ways in which the work embodies an aesthetic journey to the north in its encounter with the Bach tradition and learned counterpoint, just as it prefigures Mozart's own journey to northern Germany in 1789. Evocative of the Gothic in its effects of dissociation and irregularity, Mozart's Rondo, Head argues, stages a "feeling" encounter with the past that points to a new kind of engagement with history in musical culture late in the eighteenth century.

Kerala Snyder's essay, too, offers evidence for a particular sense of history as it developed in mid-eighteenth-century Berlin—not least in the study of learned counterpoint—and emerges from the wealth of manuscripts of organ music copied in Berlin in the period. The essay focuses on organists and copyists in the circle of Frederick the Great's younger sister, Princess Anna Amalia, whose enthusiasm for organ-playing leads one to wonder whether she herself had to stretch the rules of decorum (though not as far as those later eighteenth-century English ladies and their "Black Joke") as she threw back her royal skirts and clambered onto the organ bench. A crucial resource for later historians, Amalia's large library, Snyder suggests, has a strongly retrospective taint that maps closely onto the list of composers said to have been studied and admired by J. S. Bach.

With Martin Küster we approach keyboard culture from the perspective—central to keyboard practice—of accompaniment, and its attendant theoretical apparatus. Küster offers an account of a debate conducted in the pages of the Berlin music journals of the mid-eighteenth century, in which the competing claims of harmony and melody, of artifice and naturalness, reveal much about the intersection of taste and ideology amongst the court musicians associated with Frederick the Great, and about practices of accompaniment. Küster leads

the reader into a particularly fraught corner of eighteenth-century music theory, as he untangles a knot of ideas and terms whose implications go far beyond the Berlin song repertoire that is the focus of his essay.

It is no coincidence that many of the Berlin keyboard musicians of the mid-eighteenth century whose names appear in these essays are part of the extended Bach circle. In placing the organ, its music and its reception in the wider context of Berlin musical culture, David Schulenberg's essay shows that the resonance of J. S. Bach in Berlin stems not only from Bach's performances in that city in 1747, but also from the group of devotees and publicists active there in the circle of C. P. E. Bach (who was resident there from 1740–67) and W. F. Bach (resident from 1774 until his death), and from their successors into the nineteenth century and beyond, to our own time.

The historical reach of many of the essays presented at the conference suggests why so many organists become musicologists: to sit down at any organ is to confront history. The new organ at Cornell, which was celebrated at the March conference, vividly exemplifies the complex intersection of present and past at the nexus of performance, repertoire, and not least, the question of reconstruction. My own contribution to this volume sketches the history of the instrument that inspired Cornell's—the Schnitger organ in the Charlottenburg Palace chapel in Berlin—and shows how any engagement with that instrument necessarily confronts the competing demands of historicism and progress, as well as the attendant ideological and political implications of those positions. The fabled Charlottenburg instrument long inspired not only amazement, but also a sense among even its most ardent supporters of the risks of turning blindly to the past for inspiration.

All who play old keyboard instruments, or modern instruments based loosely or strictly on them, are motivated at least in part by the desire to hear old music anew, and perhaps to reclaim something that has been lost in the course of the intervening years, decades or centuries. None have been more spirited in the study of and performance on the fortepiano than my inspiring colleague, Malcolm Bilson. In an effort to encourage a new generation of players, many with little access to top quality instruments—or indeed any at all—Bilson spearheaded the Westfield Center's first international Fortepiano Competition and Summer Academy, held in August 2011 at Cornell University. The event brought jurors and competitors from around the world for two weeks of music-making and collegial exchange at the highest level. Fittingly, then, Bilson is the subject of this year's profile, written by his former student, Nicholas Mathew.

Two essays reviewing recent important publications round out this volume; the multi-faceted scholar, performer, and son of one of the great instrument makers of our time, Tilman Skowroneck grapples with the problems and promise of the preservation of antique musical objects; David Yearsley continues his in-house service to these pages, with praise for George Stauffer's new edition of J. S. Bach's *Clavierübung III*.

As always we include a CD with performances by many of our authors. Erin Helyard recorded Clementi's "Black Joke" specially for this issue, and provides a wonderful recording by his colleague Morgan Pearse of the song on which the set of variations is based. Both Edward Pepe and Christopher Marks perform music related to their essays on historic organs; David Schulenberg does the same with music by Frederick 'the Great' recorded, with baroque flautist Mary Oleskiewicz, in the historic music room of Sanssouci Palace. Malcolm Bilson is represented not only in Nicholas Mathew's prose portrait, but also in his own performances of Mozart and Schubert. Finally, the CD concludes with music recorded live at the inauguration of the new Cornell organ: the organ is presented here by David Yearsley as a chamber instrument, in dialogue with baroque flute (Steven Zohn) and mezzo-soprano Kristen Dubenion-Smith, and in repertoire that reflects its position as an instrument that looks to the past, with music from eighteenth-century Berlin, and to the present (and future), with a new work, commissioned for the occasion, from Zachary Wadsworth.

*Keyboard Perspectives* is the result of collaboration, cooperation and the exchange of ideas that the Westfield Center warmly supports and promotes. Thanks are due to Cornell University for providing Westfield with an institutional home. At Cornell, an excellent team of graduate students makes a crucial contribution to this journal; editorial assistance this year has been provided by Mathieu Langlois and Caroline Waight, and, taking the lion's share in production matters, Evan Cortens. Any errors remaining are, of course, my own.

—Annette Richards  
Ithaca, NY